

2019 G20 Osaka Summit Final Compliance Report

Prepared by

Sofia Lopez and the G20 Research Group

University of Toronto

Toronto

and

Irina Popova and the Center for International Institutions Research

Russian Presidential Academy of National Economy and Public Administration,

Moscow

From 30 June 2019 to 10 October 2020

19 November 2020

“The University of Toronto ... produced a detailed analysis to the extent of which each G20 country has met its commitments since the last summit ... I think this is important; we come to these summits, we make these commitments, we say we are going to do these things and it is important that there is an organisation that checks up on who has done what.”

— *David Cameron, Prime Minister, United Kingdom, at the 2012 Los Cabos Summit*

Contents

Preface	3
Research Teams	4
Introduction and Summary	5
Commitment Breakdown	5
Selection of Commitments	5
Final Compliance Scores	6
Final Compliance by Member	6
Final Compliance by Commitment	6
Table 1: 2019 G20 Osaka Summit Commitments Selected for Compliance Monitoring	7
Table 2: 2019 G20 Osaka Summit Final Compliance Scores	9
Table 3: 2019 G20 Osaka Summit Final Compliance by Member	10
Table 4: 2019 G20 Osaka Summit Final Compliance by Commitment	10
Table 5: G20 Compliance by Member, 2008–2019	11
Conclusions	12
Future Research and Reports	12
Considerations and Limitations	12
Appendix: General Considerations	13
1. Macroeconomics: Inclusive Growth	14
2. Macroeconomics: Exchange Rates	122
3. Trade: Open Markets	131
4. Trade: Reform of the World Trade Organization	152
5. Infrastructure: Quality Infrastructure Investment	207
6. Digital Economy: Frameworks	327
7. International Taxation: Digitalization	348
8. Crime and Corruption: Cyber Resilience	364
9. Terrorism: Internet Security	389
10. Labour and Employment: Opportunities for Youth	428
11. Gender: Education and Training	452
12. Gender: Labour Market	493
13. Development: Energy	538
14. Development: Investment in Human Capital	559
15. Health: Ageing Populations	643
16. Health: Public Health Preparedness	717
17. Environment: Marine Plastic Litter and Microplastics	752
18. Climate Change: Financing for Sustainable Development	781
19. Climate Change: Innovation	803

6. Digital Economy: Frameworks

“We will cooperate to encourage the interoperability of different frameworks [for data free flow with trust]”

G20 Leaders’ Osaka Declaration

Assessment

	No Compliance	Partial Compliance	Full Compliance
Argentina		0	
Australia			+1
Brazil			+1
Canada			+1
China		0	
France			+1
Germany			+1
India			+1
Indonesia			+1
Italy			+1
Japan			+1
Korea			+1
Mexico			+1
Russia		0	
Saudi Arabia		0	
South Africa		0	
Turkey		0	
United Kingdom			+1
United States			+1
European Union			+1
Average		+0.70 (85%)	

Background

Digitalization is a relatively new addition to the G20 agenda. G20’s initiatives address the most general issues of digital growth. In 2015, G20 members approved national adjusted growth strategies; several of them, including Germany’s, indicated “investing in research ... and expanding the ‘High Tech Strategy’” as a key long-term task.²³⁸¹ Approving adjusted growth strategies focused on the wide use of digital technologies in various spheres was the first step towards more specific initiatives and commitments. At Antalya, G20 leaders committed to “bridge the digital divide” and also noted that “states have a special responsibility to promote security, stability, and economic ties with other nations” in information communications and technology (ICT).²³⁸²

At Hangzhou in 2016, in the G20 Blueprint on Innovative Growth, for the first time G20 leaders addressed the issue of proliferation of the digital economy, which they defined the digital economy as “a broad range of economic activities that includes using digitized information and knowledge as the key factor of production, modern information networks as the important activity space, and the

²³⁸¹ Adjusted Growth Strategy: Germany. URL: <https://www.ranepa.ru/images/media/g20/2015Antalya/Adjusted-Growth-Strategy-2015-Germany.pdf> (accessed: 22 December 2019)

²³⁸² G20 Leaders’ Communique Antalya Summit. Access date: 22 December 2019. <https://www.ranepa.ru/images/media/g20/2015Antalya/000111117.pdf>

effective use of Information and Communication Technology (ICT) as an important driver for efficiency-enhancing and economic structural optimization.”²³⁸³ The leaders pledged to “offer policy support for an open, and secure ICT environment, including recognizing the key role of adequate and effective protection and enforcement of intellectual property rights to the development of the digital economy” by means of “cultivating transparent digital economy policy-making” and “supporting the development and use of international standards.”²³⁸⁴ To facilitate “the G20 agenda on innovation, new industrial revolution and digital economy,” G20 leaders decided to establish a designated task force supported by the Organisation for Economic Co-operation and Development (OECD).²³⁸⁵

At Hamburg in 2017, the G20 addressed the issue of digital skills promotion. The #eSkills4Girls Initiative touched on the issue within broader context of development and gender policy.²³⁸⁶ To facilitate implementing commitments on digital growth, the Digital Economy Task Force (DETF) was established following the decision made in Hangzhou in 2016.²³⁸⁷ The leaders concluded with commitments aimed at harnessing digitalization and digital growth such as a pledge to promote digital literacy and digital skills, ensure effective competition to foster investment and innovation, promote effective cooperation of all stakeholders and encourage the development and use of market- and industry-led international standards for digitized production, products and services.²³⁸⁸

During Argentina’s G20 presidency in 2018, the DETF presented political tools for digital growth including the G20 Digital Governance Principles, recommendation for measuring the digital economy, gender equality in digital sphere and digital infrastructure development.²³⁸⁹ At Buenos Aires, the G20 leaders pledged to “promote measures to boost micro, small and medium enterprises and entrepreneurs, bridge the digital gender divide and further digital inclusion, support consumer protection, and improve digital government, digital infrastructure and measurement of the digital economy.”²³⁹⁰

Japan’s G20 presidency in 2019 greatly expanded the G20 digital agenda. In Osaka, the G20 leaders presented the Statement on Preventing Exploitation of the Internet for Terrorism and Violent Extremism Conducive to Terrorism (VECT), which tackled cyber security.²³⁹¹ In addition, the Osaka Declaration on Digital Economy was adopted in which most G20 members (with exception of India,

²³⁸³ G20 Blueprint on Innovative Growth. URL: <https://www.ranepa.ru/images/media/g20/2016Hangzhou/G20%20Blueprint%20on%20Innovative%20Growth.pdf> (accessed: 22 December 2019)

²³⁸⁴ G20 Blueprint on Innovative Growth. URL: <https://www.ranepa.ru/images/media/g20/2016Hangzhou/G20%20Blueprint%20on%20Innovative%20Growth.pdf> (accessed: 22 December 2019)

²³⁸⁵ G20 Leaders' Communique Hangzhou Summit September 5, 2016. URL: <https://www.ranepa.ru/images/media/g20/2016Hangzhou/G20%20Leaders%E2%80%99%20Communique%20Hangzhou%20Summit.pdf> (accessed: 22 December 2019)

²³⁸⁶ G20 Initiative “#eSkills4Girls”. URL: <https://www.ranepa.ru/images/media/g20/2017hamburg/2017-g20-initiative-eskills4girls-en.pdf> (accessed: 22 December 2019)

²³⁸⁷ G20 Leaders' Communique Hangzhou Summit September 5, 2016. URL: <https://www.ranepa.ru/images/media/g20/2016Hangzhou/G20%20Leaders%E2%80%99%20Communique%20Hangzhou%20Summit.pdf> (accessed: 22 December 2019)

²³⁸⁸ G20 Leaders' Hamburg Declaration. URL: https://www.ranepa.ru/images/media/g20/2017hamburg/G20%20Hamburg%20leaders_%20communiqu%C3%A9.pdf (accessed: 22 December 2019)

²³⁸⁹ G20 Digital Economy Ministerial Declaration. URL: <https://g20digitalrepo.org/G20%20DETF%20Ministerial%20Declaration%20Salta.pdf> (accessed: 22 December 2019)

²³⁹⁰ G20 Leaders' declaration. URL: https://www.ranepa.ru/images/media/g20/2018buenosaires/buenos_aires_leaders_declaration.pdf (accessed: 22 December 2019)

²³⁹¹ G20 Statement on Preventing Exploitation of the Internet for Terrorism and Violent Extremism Conducive to Terrorism (VECT). URL: https://www.ranepa.ru/images/News_ciir/Project/G20_new_downloadings/G20_OSAKA_LEADERS_STATEMENT_ON_PREVENTING_EXPLOITATION_OF_THE_INTERNET_FOR_TERRORISM.pdf (accessed: 22 December 2019)

South Africa and Indonesia) declared the launch of the “Osaka track” to promote discussions on “trade-related aspects of electronic commerce at the WTO.”²³⁹²

Commitment Features

The commitment requires the G20 members to facilitate interoperability — the degree to which two products, programs, etc., can be used together, or the quality of being able to be used together²³⁹³ — of different legal frameworks, both domestic and international, to harness the opportunities of the digital economy, facilitate data free flow and strengthen consumer and business trust.²³⁹⁴ The “framework” in this context refers to a general definition of the term implying “a system of rules, ideas, or beliefs that is used to plan or decide something”²³⁹⁵

Thus, to achieve full compliance, a G20 member should take actions to improve its own legal framework and contribute to the development of international legal frameworks that regulate digital economy-related issues. “National” refers to changes in a member’s legislation that are aimed at digital growth, data free flow facilitation or strengthened consumer and business trust. “International” refers to actions taken by a G20 member, or a group of countries including a G20 member, in the form of a proposed initiative to an international or regional organization to tackle issues relating to digital growth, data free flow and trust building, e.g., relevant organizations in the United Nations system, the OECD or the World Trade Organization.

This assessment covers G20 members’ actions taken between 30 June 2019 and 10 October 2020.

Scoring Guidelines

-1	G20 member does not improve the interoperability of different national or international digital frameworks
0	The G20 member takes actions to improve the interoperability of different digital frameworks, but these actions are either national OR international.
+1	G20 member improves the interoperability of different digital frameworks both nationally and internationally.

Centre for International Institutions Research

Argentina: 0

Argentina has partially complied with the commitment to improve interoperability of different national or international digital frameworks.

On 10 September 2019, the Ministry of Health and Social Development issued Resolution 2524/2019 which approved the Guide for the Unambiguous Identification of Persons in Health. The Secretary of Government also proposes to start, together with the jurisdictions, the path towards a health system that has technologies that facilitate the registration of the information in primary form, during the contact with the patient, in interoperable systems that allow information to be shared between levels of care and jurisdictions, building for each patient a national, longitudinal and complete medical history of clinical, statistical and management utility.²³⁹⁶

²³⁹² Osaka Declaration on Digital Economy. URL: https://www.ranepa.ru/images/News_ciir/Project/G20_new_downloadings/OSAKA_DECLARATION_ON_DIGITAL_ECONOMY_eng.pdf (accessed: 22 December 2019)

²³⁹³ Cambridge Dictionary. Accessed 13 April 2020. <https://dictionary.cambridge.org/dictionary/english/interoperability>

²³⁹⁴ G20 Osaka Leaders’ Declaration. URL: https://www.ranepa.ru/images/News_ciir/Project/G20_new_downloadings/FINAL_G20_Osaka_Leaders_Declaration.pdf (accessed: 22 December 2019)

²³⁹⁵ Cambridge dictionary. Accessed 13 April 2020. <https://dictionary.cambridge.org/dictionary/english/framework>

²³⁹⁶ Resolución 2524/2019, Legislative Information of Argentina (Buenos Aires) 10 September 2019. Access date: 20 May 2020. <http://servicios.infoleg.gob.ar/infolegInternet/anexos/325000-329999/329903/norma.htm>

On 27 April 2020, Red Hat, Inc., a provider of open source solutions, announced that the Argentine Ministry of Health implemented a National Digital Health Network to vastly improve accessibility of universal healthcare coverage services and initiatives using Red Hat open hybrid cloud technologies and facilitate interoperability.²³⁹⁷

On 18 August 2020, the meeting of the COFEFUP Administrative Modernization Commission was held via videoconference. The general objective of the 2020-2024 Work Plan of the CoFeFuP Administrative Modernization Commission is to propose actions to de-bureaucratize the State, simplifying and speeding up procedures to make the lives of citizens easier and more practical. To achieve this, its members defined addressing these 8 management axes, among which the second one is dedicated to the Interoperability and comprehensiveness of information systems.²³⁹⁸

On 24 September 2020, Administrative Modernization Commission and Technological Infrastructure and Cybersecurity Commission held a meeting to discuss definition of indicators for measuring the conditions of interoperability of data and systems in provincial public administrations, federal mapping of the institutional framework of cybersecurity in the provinces and hold a round of consultations, considerations and contributions from the provinces.²³⁹⁹

Argentina is taking steps to improve its national framework to harness the opportunities of the digital economy, but no evidence of Argentina contributing to development of international frameworks has been found.

Thus, it receives a score of 0.

Analyst: Irina Popova

Australia: +1

Australia has fully complied with the commitment to improve interoperability of different national or international digital frameworks.

On 31 October 2019, the Australian National Audit Office (ANAO) released an Auditor-General Report no. 11 detailing the extent to which Australian government entities have implemented the Digital Continuity 2020 policy adopted in October 2015. One of the policy's goals was to ensure interoperability of information, systems and processes within the government structure. The ANAO concludes, however, that "Australian Government is unlikely to achieve the objectives of the Digital Continuity policy by the end of 2020, and the National Archives of Australia (the Archives) has been largely ineffective in monitoring, assisting, and encouraging entities to meet the targets of the policy."²⁴⁰⁰

On 23 October 2019, Australia along with Chile, Colombia, Costa Rica, Georgia, Hong Kong (China), Iceland, Israel, Mexico, New Zealand, Norway, Panama, Paraguay, Singapore and

²³⁹⁷ Argentine Ministry of Health Enlists Red Hat to Help Establish a National Digital Health Network, Red Hat (Raleigh) 27 April 2020. Access date: 20 May 2020. <https://www.redhat.com/es/about/press-releases/argentine-ministry-health-enlists-red-hat-help-establish-national-digital-health-network>

²³⁹⁸ Nueva reunión de la Comisión de Modernización Administrativa del COFEFUP, Government of Argentina 19 August 2020. Access date: 1 October 2020. <https://www.argentina.gob.ar/noticias/nueva-reunion-de-la-comision-de-modernizacion-administrativa-del-cofefup>

²³⁹⁹ La Interoperabilidad de datos y sistemas y la ciberseguridad en la administración pública desde una perspectiva federal, Government of Argentina 24 September 2020. Access date: 1 October 2020. <https://www.argentina.gob.ar/noticias/la-interoperabilidad-de-datos-y-sistemas-y-la-ciberseguridad-en-la-administracion-publica>

²⁴⁰⁰ Implementation of the Digital Continuity 2020 Policy, Australian National Audit Office (Canberra) 31 October 2019, <https://www.anao.gov.au/work/performance-audit/implementation-digital-continuity-2020-policy>.

Switzerland issued a communication on the Work Programme on Electronic Commerce of the World Trade Organization (WTO), specifically on the subject of moratorium on customs duties on electronic transmissions. Australia and other co-signing WTO members called for an extension of the moratorium until the 12th Ministerial Conference, with a view to ensure “certainty and predictability for business and consumers.” The WTO Work Programme on Electronic Commerce has a goal of establishing an international set of norms and standards, regulating transboundary trade in electronic goods and services.²⁴⁰¹

On 29 November 2019, Australia issued a similar communication, this time in concert with Canada, Chile, Colombia, Costa Rica, Georgia, Guatemala, Hong Kong (China), Iceland, Israel, Korea, Mexico, New Zealand, Norway, Panama, Paraguay, Singapore, Switzerland, Thailand, and Uruguay.²⁴⁰²

On 29 June 2020, Australia issued the revised communication on Broadening and deepening the discussions on the moratorium on imposing customs duties on electronic transmissions within the WTO, along with Canada; Chile; Colombia; Hong Kong, China; Iceland; Korea; New Zealand; Norway; Singapore; Switzerland; Thailand and Uruguay.²⁴⁰³

Australia took actions to improve interoperability of different frameworks at both national and international levels.

Thus, it is awarded a score of +1.

Analyst: Andrei Sakbarov

Brazil: +1

Brazil has fully complied with the commitment to improve interoperability of different national or international digital frameworks.

On 9 October 2019, decree No. 10,046 was issued. It provides for governance in data sharing within the scope of the federal public administration and institutes the Citizen Base Register and the Central Data Governance Committee. The main goals of the decree are to simplify the provision of public services; guide and optimize the formulation, implementation, evaluation and monitoring of public policies; make it possible to analyze the conditions for accessing and maintaining social and tax benefits; promote the improvement of the quality and reliability of data held by the federal public administration; and increase the quality and efficiency of the internal operations of the federal public administration.²⁴⁰⁴

On 28 November 2019, the Brazilian government published Interoperability Standards for digital government. The architecture of Interoperability Standards (ePING) defines a minimum set of assumptions, policies and technical specifications that regulate the use of Information and

²⁴⁰¹ Work Programme and Moratorium on Electronic Commerce, WTO (Geneve) 23 October 2019. Access Date: 18 May 2020. <https://docs.wto.org/dol2fe/Pages/SS/directdoc.aspx?filename=q:/WT/GC/W782R1.pdf>.

²⁴⁰² Work Programme and Moratorium on Electronic Commerce, WTO (Geneve) 29 November 2019. Access Date: 18 May 2020. <https://docs.wto.org/dol2fe/Pages/SS/directdoc.aspx?filename=q:/WT/GC/W782R2.pdf>.

²⁴⁰³ Broadening and deepening the discussions on the moratorium on imposing customs duties on electronic transmissions (revision), WTO (Geneva) 29 June 2020. Access date: 27 September 2020.

<https://docs.wto.org/dol2fe/Pages/SS/directdoc.aspx?filename=q:/WT/GC/W799R1.pdf&Open=True>.

²⁴⁰⁴ Decree No. 10,046, of October 9, 2019, Presidency of the Republic Sub-General Secretariat for Legal Affairs (Brasilia) 9 October 2019. Access date: 19 May 2020. http://www.planalto.gov.br/ccivil_03/_Ato2019-2022/2019/Decreto/D10046.htm

Communication Technology in the Federal Government, establishing the conditions for interaction with other Powers and spheres of government and with the society in general.²⁴⁰⁵

On 14 May 2020, the U.S. National Institute of Standards & Technology (NIST) and the Brazilian National Institute of Metrology, Quality and Technology (INMETRO) (counterpart agencies responsible for measurement science and standards in the U.S. and Brazil, respectively) acknowledged the fundamental importance of international cooperation in measurements and standardization, and have identified five areas for potential cooperation: bioscience and health; cybersecurity and privacy, quantum electrical standards; Internet of Things (IoT); and emerging technologies such as artificial intelligence (AI). NIST and INMETRO future collaboration opportunities include personnel exchanges, career development sponsorships, and sharing NIST experience with the recently released privacy framework, and best practices in smart cities, AI, IoT interoperability and cybersecurity.²⁴⁰⁶

Brazil took actions to improve interoperability of different frameworks at both national and international levels.

Thus, it receives a score of +1.

Analyst: Irina Popova

Canada: +1

Canada has fully complied with the commitment to improve interoperability of different national or international digital frameworks.

On 7 August 2019, the Government of Canada released the National Cyber Security Action Plan and re-launched the Cyber Security Cooperation Program. The latter is designed to support projects aimed at improving Canada's cyber systems to increase innovation and cooperation including through establishing international partnerships.²⁴⁰⁷

On 4 September 2019, Canada issued a communication to the World Trade Organization (WTO) within the electronic commerce track on Preventing the Use of Personal Information from being used for the Discrimination or Persecution of Natural Persons. In the communication Canada stated, that it continued to adapt and modernize its approach to digital trade policy and expressed its interest in strengthening provisions related to the protection of personal information under the WTO Joint Statement Initiative on E-commerce. Canada proposed to include the following passage into the potential international arrangement on the issue: "No Party/Member shall use the personal information of users of digital trade to persecute or discriminate against a natural person on the basis

²⁴⁰⁵ Interoperability Standards, Government of Brazil (Brasilia) 28 November 2019. Access date: 19 May 2020. <https://www.gov.br/governodigital/pt-br/governanca-de-dados/padroes-de-interoperabilidade>

²⁴⁰⁶ Joint Statement of the 18th Edition of the U.S.-Brazil Commercial Dialogue May 14, 2020, U.S. Embassy in Brazil 12 May 2020. Access date: 2 October 2020. <https://br.usembassy.gov/joint-statement-of-the-18th-edition-of-the-u-s-brazil-commercial-dialogue-may-14-2020/>

²⁴⁰⁷ The Government of Canada advances cyber security innovation and cooperation, Government of Canada (Ottawa) 7 August 2019. Access Date: 18 May 2020. <https://www.canada.ca/en/public-safety-canada/news/2019/08/the-government-of-canada-advances-cyber-security-innovation-and-cooperation.html>.

of race, colour, sex, sexual orientation, gender, language, religion, political or other opinion, national or social origin, property, birth or other status, or disability.”²⁴⁰⁸

On 9 October 2019, Canada and New Zealand issued a joint communication to the WTO on the Transparency in WTO negotiations and application to the Joint Statement Initiative (JSI) e-commerce negotiations. The communication called for increased transparency of the JSI negotiation process, including the publishing of records of meetings and other documentation.²⁴⁰⁹

On 29 November 2019, Canada issued a communication, in concert with Australia, Chile, Colombia, Costa Rica, Georgia, Guatemala, Hong Kong (China), Iceland, Israel, Korea, Mexico, New Zealand, Norway, Panama, Paraguay, Singapore, Switzerland, Thailand, and Uruguay. In this communication on the WTO Work Programme on Electronic Commerce, Canada and other co-signing WTO members called for an extension of the moratorium until the 12th Ministerial Conference, with a view to ensure “certainty and predictability for business and consumers.” The WTO Work Programme on Electronic Commerce has a goal of establishing an international set of norms and standards, regulating transboundary trade in electronic goods and services.²⁴¹⁰

On 21 January 2020, Bank of Canada, the Bank of England, the Bank of Japan, the European Central Bank, the Sveriges Riksbank and the Swiss National Bank, together with the Bank for International Settlements (BIS), have created a group to share experiences as they assess the potential cases for central bank digital currency in their home jurisdictions. The group will assess those cases; economic, functional and technical design choices, including cross-border interoperability; and the sharing of knowledge on emerging technologies. It will closely coordinate with the relevant institutions and forums — in particular, the Financial Stability Board and the Committee on Payments and Market Infrastructures.²⁴¹¹

On 10 February 2020, Canada, New Zealand and Ukraine issued a joint communication to the WTO on the Transparency in WTO negotiations and application to the JSI e-commerce negotiations. The communication called for increased transparency of the JSI negotiation process, including the publishing of records of meetings and other documentation.²⁴¹²

On 29 June 2020, Canada issued the revised communication on Broadening and deepening the discussions on the moratorium on imposing customs duties on electronic transmissions within the WTO, along with Australia; Chile; Colombia; Hong Kong, China; Iceland; Korea; New Zealand; Norway; Singapore; Switzerland; Thailand and Uruguay.²⁴¹³

²⁴⁰⁸ Joint Statement on Electronic Commerce Communication from Canada Concept Paper — Preventing the Use of Personal Information from being used for the Discrimination or Persecution of Natural Persons, WTO (Geneva) 10 September 2019. Access Date: 18 May 2020.

<https://docs.wto.org/dol2fe/Pages/SS/directdoc.aspx?filename=q:/INF/ECOM/39.pdf>.

²⁴⁰⁹ Joint Statement on Electronic Commerce — Communication from New Zealand and Canada — Non paper — Transparency in WTO negotiations and application to the JSI, WTO (Geneva) 9 October 2019. Access Date: 18 May 2020. <https://docs.wto.org/dol2fe/Pages/SS/directdoc.aspx?filename=q:/INF/ECOM/42R1.pdf>.

²⁴¹⁰ Work Programme and Moratorium on Electronic Commerce, WTO (Geneva) 29 November 2019. Access Date: 18 May 2020. <https://docs.wto.org/dol2fe/Pages/SS/directdoc.aspx?filename=q:/WT/GC/W782R2.pdf>.

²⁴¹¹ Central bank group to assess potential cases for central bank digital currencies, Bank Of Japan (Tokyo) 21 January 2020. Access date: 20 May 2020. https://www.boj.or.jp/en/announcements/release_2020/rel200121a.htm/

²⁴¹² Joint Statement on Electronic Commerce — Communication from New Zealand, Canada and Ukraine — Non paper — Transparency in WTO negotiations and application to the JSI, WTO (Geneva) 10 February 2020. Access Date: 18 May 2020. <https://docs.wto.org/dol2fe/Pages/SS/directdoc.aspx?filename=q:/INF/ECOM/42R2.pdf>.

²⁴¹³ Broadening and deepening the discussions on the moratorium on imposing customs duties on electronic transmissions (revision), WTO (Geneva) 29 June 2020. Access date: 27 September 2020. <https://docs.wto.org/dol2fe/Pages/SS/directdoc.aspx?filename=q:/WT/GC/W799R1.pdf&Open=True>.

Canada took actions to improve interoperability of different frameworks at both national and international levels.

Thus, it is awarded a score of +1.

Analyst: Andrei Sakbarov

China: 0

China has partially complied with the commitment on improvement of interoperability of different national or international frameworks.

On 26 October 2019, China approved the first national law on encryption. The regulation came into force on the 1 January 2020. It broadens the current regulatory scope of encryption, liberalizes commercial encryption at national-law level and proposes a market-oriented regulatory regime for the commercial encryption industry.²⁴¹⁴

On 6 November 2019, China launched six new pilot zones for innovation and development of the digital economy. These zones are said to serve as the mechanism to optimize the allocation of data and to keep up government regulation with new issues emerging from the fast growth in the digital economy.²⁴¹⁵

On 3 July 2020, the National People's Congress of China has issued a draft Data Security Law. The main goal of a new law is to prevent cyber attacks and data leaks by upholding strict technical requirements and exert control over Internet content and cyber infrastructure.²⁴¹⁶

China is taking steps to improve its national framework to harness the opportunities of the digital economy, but no evidence of China contributing to development of international frameworks has been found.

Thus, China receives a score of 0.

Analyst: Alexander Ignatov

France: +1

France has fully complied with the commitment on improvement of interoperability of different national or international frameworks.

On 30 March 2020, the French Tax Authority issued draft guidance on the scope and computation of the new digital services tax (DST) and the related compliance issues. Services subject to the tax include targeted online advertising, including the sale of user data; and online 'digital intermediation' services such as platforms and marketplaces. Each category has its own set of rules in terms of territoriality and computation of the ratio of French-deemed services (the French presence ratio).²⁴¹⁷

²⁴¹⁴ China Cybersecurity and Data Protection: China publishes first law on encryption, Lexology (London) 12 November 2019. Access date: 24 March 2020. <https://www.lexology.com/library/detail.aspx?g=53282dfc-c7f6-4cef-8de6-8f180fed8b31>

²⁴¹⁵ China to push public data sharing in digital economy pilot zones, Xinhua (Beijing) 06 November 2019. Access date: 24 March 2020. http://www.xinhuanet.com/english/2019-11/06/c_138533926.htm

²⁴¹⁶ China Releases Draft Data Security Law, Lexology 8 September 2020. Access date: 28 September 2020. <https://www.lexology.com/library/detail.aspx?g=9edf023e-a252-4517-ab3a-32762db6b918>

²⁴¹⁷ France issues comprehensive draft guidance on digital services tax, the Society of Trust and Estate Practitioners (London) 16 April 2020. Access date: 15 May 2020. <https://www.step.org/news/france-issues-comprehensive-draft-guidance-digital-services-tax>

On 26 December 2019, the French Financial Markets Authority published new regulations concerning the licensing of digital assets providers. Licensed providers are required to have professional indemnity insurance or a minimum amount of reserve funds, at least one effective senior manager, resilient information technology systems, an internal control system, a claims handling procedure, an organization enabling it to avoid conflicts of interests and procedures to prevent money laundering and terrorist financing.²⁴¹⁸

On 22 August 2019, France and India presented a Roadmap on Cybersecurity and Digital Technology. India and France affirmed their willingness to reinforce cooperation, notably through the sharing of information between their cybersecurity agencies, in order to prevent malicious activities, undertake immediate corrective response, mitigate their potential impact and identify their causes. Recognizing the need to strengthen the security of digital processes, products and services, France and India intend to share information on the legal and regulatory framework and best practices, including on the protection of economic information infrastructure impacting national security, and on testing and certification of digital products. In this context, France and India intend to work together on the risks associated with the deployment of 5G technologies and the technical solutions adopted to deal with them.²⁴¹⁹

On 19 February 2020, the European Commission presented the European data strategy. The strategy provides for measure to ensure free flow of data within the European Union and free and safe flow of data with third countries, subject to exceptions and restrictions for public security, public order and other legitimate public policy objectives of the European Union, in line with international obligations.²⁴²⁰

On 16 June 2020, the EU members agreed on an interoperability solution for mobile tracing and warning apps to address the COVID-19 pandemic. This technical solution allows national apps to work seamlessly when users travel to another EU country.²⁴²¹

France is taking steps to improve both national and international frameworks to harness the opportunities of the digital economy.

Thus, France receives a score of +1.

Analyst: Alexander Ignatov

Germany: +1

Germany has fully complied with the commitment on digitalization.

On 6 November 2019, German federal ministry for economic affairs and energy and the ministry of economy, trade and industry of Japan issued a joint statement on economic policy and cooperation. Both sides committed to accelerating discussions on a digital economy, including international rule-making on trade-related aspects of electronic commerce at the World Trade Organization, under the

²⁴¹⁸ Crypto Firms Can Now Apply for a License in France, Yahoo Finance 26 December 2019. Access date: 03 April 2020. <https://finance.yahoo.com/news/crypto-firms-now-apply-license-170000940.html>

²⁴¹⁹ Indo-French Roadmap on Cybersecurity and Digital Technology. Government of India Ministry of Foreign Affairs (New Delhi) 22 August 2019. Access date: 03 April 2020. <https://mea.gov.in/bilateral-documents.htm?dtl/31757/IndoFrench+Roadmap+on+Cybersecurity+and+Digital+Technology+August+22+2019>

²⁴²⁰ A European strategy for data, European Commission 19 February 2020. Access Date: 28 September 2020. https://ec.europa.eu/info/sites/info/files/communication-european-strategy-data-19feb2020_en.pdf.

²⁴²¹ Coronavirus: Member States agree on an interoperability solution for mobile tracing and warning apps, European Commission 16 June 2020. Access Date: 28 September 2020. https://ec.europa.eu/commission/presscorner/detail/en/ip_20_1043.

Osaka Track launched at the margin of the G20 Osaka Summit. They mentioned that this work would be guided in particular by the concept of data free flow with trust, and thus both sides would work together to enhance trust concerning data security, while respecting each other's respective regulatory framework.²⁴²²

On 19 February 2020, the European Commission presented the European data strategy. The strategy provides for measure to ensure free flow of data within the European Union and free and safe flow of data with third countries, subject to exceptions and restrictions for public security, public order and other legitimate public policy objectives of the European Union, in line with international obligations.²⁴²³

On 16 June 2020, the EU members agreed on an interoperability solution for mobile tracing and warning apps to address the COVID-19 pandemic. This technical solution allows national apps to work seamlessly when users travel to another EU country.²⁴²⁴

Germany has taken actions to improve interoperability of different frameworks at both national and international levels.

Thus, it receives a score of +1.

Analyst: Andrey Sbelepor

India: +1

India has fully complied with the commitment improvement of interoperability of different national or international frameworks.

On 2 August 2019, the Department of Consumer Affairs, Ministry of Consumer Affairs, Food and Public Distribution issued the e-commerce guidelines for consumer protection, 2019 in order to safeguard the interest of the consumers. The guidelines are only applicable to business-to-customer (B2C) e-commerce entities. The guidelines are also applicable to all B2C e-commerce entities involved in digital content products.²⁴²⁵

On 22 August 2019, France and India presented a Roadmap on Cybersecurity and Digital Technology. India and France affirmed their willingness to reinforce cooperation, notably through the sharing of information between their cybersecurity agencies, in order to prevent malicious activities, undertake immediate corrective response, mitigate their potential impact and identify their causes. Recognizing the need to strengthen the security of digital processes, products and services, France and India intend to share information on the legal and regulatory framework and best practices, including on the protection of economic information infrastructure impacting national

²⁴²² Joint Statement of the Federal Ministry for Economic Affairs and Energy of the Federal Republic of Germany and the Ministry of Economy, Trade and Industry of Japan on economic policy and cooperation, German federal ministry for economic affairs and energy 6 November 2019. Access Date: 3 April 2020.

<https://www.bmwi.de/Redaktion/EN/Downloads/joint-statement-on-economic-policy-and-cooperation.pdf>.

²⁴²³ A European strategy for data, European Commission 19 February 2020. Access Date: 3 April 2020.

https://ec.europa.eu/info/sites/info/files/communication-european-strategy-data-19feb2020_en.pdf.

²⁴²⁴ Coronavirus: Member States agree on an interoperability solution for mobile tracing and warning apps, European Commission 16 June 2020. Access Date: 28 September 2020.

https://ec.europa.eu/commission/presscorner/detail/en/ip_20_1043.

²⁴²⁵ Advisory to State Governments / Union Territories: Model Framework for Guidelines on e-Commerce for consumer protection, Government of India Ministry of Consumer Affairs, Food & Public Distribution (Department of Consumer Affairs) (Delhi) 2 August 2019. Access date: 19 May 2020. <https://consumeraffairs.nic.in/sites/default/files/file-uploads/latestnews/Guidelines%20on%20e-Commerce.pdf>

security, and on testing and certification of digital products. In this context, France and India intend to work together on the risks associated with the deployment of 5G technologies and the technical solutions adopted to deal with them.²⁴²⁶

On 4 December 2019, the cabinet of Prime Minister Narendra Modi approved a data protection bill for tabling in parliament, taking the country a step closer to framing a privacy law. The bill mandates that personal data categorized as sensitive will be stored or processed only in India, the source said, declining to be named as details about the bill in its current form are not public. It also says that data deemed sensitive will have to be stored in India but can be processed outside of the country.²⁴²⁷

India is taking steps to improve both national and international frameworks to harness the opportunities of the digital economy.

Thus, it receives a score of +1.

Analyst: Irina Popova

Indonesia: +1

Indonesia has fully complied with the commitment improvement of interoperability of different national or international frameworks.

On 17 August 2019, Bank of Indonesia launched a quick response (QR) code standard for payments through server-based e-money applications, electronic wallets and mobile banking known as QR Code Indonesian Standard (QRIS). National QRIS implementation will be effective from 1st January 2020 in order to provide an adequate transition period for payment system service providers to prepare for the new standard. QRIS launching is part of the roll-out of the Indonesian Payment System Vision for 2025, announced in May 2019. QRIS was compiled by Bank Indonesia along with the Indonesia Payment System Association, using EMV Co. 1 international standards to support broader payment system instrument interconnectedness and accommodate the specific needs of Indonesia, thus providing interoperability between providers, instruments and other countries.²⁴²⁸

On 28 November 2019, Bank Indonesia issued a blueprint titled Bank Indonesia: Menavigasi Sistem Pembayaran Nasional di Era Digital (Bank Indonesia: Navigating the National Payment System in the Digital Era) as a follow-up to Indonesia's 2025 Payment System Visions that were introduced in May this year. Through the 2025 visions, Bank Indonesia intends to: support the integration of national digital economy and finance, support banking digitalization, guarantee the interlink between fintech and banking, ensure there is a balance between innovation, consumer protection and healthy business competition, safeguard national interests in cross-border digital economy and finance. It is planned that Bank Indonesia, together with industry, will develop an integrated payment interface to ensure interoperability from the transaction's starting point.²⁴²⁹

²⁴²⁶ Indo-French Roadmap on Cybersecurity and Digital Technology. Government of India Ministry of Foreign Affairs (New Delhi) 22 August 2019. Access date: 03 April 2020. <https://mea.gov.in/bilateral-documents.htm?dtl/31757/IndoFrench+Roadmap+on+Cybersecurity+and+Digital+Technology+August+22+2019>

²⁴²⁷ India's cabinet clears data protection bill for tabling in parliament, CNBC 4 December 2019. Access date: 19 May 2020. <https://www.cnbc.com/2019/12/04/reuters-america-update-1-indias-cabinet-clears-data-protection-bill-for-tabling-in-parliament.html>

²⁴²⁸ QRIS, One QR Code for all Payments, Bank of Indonesia (Jakarta) 17 August 2019. Access date: 20 May 2020. https://www.bi.go.id/en/ruang-media/siaran-pers/Pages/SP_216219.aspx

²⁴²⁹ Indonesia Payment Systems Blueprint 2025 Bank Indonesia: Navigating the National Payment Systems in the Digital Era, Bank Indonesia (Jakarta) 28 November 2019. Access date: 20 May 2020. <https://www.bi.go.id/en/publikasi/sistem-pembayaran/riset/Documents/Indonesia-Payment-Systems-Blueprint-2025.pdf>

On 1 February 2020, Bank Indonesia made a deal with Bangko Sentral ng Pilipinas to boost their ties in improving payment systems and digital financial innovation. The deal complements the previous central banks' cooperation related to anti-money laundering and preventing terrorism financing in the field of payment systems. In a joint statement, the central banks said their Memorandum of Understanding looks to “provide a framework of closer cooperation between the two central banks” in order to attain a “more secure, efficient and reliable payment system, and to promote digital financial innovation.”²⁴³⁰

Indonesia taking steps to improve both national and international framework to harness the opportunities of the digital economy.

Thus, it receives a score of +1.

Analyst: Irina Popova

Italy: +1

Italy has fully complied with the commitment to improve interoperability of different national or international digital frameworks.

In 2019-2021, Italy will be implementing Three-Year Plan for Information Technology in public administration. The new plan foresees actions to accelerate the transition to digital administrations and local entities and to empower citizens and businesses in being active protagonists of innovation. The Three-Year Plan 2019-2021 outlines the actions needed to promote the digital transformation of the public sector, moving in the same direction defined by the 2017- 2019 Plan. In particular, the new plan defines the fundamental architectural principles, the interoperability rules of national infrastructures, and the cooperation model between different ecosystems and platforms.²⁴³¹

On 23 January 2020, the law introducing necessary changes to the national legislation was approved. Among the adopted acts is Directive (EU) 2019/520 of the European Parliament and of the Council of 19 March 2019 on the interoperability of electronic road toll systems and aimed at facilitating the cross-border exchange of information on non-payment of road tolls in the Union.²⁴³²

In July 2020, the Guideline on the Interoperability Model for the PA (hereinafter Guideline) was adopted as a part of Three-year plan for IT in the Public Administration 2020–2022, It identifies the standards and their methods of use for the implementation of APIs, favoring: increased interoperability between PAs and between them and citizens / businesses; the quality and safety of the solutions implemented; the de-duplication and co-creation of APIs.²⁴³³

Italy is taking steps to improve both national and international framework to harness the opportunities of the digital economy.

²⁴³⁰ Indonesia, Philippines Central Bank Inks Deal on Payment Systems, TheInsiderStories (Jakarta) 1 February 2020. Access date: 20 May 2020. <https://theinsiderstories.com/indonesia-philippines-central-bank-inks-deal-on-payment-systems/>

²⁴³¹ 2019 - 2021 Three-Year Plan for IT in the Public Administration, Agency for Digital Italy 2019. Access date: 13 October 2020. https://www.agid.gov.it/sites/default/files/repository_files/three_year_plan_for_it_in_public_administration_2019-2021.pdf

²⁴³² Legge di delegazione europea 2019, Italian Department for European Policies 23 January 2020. Access date: 2 October 2020. <http://www.politicheeuropee.gov.it/it/normativa/legge-di-delegazione-europea/legge-delegazione-ue-2019/>

²⁴³³ Piano Triennale per l'informatica nella Pubblica Amministrazione 2020 – 2022, Docs Italia July 2020. Access date: 2 October 2020. <https://docs.italia.it/italia/piano-triennale-ict/pianotriennale-ict-doc/it/2020-2022/index.html>

Thus, it receives a score of +1.

Analyst: Andrei Sakharov

Japan: +1

Japan has fully complied with the commitment on digitalization.

On 10-11 October 2019, Ministry of Economy, Trade and Industry (METI), the Ministry of Internal Affairs and Communications, the National Center of Incident readiness and Strategy for Cybersecurity, the Personal Information Protection Commission, the Ministry of Foreign Affairs) and other organizations jointly participated in a U.S.-Japan Policy Cooperation Dialogue on the Internet Economy (the tenth director general-level meeting) which was held in Tokyo. The dialogue included discussions with private sector representatives from both countries on “promotion of open, interoperable, reliable, and secure fifth generation mobile technologies (5G) networks and services”; “public-private cooperation on the deployment in third countries of digital infrastructure and services”; “international coordination on areas such as sharing of best practices of Internet of Things (IoT) security and promotion of free flows of data”; and “public-private partnership regarding the social implementation of artificial intelligence (AI) in a manner that fosters public trust in AI.”²⁴³⁴

On 6 November 2019, the German federal ministry for economic affairs and energy and METI issued a joint statement on economic policy and cooperation. Both sides committed to accelerating discussions on a digital economy, including international rule-making on trade-related aspects of electronic commerce at the World Trade Organization, under the Osaka Track launched at the margin of the G20 Osaka Summit. They mentioned that this work would be guided in particular by the concept of data free flow with trust, and thus both sides would work together to enhance trust concerning data security, while respecting each other’s respective regulatory framework.²⁴³⁵

On 20 December 2019, METI announced that in response to Japan’s submission to the ISO/IEC Joint Technical Committee of a proposal for developing new international standards for enhancing data collaboration among IoT systems, the committee decided to advance deliberations on standardization of the proposed technology. These new standards are expected to: encourage different industrial fields to mutually utilize IoT equipment among their systems; help companies reduce costs for system development; and encourage companies to collaboratively develop IoT systems.²⁴³⁶

On 27 December 2019, METI revised the Cybersecurity Guidelines for Energy Resource Aggregation Business, a compilation of cybersecurity measures that companies participating in the energy resource aggregation business (ERAB) framework should take. The first key point of the revision is dedicated to securing interoperability of cyber physical systems. The ERAB system aims not only to protect information but also to secure resilience to encourage electricity systems to

²⁴³⁴ Tenth U.S.-Japan Policy Cooperation Dialogue on the Internet Economy Held, Ministry of Economy, Trade and Industry of Japan (Tokyo) 18 October 2019. Access date: 20 May 2020. https://www.meti.go.jp/english/press/2019/1018_005.html

²⁴³⁵ Joint Statement of the Federal Ministry for Economic Affairs and Energy of the Federal Republic of Germany and the Ministry of Economy, Trade and Industry of Japan on economic policy and cooperation, German federal ministry for economic affairs and energy 6 November 2019. Access Date: 3 April 2020. <https://www.bmwi.de/Redaktion/EN/Downloads/joint-statement-on-economic-policy-and-cooperation.pdf>.

²⁴³⁶ Development of New International Standards for Vitalizing IoT, Ministry of Economy, Trade and Industry of Japan (Tokyo) 20 December 2019. Access date: 20 May 2020. https://www.meti.go.jp/english/press/2019/1220_004.html

continue to work physically, and to this end, the revised guidelines additionally require ERAB companies to formulate security measures for entire supply chains.²⁴³⁷

On 21 January 2020, Bank of Canada, the Bank of England, the Bank of Japan, the European Central Bank, the Sveriges Riksbank and the Swiss National Bank, together with the Bank for International Settlements, have created a group to share experiences as they assess the potential cases for central bank digital currency in their home jurisdictions. The group will assess the cases; economic, functional and technical design choices, including cross-border interoperability; and the sharing of knowledge on emerging technologies. It will closely coordinate with the relevant institutions and forums — in particular, the Financial Stability Board and the Committee on Payments and Market Infrastructures.²⁴³⁸

Japan has taken actions to improve interoperability of different frameworks at both national and international levels.

Thus, it receives a score of +1.

Analyst: Irina Popova

Korea: +1

Korea has fully complied with the commitment improvement of interoperability of different national or international frameworks.

On 5 March 2020, the National Assembly passed a new legislation on cryptocurrency trading. The regulation authorizes Korea's financial regulators to effectively oversee the growing industry and develop rules around anti-money laundering among other processes.²⁴³⁹

On 18 May 2020, the Financial Services Commission of Korea unveiled the 5th Plan for Financial Hub Policy for 2020–2022. The specific strategies include pursuing regulatory reforms to promote private sector-driven innovation, building infrastructure to continue innovative growth in the financial industry and adopting a “selection and concentration” approach to build global capacity with a particular attention paid to the ASEAN markets. Among the main pillars of the policy, the key factors are the development of the digital financial technologies and promotion of anti-money laundering framework.²⁴⁴⁰

On 23 July 2020, the Government of Korea revealed a plan of massive financial support for emerging digital economy. The government allocates more than 23 trl KRW to promote job creation, improvement of data ecosystem, establishment of a public-private data control centre, etc.²⁴⁴¹

Korea is taking steps to improve both national and international framework to harness the opportunities of the digital economy.

²⁴³⁷ Cybersecurity Guidelines for Energy Resource Aggregation Business Revised, Ministry of Economy, Trade and Industry of Japan (Tokyo) 27 December 2019. Access date: 20 May 2020. https://www.meti.go.jp/english/press/2019/1227_005.html

²⁴³⁸ Central bank group to assess potential cases for central bank digital currencies, Bank Of Japan (Tokyo) 21 January 2020. Access date: 20 May 2020. https://www.boj.or.jp/en/announcements/release_2020/rel200121a.htm/

²⁴³⁹ "암호화폐 거래 제도화" 특금법 통과.. 향후 쟁점은 (Special Act on Institutionalization of Cryptocurrency trading Passed), DAUM (Seoul) 05 March 2020. Access date: 18 May 2020. <https://news.v.daum.net/v/20200305173114246>

²⁴⁴⁰ FSC Unveils 5th Plan for Financial Hub Policy, Financial Services Commission (Seoul) 18 May 2020. Access date: 18 May 2020. http://meng.fsc.go.kr/common/pdfjs/web/viewer.html?file=/upload/press1/20200518111610_58dffdf1.pdf

²⁴⁴¹ S. Korea highlights digital New Deal for post-COVID-19 period at G-20 meeting, Yonhap News 23 July 2020. Access date: 28 September 2020. <https://en.yna.co.kr/view/AEN20200723005000320>

Thus, it receives a score of +1.

Analyst: Alexander Ignatov

Mexico: +1

Mexico has fully complied with the commitment to improve interoperability of different national or international digital frameworks.

On 14 August 2019, the Official Office of the Ministry of Finance and Public Credit and the Tax Administration Service signed a collaboration agreement for the interoperability, exchange of information and automation of the Electronic System of Public Government Information on acquisitions, leases, public works and services related.²⁴⁴²

On 5 September 2019, the Executive Secretariat of the National Anticorruption System presented the beta version of the National Digital Platform (PDN), which contains data for Public Server Systems that intervene in contracting processes and the System of Public and Private Servants Sanctioned, provided by the Ministry of Public Function and the State of Mexico. The PDN is an interoperability tool that will work with the input of data from government agencies at the state and federal levels, as well as from autonomous agencies, to exchange strategic information to prevent and punish possible acts of corruption.²⁴⁴³

On 11 September 2019, the 16th meeting of the Latin American and Caribbean Council on Civil Registry, Identity and Vital Statistics took place. General Director of the Mexican National Registry of Population and Identity Jorge Wheatley Fernández rendered the report on progress on the management of regulations, data protection and diversity, including a project on preparing the legal document to the interoperability of the databases. These projects will help strengthen the mechanisms for exchanging information between member countries and obtaining best practices that contribute to guaranteeing the right to identity in the region.²⁴⁴⁴

On 18 September 2019, National Telecommunications and Antennas Laboratory of the National Polytechnic Institute collaborated with the Secretariat of Communications and Transportation in the implementation of the model and in the development of test protocols. The results of these tests demonstrated that interoperability between different technologies is currently possible only at the voice level.²⁴⁴⁵

On 29 November 2019, the Digital Agency for Public Innovation presented the Digital Citizenship Plan. It is a road map for digital transformation and innovation whose general objective is to strengthen the relationship between citizens and the city government. One key element is the Interoperability Track. It suggests standards for consultation of information and documents between

²⁴⁴² Comunicado No. 076 Firman convenio la Oficialía Mayor de la SHCP y el SAT, Mexican Government (Mexico City) 14 August 2019. Access date: 19 May 2020. <https://www.gob.mx/shcp/prensa/comunicado-no-076-firman-convenio-la-oficialia-mayor-de-la-shcp-y-el-sat?idiom=es-MX>

²⁴⁴³ Lanza Sesna Versión Beta De Plataforma Digital Nacional, Mexican Government (Mexico City) 5 September 2019. Access date: 19 May 2020. <https://www.gob.mx/sesna/prensa/lanza-sesna-version-beta-de-plataforma-digital-nacional>

²⁴⁴⁴ XVI Encuentro del Consejo Latinoamericano y del Caribe de Registro Civil, Identidad y Estadísticas Vitales, Mexican Government (Mexico City) 11 September 2019. Access date: 19 May 2020. <https://www.gob.mx/segob%7Crenapo/articulos/xvi-encuentro-del-consejo-latinoamericano-y-del-caribe-de-registro-civil-identidad-y-estadisticas-vitales>

²⁴⁴⁵ Condujo la SCT procesos y pruebas en apoyo a la modernización de redes de seguridad pública, Mexican Government (Mexico City) 18 September 2019. Access date: 19 May 2020. <https://www.gob.mx/sct/prensa/condujo-la-sct-procesos-y-pruebas-en-apoyo-a-la-modernizacion-de-redes-de-seguridad-publica>

public entities, which guarantee the security and confidentiality of the information and allow the interaction of the systems of the entities.²⁴⁴⁶

Mexico is taking steps to improve both national and international framework to harness the opportunities of the digital economy.

Thus, it receives a score of +1.

Analyst: Irina Popova

Russia: 0

Russia has partially complied with the commitment on digitalization.

On 3 April 2020, the Analytical Center for the Government of the Russian Federation published the second version of the Uniform Requirements for State Data Management. The requirements are the main element of the National Data Governance System, which is created in the framework of Russia's Digital Economy. One of the pillars of these requirements is interoperability of different data governance systems.²⁴⁴⁷

No actions on improving international digital frameworks interoperability have been registered during the monitoring period. However, Russia has taken such measures at the national level.²⁴⁴⁸

Thus, Russia receives a score of 0.

Analyst: Andrey Shelepov

Saudi Arabia: 0

Saudi Arabia has partially complied with the commitment on improvement of interoperability of different national or international frameworks.

On 26 July 2019, Saudi Arabia issued the e-commerce law to regulate and oversee the transactions conducted online. The primary objective is to regulate the practice of e-commerce by increasing transparency, ensuring consumer protection and enhancing trust in online transactions.²⁴⁴⁹

On 27 August 2019, the Council of Ministers of Saudi Arabia issued a five-year strategy for the information and communication technology sector. The strategy includes an ambitious action plan to attract leading international companies in the priority areas of emerging technologies, increase the share of local content in the information technology sector, improve the technical skills of the relevant local workforce, enhance technical and digital knowledge, drive technical innovation through the promotion of research and development in Saudi Arabia's startup ecosystem, enable the

²⁴⁴⁶ Presentación del Plan de Ciudadanía Digital, Digital Agency for Public Innovation (Mexico) 29 November 2019.

Access date: 19 May 2020. <https://adip.cdmx.gob.mx/comunicacion/nota/presentacion-del-plan-de-ciudadania-digital>

²⁴⁴⁷ National Data Governance System, Analytical Center for the Government of the Russian Federation 30 June 2020.

Access date: 28 September 2020. <https://ac.gov.ru/projects/project/nacionalnaa-sistema-upravlenia-dannymi-nsud-41>.

²⁴⁴⁸ Websites of Russian President, Russian Government, Russian Ministry of Digital Development were searched as well as open sources.

²⁴⁴⁹ Saudi Arabia: Saudi Arabia introduces New E-Commerce Law, Mondaq 24 September 2019. Access date: 30 March 2020. <https://www.mondaq.com/saudiarabia/Consumer-Protection/847524/Saudi-Arabia-introduces-New-E-Commerce-Law>

development of mega projects, as well as to support coordination and synergy between the relevant entities in information and communications technologies in the public and private sectors.²⁴⁵⁰

On 25 February 2020, the Saudi Arabian Monetary Authority released additional licensing guidelines and criteria for digital-only banks operating in Saudi Arabia. Guidelines for digital-only banks include that applicants for licenses must be set up as a locally incorporated joint-stock company and maintain a physical presence in Saudi Arabia.²⁴⁵¹

On 26 July 2019, Saudi Arabia issued the e-commerce law to regulate and oversee the transactions conducted online. The primary objective is to regulate the practice of e-commerce by increasing transparency, ensuring consumer protection and enhancing trust in online transactions.²⁴⁵²

Saudi Arabia is taking steps to improve its national framework to harness the opportunities of the digital economy, but no evidence of Saudi Arabia contributing to development of international frameworks has been found.

Thus, Saudi Arabia receives a score of 0.

Analyst: Alexander Ignatov

South Africa: 0

South Africa has partially complied with the commitment on improvement of interoperability of different national or international frameworks.

In 2019-2024 National Digital Health Strategy will be implemented in South Africa. One of the key goals of the programme is establishment of an integrated platform and architecture for health sector information system which will also ensure interoperability and linkage of existing patient-based information system.²⁴⁵³

South Africa is taking steps to improve its national framework to harness the opportunities of the digital economy, but no evidence of contributing to development of international frameworks has been found.²⁴⁵⁴

Thus, South Africa receives a score of 0.

Analyst: Alexander Ignatov

²⁴⁵⁰ Saudi Arabia's ICT Strategy Shapes The Future Of Innovation And Digital Economy, Says Minister Al-Swaha, Ministry of Communications and Information Technology 27 August 2019. Access date: 30 March 2020.

<https://www.mcit.gov.sa/en/media-center/news/175651>

²⁴⁵¹ Saudi central bank issues additional licensing guidelines for digital-only banks, Salaam Gateway 25 February 2020. Access date: 30 March 2020. <https://www.salaamgateway.com/story/saudi-central-bank-issues-additional-licensing-guidelines-for-digital-only-banks>

²⁴⁵² Saudi Arabia: Saudi Arabia introduces New E-Commerce Law, Mondaq 24 September 2019. Access date: 30 March 2020. <https://www.mondaq.com/saudi-arabia/Consumer-Protection/847524/Saudi-Arabia-introduces-New-E-Commerce-Law>

²⁴⁵³ National Digital Health Strategy for South Africa 2019 – 2024, Ministry of Health of South Africa 2019. Access date: 2 October 2020. <http://www.health.gov.za/index.php/2014-08-15-12-54-26?download=3651:national-digital-health-strategy-for-south-africa-2019-2024>.

²⁴⁵⁴ Websites of the South African government, including the Communications and Digital Technologies Department and the Department of Trade and Industry, as well as open sources were searched.

Turkey: 0

Turkey has partly complied with the commitment on improvement of interoperability of different national or international frameworks.

On 21 August 2020, the Central Bank of the Republic of Turkey (CBRT) has established Turkey's QR code standards as part of intentional efforts to support innovative methods of executing and handling payments. National rules and principles for the standardized "TR QR Code" aim to enhance the use of a common QR code in retail payments, initiate practical, easier, more efficient and safer payments, and thus help to reduce use of physical cash in the form of banknotes. Against this backdrop, a standard QR code structure and set of rules have been established to enable interoperability by using a common language among payment system operators within the payments infrastructure ecosystem, support all sorts of initiatives from innovators, and contribute to the widespread acceptance of QR codes in the form of digital payments.²⁴⁵⁵

Turkey is taking steps to improve its national framework to harness the opportunities of the digital economy, but no evidence of contributing to development of international frameworks has been found.²⁴⁵⁶

Thus, it receives a score of 0.

Analyst: Pavel Doronin

United Kingdom: +1

The United Kingdom has fully complied with the commitment on digitalization.

On 9 October 2019, UK International Trade Secretary Liz Truss in her address at the World Trade Organization (WTO) stated that one of the UK's priorities within the WTO agenda is "to reform digital trade rules so that they are fit for the 21st century, reducing restrictions to market access to support e-commerce and ensure the free flow of data across borders."²⁴⁵⁷

On 21 January 2020, the Bank of Canada, the Bank of England, the Bank of Japan, the European Central Bank, the Sveriges Riksbank and the Swiss National Bank, together with the Bank for International Settlements, have created a group to share experiences as they assess the potential cases for central bank digital currency in their home jurisdictions. The group will assess the cases; economic, functional and technical design choices, including cross-border interoperability; and the sharing of knowledge on emerging technologies. It will closely coordinate with the relevant institutions and forums — in particular, the Financial Stability Board and the Committee on Payments and Market Infrastructures.²⁴⁵⁸

On 3 February 2020, Prime Minister Boris Johnson declared that the UK will seek 'adequacy decisions' from the European Union under both the General Data Protection Regulation and the Law Enforcement Directive before the end of the transition period to maintain the continued free flow of personal data from the EU to the UK. This will allow the continued free flow of personal

²⁴⁵⁵ Press Release on Turkish QR Code Rules and Principles, Central Bank of Turkey 21 August 2020. Access date: 2 October 2020.

<https://www.tcmb.gov.tr/wps/wcm/connect/en/tcmb+en/main+menu/announcements/press+releases/2020/ano2020-52>

²⁴⁵⁶ Websites of Turkish government, ICT Authority, Invest in Turkey, Ministry of Industry and Technology were searched as well as open sources.

²⁴⁵⁷ International Trade Secretary WTO address, UK Government 9 October 2019. Access Date: 3 April 2020.

<https://www.gov.uk/government/speeches/international-trade-secretary-wto-address>.

²⁴⁵⁸ Central bank group to assess potential cases for central bank digital currencies, Bank Of Japan (Tokyo) 21 January 2020. Access date: 20 May 2020. https://www.boj.or.jp/en/announcements/release_2020/rel200121a.htm/

data from the countries in the European Economic Area to the UK, including for law enforcement purposes.²⁴⁵⁹ On 13 March 2020, the Department for Digital, Culture, Media and Sport published a pack of explanatory material providing an overview of the UK's legal framework underpinning data protection standards in order to assist the European Commission in conducting its assessment.²⁴⁶⁰

On 9 September 2020, the UK Government published the National Data Strategy. According to this document, the UK will take measures to improve interoperability domestically and cooperate with nations to develop shared standards that align with the UK's national interests and objectives.²⁴⁶¹

The UK has taken actions to improve interoperability of different frameworks at both national and international levels.

Thus, it receives a score of +1.

Analyst: Andrey Shelepon

United States: +1

The United States has fully complied with the commitment to improve interoperability of different national or international digital frameworks.

On 10-11 October 2019, US representatives from the Department of State, the Department of Commerce, the Federal Communications Commission and from the American Chamber of Commerce in Japan participated in the US-Japan Policy Co-operation Dialogue on the Internet Economy in Japan. The dialogue included discussions with private sector representatives from both countries on “promotion of open, interoperable, reliable, and secure fifth generation mobile technologies (5G) networks and services”; “public-private cooperation on the deployment in third countries of digital infrastructure and services”; “international coordination on areas such as sharing of best practices of Internet of Things (IoT) security and promotion of free flows of data”; and “public-private partnership regarding the social implementation of artificial intelligence (AI) in a manner that fosters public trust in AI.”²⁴⁶²

On 14 May 2020, the U.S. National Institute of Standards & Technology (NIST) and the Brazilian National Institute of Metrology, Quality and Technology (INMETRO) (counterpart agencies responsible for measurement science and standards in the U.S. and Brazil, respectively) acknowledged the fundamental importance of international cooperation in measurements and standardization, and have identified five areas for potential cooperation: bioscience and health; cybersecurity and privacy, quantum electrical standards; IoT; and emerging technologies such as AI. NIST and INMETRO future collaboration opportunities include personnel exchanges, career

²⁴⁵⁹ The Future Relationship with the EU. The UK's Approach to Negotiations, UK Government 3 February 2020. Access Date: 3 April 2020. https://assets.publishing.service.gov.uk/government/uploads/system/uploads/attachment_data/file/868874/The_Future_Relationship_with_the_EU.pdf.

²⁴⁶⁰ Explanatory framework for adequacy discussions, UK Government 13 March 2020. Access Date: 3 April 2020. <https://www.gov.uk/government/publications/explanatory-framework-for-adequacy-discussions>.

²⁴⁶¹ National Data Strategy, UK Government 13 March 2020. Access Date: 28 September 2020.

<https://www.gov.uk/government/publications/uk-national-data-strategy/national-data-strategy>.

²⁴⁶² Tenth U.S.-Japan Policy Cooperation Dialogue on the Internet Economy Held, Ministry of Economy, Trade and Industry of Japan (Tokyo) 18 October 2019. Access date: 20 May 2020. https://www.meti.go.jp/english/press/2019/1018_005.html

development sponsorships, and sharing NIST experience with the recently released privacy framework, and best practices in smart cities, AI, IoT interoperability and cybersecurity.²⁴⁶³

On 15 May 2020, the Federal Data Strategy 2020 Action Plan was adjusted to include COVID-19 response data. The Action Plan 2020 “identifies initial actions for agencies that are essential for establishing processes, building capacity, and aligning existing efforts to better leverage data as a strategic asset.” One of the Federal Data Strategy goals is to establish interoperability, and skills consistency across the United States government agencies.²⁴⁶⁴

The US has taken actions to improve interoperability of different frameworks at both national and international levels.

Thus, it receives a score of +1.

Analyst: Andrei Sakharov

European Union: +1

The European Union has fully complied with the commitment on interoperability of different national or international digital frameworks.

On 25 July 2019, the European Commission launched a consultation on the future of investment in Europe’s digital economy. The Commission is currently planning the Digital Europe programme, which would bring direct investment worth a total of EUR9.2 billion (subject to the agreement of the Council and the European Parliament) for the deployment of innovative digital technologies in five key areas: supercomputing, artificial intelligence (AI), cybersecurity, advanced digital skills, and ensuring a wide use of these digital technologies across the economy and society in line with Europe’s ambitious sustainability goals and values. Implementation of the programme will facilitate deploying open, interoperable, trustworthy urban digital platforms tailored to communities’ needs, offering easy standardised access to new datasets, and the large scale roll-out of AI-driven services in smart energy, smart mobility, waste and secondary resource management, industry and (re)manufacturing, healthcare and e-government.²⁴⁶⁵

On 27 November 2019, directive on better enforcement and modernisation of Union consumer protection rules was introduced. New provisions in the regulation include a call for stronger co-ordinated mechanisms to investigate and tackle EU-wide widespread infringements. The new regulation will also improve the current framework by requesting consumer authorities in EU member states to have additional minimum powers to deal with infringements in the digital era (such as the possibility to close websites, carry out test purchases and mystery shopping).²⁴⁶⁶

²⁴⁶³ Joint Statement of the 18th Edition of the U.S.-Brazil Commercial Dialogue May 14, 2020, U.S. Embassy in Brazil 12 May 2020. Access date: 2 October 2020. <https://br.usembassy.gov/joint-statement-of-the-18th-edition-of-the-u-s-brazil-commercial-dialogue-may-14-2020/>

²⁴⁶⁴ Federal Data Strategy 2020 Action Plan, Federal Data Strategy (Washington) 14 May 2020. Access Date: 18 May 2020. <https://strategy.data.gov/assets/docs/2020-federal-data-strategy-action-plan.pdf>.

²⁴⁶⁵ Consultation on the future of investment in Europe’s digital economy, European Commission (Brussels) 25 July 2019. Access date: 19 May 2020. <https://ec.europa.eu/digital-single-market/en/news/consultation-future-investment-europes-digital-economy>

²⁴⁶⁶ Directive (EU) 2019/2161 of the European Parliament And Of The Council of 27 November 2019 amending Council Directive 93/13/EEC and Directives 98/6/EC, 2005/29/EC and 2011/83/EU of the European Parliament and of the Council as regards the better enforcement and modernisation of Union consumer protection rules, Official Journal of the European Union (Brussels) 18 December 2019. Access date: 19 May 2020. <https://eur-lex.europa.eu/legal-content/EN/TXT/PDF/?uri=CELEX:32019L2161&from=EN>

On 21 January 2020, the Bank of Canada, the Bank of England, the Bank of Japan, the European Central Bank, the Sveriges Riksbank and the Swiss National Bank, together with the Bank for International Settlements, have created a group to share experiences as they assess the potential cases for central bank digital currency in their home jurisdictions. The group will assess the cases; economic, functional and technical design choices, including cross-border interoperability; and the sharing of knowledge on emerging technologies. It will closely coordinate with the relevant institutions and forums — in particular, the Financial Stability Board and the Committee on Payments and Market Infrastructures.²⁴⁶⁷

On 19 February 2020, the European Commission unveiled its new digital package with ideas and actions for a digital transformation in Europe. This package includes the strategic document Shaping Europe's digital future, European strategy for data and White Paper on Artificial Intelligence. Interoperability is mentioned as one of the key aspects. A reinforced EU governments interoperability strategy scheduled for the end of 2021 will be a key action to ensure coordination and common standards for secure and borderless public sector data flows and services.²⁴⁶⁸

On 19 February 2020, the European Commission presented the European data strategy. The strategy provides for measure to ensure free flow of data within the EU and free and safe flow of data with third countries, subject to exceptions and restrictions for public security, public order and other legitimate public policy objectives of the European Union, in line with international obligations.²⁴⁶⁹

On 3 April 2020, the Commission and North Macedonia signed an agreement, granting the country access to the EU ISA² (Interoperability solutions for public administrations, businesses and citizens) Programme to develop and share solutions for digital public administrations. The ISA² Programme is a EUR131 million initiative of the Commission aimed at simplifying administrative procedures all along Europe as well as supporting the development of interoperable digital public services that benefit businesses and citizens.²⁴⁷⁰

The EU has taken actions to improve interoperability of different frameworks at both national and international levels.

Thus, it receives a score of +1.

Analyst: Irina Popovaana

²⁴⁶⁷ Central bank group to assess potential cases for central bank digital currencies, Bank Of Japan (Tokyo) 21 January 2020. Access date: 20 May 2020. https://www.boj.or.jp/en/announcements/release_2020/rel200121a.htm/

²⁴⁶⁸ Interoperability is at the heart of the new EU digital strategy, European Commission (Brussels) 24 February 2020. Access date: 19 May 2020. https://ec.europa.eu/isa2/news/interoperability-heart-new-eu-digital-strategy_en

²⁴⁶⁹ A European strategy for data, European Commission 19 February 2020. Access Date: 3 April 2020.

https://ec.europa.eu/info/sites/info/files/communication-european-strategy-data-19feb2020_en.pdf.

²⁴⁷⁰ North Macedonia joins the EU ISA² programme for digital public administrations and the EU Strategy for the Adriatic and Ionian Region, European Commission (Brussels) 3 April 2020. Access date: 19 May 2020.

https://ec.europa.eu/neighbourhood-enlargement/news_corner/news/north-macedonia-joins-eu-isa%C2%B2-programme-digital-public-administrations-and-eu_en