



UNIVERSITY OF
TORONTO

MUNK
SCHOOL
OF
GLOBAL
AFFAIRS

Join the Global Conversation

The
G20 Research Group
at Trinity College at the Munk School of Global Affairs
in the University of Toronto
presents the

2016 G20 Hangzhou Summit Interim Compliance Report

6 September 2016 to 17 February 2017

Prepared by
Sarah Scott, Alissa Xinhe Wang and the G20 Research Group, Toronto,
and Mark Rakhmangulov, Irina Popova, Andrey Shelepov, Andrei Sakharov and the
Center for International Institutions Research
of the Russian Presidential Academy of National Economy and Public Administration,
Moscow

8 April 2017

www.g20.utoronto.ca
g20@utoronto.ca

“The University of Toronto ... produced a detailed analysis to the extent of which each G20 country has met its commitments since the last summit ... I think this is important; we come to these summits, we make these commitments, we say we are going to do these things and it is important that there is an organisation that checks up on who has done what.”

— *David Cameron, Prime Minister, United Kingdom, at the 2012 Los Cabos Summit*

Contents

Preface.....	3
Research Team Based at the University of Toronto	4
Introduction and Summary	6
Methodology and Scoring System	6
Commitment Breakdown	6
Selection of Commitments.....	6
Final Compliance Scores	7
Final Compliance by Member.....	7
Final Compliance by Commitment.....	7
Table 1: 2016 G20 Hangzhou Summit Commitments Selected for Compliance Monitoring... 8	
Table 2: 2016 G20 Hangzhou Summit Final Compliance Scores	10
Table 3: 2015 G20 Hangzhou Summit Final Compliance by Member.....	11
Table 4: 2015 G20 Hangzhou Summit Final Compliance by Commitment.....	11
Table 5: G20 Compliance by Member, 2008-2016	12
Conclusions	13
Future Research and Reports.....	13
Considerations and Limitations.....	13
Appendix: General Considerations	14
1. Macroeconomics: Growth Policy Tools.....	15
2. Innovation.....	47
3. Development: Tax Administration	77
4. Corruption	103
5. Energy: Fossil Fuel Subsidies	145
6. Climate Change	159
7. Trade: Anti-protectionism	192
8. Trade: E-commerce	207
9. 2030 Agenda for Sustainable Development	228
10. Employment: Gender.....	248
11. Migration and Refugees.....	268
12. Financial Regulation: Terrorism	304
13. Technologies and Innovation: Knowledge Diffusion and Technology Transfer	337
14. Financial Regulation: Financial Sector Reform Agenda	360
15. Taxes: Base Erosion and Profit Shifting	360
16. Energy: Energy Efficiency.....	399
17. Trade: Trade Costs.....	424
18. Investment	444
19. Corporate Governance	460

8. Trade: E-commerce

“[We endorse the G20 Strategy for Global Trade Growth, under which the G20 will lead by example to] promote e-commerce development”

G20 Hangzhou Leaders' Communiqué

Assessment

	No Compliance	Partial Compliance	Full Compliance
Argentina		0	
Australia			+1
Brazil	-1		
Canada			+1
China			+1
France			+1
Germany		0	
India			+1
Indonesia			+1
Italy		0	
Japan	-1		
Korea		0	
Mexico		0	
Russia			+1
Saudi Arabia	-1		
South Africa			+1
Turkey		0	
United Kingdom		0	
United States		0	
European Union		0	
Average		+0.25	

Background

At the 2016 Hangzhou Summit, G20 members recognized that rapid development of digital trade and technology has caused a profound transformation of economic and trade structures presenting new opportunities and challenges.¹¹²¹ E-commerce was worth approximately USD22.1 trillion in 2015, an increase of 38 per cent from 2013.¹¹²² For the first time, G20 members mentioned and committed to e-commerce development. In Hangzhou, G20 members agreed to the “G20 Strategy for Global Trade Growth,” which is “as an integral part of the G20’s agenda to achieve our ambition of two per cent additional growth by 2018 set by G20 leaders in Brisbane in 2014, and as part of its broader efforts to strengthen global growth and to advance the Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs), the following Strategy sets out concrete individual and collective actions to this end.”¹¹²³

The Strategy committed to lowering trade costs, harnessing trade and investment policy coherence, boosting trade in services, enhancing trade finance, addressing trade and development and promoting

¹¹²¹Annex II: G20 Strategy for Global Trade Growth, G20 2016 China Official Website 15 July 2016. Access Date: October 23 2016. http://www.g20.org/English/Documents/Current/201607/t20160715_3057_2.html

¹¹²²New initiative to help developing countries grasp \$22 trillion e-commerce opportunity, UNCTAD 19 July 2016. Access Date: 22 October 2016. <http://unctad.org/en/pages/newsdetails.aspx?OriginalVersionID=1281>

¹¹²³Annex II: G20 Strategy for Global Trade Growth, G20 2016 China Official Website 15 July 2016. Access Date: October 23 2016. http://www.g20.org/English/Documents/Current/201607/t20160715_3057_2.html

e-commerce development to facilitate global trade growth while adhering and complementing other trade commitments.¹¹²⁴

Commitment Features

G20 members endorsed the Strategy for Global Trade Growth and committed to lead by example to promote e-commerce development.

On 9-10 July 2016, G20 trade ministers met in Shanghai, China for the G20 Trade Ministers Meeting. During this meeting, trade ministers issued the document “G20 Strategy for Global Trade Growth (SGTG),” which includes the article “Promoting e-commerce development.” G20 members agreed to “deepen discussions and cooperation on e-commerce issues” and took note of the B20’s initiative on the eWTP.¹¹²⁵

According to the World Trade Organization (WTO) electronic commerce, commonly known as e-commerce, involves goods and services crossing borders electronically. Broadly, e-commerce is the sale or purchase of goods or services conducted over the internet or other computer networks. An e-commerce transaction can be between enterprises, households, individuals, governments and other public or private organizations.¹¹²⁶

The Strategy for Global Trade Growth defined two priorities to promote e-commerce development 1) deepen discussions and 2) deepen cooperation on e-commerce issues.

Part One: Deepen Discussions

In the Strategy for Global Trade Growth, the G20 emphasised that deepened discussion about the opportunities and challenges of e-commerce can facilitate global trade. Enhancing conversation will promote policy coherence, boost the participation of Small and Medium Sized Enterprises (SMEs) and developing countries in global trade as well as provide better, more inclusive access to digital technology. Therefore, G20 members must engage in discussion specifically related to SMEs and developing countries, research on trade-related policy issues, standards and patterns as well as the general opportunities and challenges of e-commerce/e-commerce development. The Strategy also took note of the Business 20’s (B20’s) initiative on an Electronic World Trade Platform (eWTP) which aims to complement the WTO and reduce barriers for SMEs making it easier to expand their trading capabilities worldwide.¹¹²⁷ Therefore, G20 members also must engage in discussion specifically regarding the eWTP.

Discussion is defined as a conversation, policy review, panel which critically assess e-commerce, e-commerce trade or e-commerce related activities and development. Discussion can take place with international organizations, businesses and/or governments as well as experts and professionals.

Part Two: Deepen Cooperation

The G20 developed several areas to deepen e-commerce cooperation in its Digital Economy Development and Cooperation Initiative:

¹¹²⁴ Annex II: G20 Strategy for Global Trade Growth, G20 2016 China Official Website 15 July 2016. Access Date: October 23 2016. http://www.g20.org/English/Documents/Current/201607/t20160715_3057_2.html

¹¹²⁵ G20 Trade Ministers Meeting Statement, B20 Germany 10 July 2016. Access Date: 14 February 2017. https://www.b20germany.org/fileadmin/user_upload/documents/G20/g20-trade-ministers-statement-strategy-guidelines-investment-policy-making.pdf

¹¹²⁶ Briefing note: Electronic commerce, World Trade Organization (2013) Access Date: 28 October 2016. https://www.wto.org/english/thewto_e/minist_e/mc9_e/brief_ecom_e.htm

¹¹²⁷ Electronic World Trade Platform, Alibaba Group (2016) Access Date: 28 October 2016. <http://www.alizila.com/wp-content/uploads/2016/09/eWTP.pdf>

- Promote cross-border trade facilitation for e-commerce by using trusted digital means, such as paperless customs clearance, electronic transaction documents, mutual recognition of digital authentication, electronic payment and online payment.
- Prevent barriers to market access and other barriers.
- Address issues relating to taxation, such as ensuring the efficient payment of appropriate taxes for international e-commerce, taking into account in particular the Base Erosion and Profit Shifting (BEPS) issues.
- Improve international efforts to measure e-commerce, and the macroeconomic consequences of digital economy.
- Protect consumers' rights and develop dispute resolution approaches, ensuring options for consumers that are adapted to the characteristics of e-commerce within the national framework of laws and regulations provided that they are consistent with member's international legal obligations.
- Build confidence of users which is an essential element of the digital economy by ensuring the respect of privacy and protection of personal data.

Therefore, G20 members must deepen discussions as well as deepen cooperation to achieve full compliance. G20 members must take multiple steps, as laid out in each part of the commitment, to be considered compliant. Partial compliance is achieved if the G20 member takes multiple steps to achieve one part of the commitment and not the other. No compliance is achieved if the G20 member takes few steps to achieve either part or no steps at all.

Scoring Guidelines

-1	The G20 member does not deepen discussions OR deepen cooperation on e-commerce issues.
0	The G20 member deepens discussions OR deepens cooperation on e-commerce issues.
+1	The G20 member deepens discussions AND deepens cooperation on e-commerce issues.

Lead Analyst: Alissa Xinhe Wang

Argentina: 0

Argentina has partially complied with its commitment to deepen discussions on e-commerce and to deepen cooperation on e-commerce issues.

On 20 December 2016, the Argentine Central Bank issued Communication A 6118, an act that provides more flexibility to payments linked to e-commerce transactions. This act changed the requirements for payment processors entities and incorporated regulations to allow payments to be made through a payment processor. These changes aim to “increase and accelerate international e-commerce transactions.”¹¹²⁸

On 9 January 2017, the Central Bank of Argentina issued a new online immediate debit payment service.¹¹²⁹ The service is part of Argentina’s “New Regulations towards a Digitized Financial Sector.”¹¹³⁰ This service secures user-friendly transaction tools for e-commerce.¹¹³¹

¹¹²⁸ International E-Commerce Transactions’ payment flexibility, Lexology 20 December 2016. Access Date: 4 February 2017. <http://www.lexology.com/library/detail.aspx?g=621b279c-07ff-413d-96db-b331d95da23b>

¹¹²⁹ The Central Bank Implemented a New Online Immediate Debit Payment Service, Mondaq 9 January 2017. Access Date: 6 February 2017. <http://www.mondaq.com/Argentina/x/558448/Financial+Services/The+Central+Bank+Implemented+A+New+Online+Immediate+Debit+Payment+Service>

Argentina has not deepened discussions on e-commerce issues related specifically to Small and Medium-Sized Enterprises (SMEs) and developing countries. Argentina deepened e-commerce cooperation through facilitating international online payments. Thus, Argentina receives a score of 0.

Analyst: Kelly Cholva

Australia: +1

Australia has partially complied with its commitment to deepen discussions on e-commerce and to deepen cooperation on e-commerce issues.

On 6 September 2016, Prime Minister Malcolm Turnbull witnessed Austrade sign an agreement with Chinese e-commerce group Alibaba's executive, Chairman Jack Ma.¹¹³² This agreement will help Australian businesses, particularly small and medium enterprises (SMEs), access new global markets through Alibaba's online platforms.¹¹³³ Complementing the China-Australia Free Trade Agreement, this agreement builds on the prior commitment to reduce tariffs and strengthen business cooperation, while increasing exposure of Australian products to Chinese consumers.¹¹³⁴

On 6 September 2016, the ASEAN Australia Development Cooperation Program under its second phase (AADCP II) finalized the Master Plan of ASEAN Connectivity (MPAC) 2025.¹¹³⁵ AADCP II "is a long-term (2008-19), AU\$57 million program that supports ASEAN's goal of establishing an ASEAN Economic Community by 2015 and the post-2015 vision."¹¹³⁶ The ASEAN-Australia Economic Cooperation Program (AAECP) is funded by the Australian Government.¹¹³⁷ The MPAC strategies include supporting e-commerce development. It further acknowledges "the increasing importance of e-commerce trade in the [ASEAN] region" under its Initiative 9: Enhance Supply Chain Efficiency through Addressing Key Chokepoints.¹¹³⁸ ASEAN includes developing countries.

¹¹³⁰ The Central Bank Implemented a New Online Immediate Debit Payment Service, Mondaq 9 January 2017. Access Date: 6 February 2017.

<http://www.mondaq.com/Argentina/x/558448/Financial+Services/The+Central+Bank+Implemented+A+New+Online+Immediate+Debit+Payment+Service>

¹¹³¹ The Central Bank Implemented a New Online Immediate Debit Payment Service, Mondaq 9 January 2017. Access Date: 6 February 2017.

<http://www.mondaq.com/Argentina/x/558448/Financial+Services/The+Central+Bank+Implemented+A+New+Online+Immediate+Debit+Payment+Service>

¹¹³² Alibaba, Austrade ink strategic deal, The Australian (Surry Hill) 6 September 2016. Access Date: 4 November 2016. <http://www.theaustralian.com.au/business/technology/alibaba-austrade-ink-strategic-deal/news-story/f705d8a7a8034522059541a2590e6e8f>

¹¹³³ Australian Businesses set to Benefit from new Alibaba Agreement, Australian Trade and Investment Commission 6 September 2016. Access Date: 4 November 2016.

<http://www.austrade.gov.au/news/media-releases/2016/australian-businesses-set-to-benefit-from-new-alibaba-agreement>

¹¹³⁴ Australian Businesses set to Benefit from new Alibaba Agreement, Australian Trade and Investment Commission. 6 September 2016. Access Date: 4 November 2016. <http://www.austrade.gov.au/news/media-releases/2016/australian-businesses-set-to-benefit-from-new-alibaba-agreement>

¹¹³⁵ Formulation of Post-2015 Agenda for ASEAN Connectivity, Australian Aid ADCP II. Date of Access: 27 March 2017. <http://aadcp2.org/formulation-of-post-2015-agenda-for-asean-connectivity/>

¹¹³⁶ About AADCP II, Australian Aid ADCP II. Date of Access: 27 March 2017. <http://aadcp2.org/about-us/#about-aadcp>

¹¹³⁷ About AADCP II, Australian Aid ADCP II. Date of Access: 27 March 2017. <http://aadcp2.org/about-us/#about-aadcp>

¹¹³⁸ Master Plan on ASEAN Connectivity 2025, Australian Aid ADCP II. 2016. Date of Access: 27 March 2017. <http://asean.org/storage/2016/09/Master-Plan-on-ASEAN-Connectivity-20251.pdf>

In October 2016, Australia and Indonesia launched the Final Leaders Program. Among the topics discussed was e-commerce.¹¹³⁹

On 13 October 2016, Minister for Trade, Tourism and Investment, Steven Ciobo, and the Singaporean Minister for Trade and Investment, Lim Hng Kiang, signed the Agreement to Amend Singapore-Australian Free Trade Agreement (SAFTA).¹¹⁴⁰ Amendments addressing e-commerce include not imposing duties on digital products, allowing the free flow of data across borders for businesses, online consumer protections and the maintenance of a legal framework governing electronic transactions.^{1141,1142}

On 10 November 2016, Secretary of the Department of Foreign Affairs and Trade, Peter N. Varghese gave a speech to the Committee for Economic Development of Australia issuing his support for free trade agreements (FTA).¹¹⁴³ He identified that his support for both the China-Australia Free Trade Agreement (ChAFTA) and the Trans Pacific Partnership (TPP) involves provisions on e-commerce and a global economy.¹¹⁴⁴

Australia has deepened discussions on e-commerce issues related specifically to Small and Medium-Sized Enterprises (SMEs) and developing countries. Australia deepened e-commerce cooperation through enhancing trade ties, facilitating data flow across borders, eliminating duties on digital products, enhancing online consumer protection, and maintaining the legal governance of digital transactions. Thus, Australia receives a score of +1.

Analyst: Hannah Girdler

Brazil: -1

Brazil has not complied with its commitment to deepen discussions on e-commerce and to deepen cooperation on e-commerce issues.

On 25 October 2016, the Comissão de Defesa do Consumidor (Consumer Defense Commission) approved bill 1660/15 to protect internet users and e-commerce consumers.¹¹⁴⁵ The bill aims to

¹¹³⁹ Australia-Indonesia Financial Leaders Program: October 2016, The Australia-Indonesia Centre. Date of Access: March 30, 2017. <http://australiaindonesiacentre.org/projects/australia-indonesia-financial-leaders-program-october-2016/>

¹¹⁴⁰ Singapore-Australia FTA, Department of Foreign Affairs and Trade 13 October 2016. Access Date: 4 November 2016. <http://dfat.gov.au/trade/agreements/safta/pages/singapore-australia-fta.aspx#news>

¹¹⁴¹ Singapore- Australia Free Trade Agreement, Department of Foreign Affairs and Trade 13 October 2016. Access Date: 4 November 2016. <http://dfat.gov.au/trade/agreements/safta/Documents/safta-third-review-outcomes-at-a-glance.pdf>

¹¹⁴² Agreement to Amend the Singapore-Australia Free Trade Agreement, Department of Foreign Affairs and Trade 13 October 2016. Access Date: 4 November 2016. <http://dfat.gov.au/trade/agreements/safta/Documents/agreement-to-amend-the-singapore-australia-free-trade-agreement.pdf>

¹¹⁴³ Speech to the Committee for Economic Development of Australia, Department of Foreign Affairs and Trade (Australia) 10 November 2016. Access Date: 12 November 2016. <http://dfat.gov.au/news/speeches/Pages/speech-to-ceda.aspx>

¹¹⁴⁴ Speech to the Committee for Economic Development of Australia, Department of Foreign Affairs and Trade (Australia) 10 November 2016. Access Date: 12 November 2016. <http://dfat.gov.au/news/speeches/Pages/speech-to-ceda.aspx>

¹¹⁴⁵ "Serviços de Proteção Ao Crédito Deverão Fornecer Informações a Consumidores Sem ônus," Câmara dos Deputados October 25 2016. Access Date: 14 November 2016. <http://www2.camara.leg.br/atividade-legislativa/comissoes/comissoes-permanentes/cdc/noticias/servicos-de-protecao-ao-credito-deverao-fornecer-informacoes-a-consumidores-sem-onus-1>.

increase consumer comfort in e-commerce markets by making the tariff system clearer and introducing measures to protect data and privacy.¹¹⁴⁶

Brazil has not deepened discussions on e-commerce issues related specifically to Small and Medium-Sized Enterprises (SMEs) and developing countries. Brazil has not taken multiple steps to deepen e-commerce cooperation through enhancing data protection, improving the taxation system and facilitating international transactions. Thus, Brazil receives a score of -1.

Analyst: Kelly Cholvat

Canada: +1

Canada has fully complied with its commitment to deepen discussions on e-commerce and to deepen cooperation on e-commerce issues.

As of 30 October 2016, European Union-Canada Leaders' Summit, Canadian Prime Minister Justin Trudeau, President of the European Council Donald Tusk and President of the European Commission Jean-Claude Juncker signed the Comprehensive Economic and Trade Agreement (CETA).¹¹⁴⁷ This ratifies Chapter 16 and all its respective articles, promoting e-commerce between Canada and the EU. The article includes provisions to not impose customs duty or fees on a delivery transmitted by electronic means, to adopt or maintains laws that protect consumer information, to facilitate the use of e-commerce by small and medium sized enterprises (SMEs), and to maintain dialogue on issues raised by e-commerce.¹¹⁴⁸

On 8 November 2016, Prime Minister Justin Trudeau announced his upcoming participation in the 2016 Asia Pacific Economic Cooperation (APEC) Leaders' meeting in Peru from November 19 to 20.¹¹⁴⁹ APEC leaders focused on creating economic growth and facilitating freer trade amongst other topics, while in the presence of the Electronic Commerce Steering Group (ECSG).¹¹⁵⁰ The ECSG is geared towards "enabling economies across all levels of development to be able to utilize Information and Communication Technologies (ICTs) to drive economic growth and social development."¹¹⁵¹

Canada has deepened discussions on e-commerce issues related specifically to SMEs and developing countries. Canada has deepened e-commerce cooperation in trade facilitation, customs duties, consumer confidence. Thus, Canada receives a score of +1.

Analyst: Hannah Girdler

¹¹⁴⁶ "E-Commerce Brasil Entrevista Presidente Da Camara-E.Net Sobre a Reforma Do Código de Defesa Do Consumidor (CDC) - Câmara Brasileira de Comércio Eletrônico," Câmara Brasileira de Comércio Eletrônico November 9 2016. Access Date: 14 November 2016. <http://www.camara-e.net/2016/10/24/e-commerce-brasil-entrevista-presidente-da-camara-e-net-sobre-a-reforma-do-codigo-de-defesa-do-consumidor-cdc>

¹¹⁴⁷ Canada and EU sign historic trade agreement during EU-Canada Summit, Justin Trudeau, Prime Minister of Canada (Ottawa) 30 October 2016. Access Date: 6 November 2016. <http://pm.gc.ca/eng/news/2016/10/30/canada-and-eu-sign-historic-trade-agreement-during-eu-canada-summit>

¹¹⁴⁸ Text of the Comprehensive Economic and Trade Agreement – Chapter sixteen: Electronic commerce, Government of Canada (Ottawa) 18 October 2016. Access Date: 6 November 2016. <http://www.international.gc.ca/trade-commerce/trade-agreements-accords-commerciaux/agr-acc/ceta-aecg/text-texte/16.aspx?lang=eng>

¹¹⁴⁹ Prime Minister Justin Trudeau to travel to Cuba, Argentina, and Peru, Justin Trudeau, Prime Minister of Canada (Ottawa) 8 November 2016. Access Date: 12 November 2016. <http://pm.gc.ca/eng/news/2016/11/08/prime-minister-justin-trudeau-travel-cuba-argentina-and-peru>

¹¹⁵⁰ Electronic Commerce Steering Group, Asia-Pacific Economic Cooperation 2016. Access Date: 12 November 2016. <http://www.apec.org/groups/committee-on-trade-and-investment/electronic-commerce-steering-group.aspx>

¹¹⁵¹ Electronic Commerce Steering Group, APEC. Access Date: 3 February 2017. <http://www.apec.org/Groups/Committee-on-Trade-and-Investment/Electronic-Commerce-Steering-Group.aspx>

China: +1

China has fully complied with its commitments to deepen discussions on e-commerce and to deepen cooperation on e-commerce issues.

On 10 October 2016, the 13th China International small and medium sized enterprises (SMEs) Fair, approved by the State Council, opened in the city of Guangzhou, China.¹¹⁵² The fair was co-hosted with the Republic of Cote d'Ivoire and India. The 11 countries joining the fair are Cote d'Ivoire, India, South Africa, Nigeria, Bulgaria, Kenya, Burma, Mexico, Vietnam, Russia and Poland.¹¹⁵³ The event aimed to create a platform of “display, trade, exchange, and cooperation” for SMEs from around the world and showcase overseas and domestic exhibitions on cross-border e-commerce.¹¹⁵⁴

On 13 October 2016, Indian Commerce Minister Nirmala Sitharaman held a bilateral meeting with Chinese Commerce Minister Wang Shouwen. The discussion focused on the potential benefits that that Indo-China bilateral trade cooperation for local businesses. The two discussed in particular the potential of Information Technology and Information Technology Enabled Services (ITeS) projects.¹¹⁵⁵

On 18 October 2016, the EU and China held the sixth annual EU-China High-level Economic and Trade Dialogue (HED). The EU and China agreed to explore further how to boost sustainable economic and societal development in line with the strategies for the Digital Single Market for Europe and Digital China.¹¹⁵⁶

On 29 October 2016, South Korea and Japan agreed to further discussions for South Korea-China-Japan trilateral Free Trade Agreement (FTA), and the broader Regional Comprehensive Economic Partnership (RCEP), at the 11th trilateral ministerial meeting held in Japan. Japan, China and Korea have agreed to strengthen economic cooperation, and they will work together to establish Digital Single Market (DSM), and conduct joint research on e-commerce.¹¹⁵⁷

On 25 October 2016, China's National Development and Reform Commission, announced that an agreement fighting credit manipulation would be part of creating a national “social credit system” aimed at promoting online trustworthiness. To support this initiative, China's largest internet companies including Alibaba, Tencent, JD.com, have agreed to share data with government authorities to eliminate ‘brushing’ - faking reviews and sales figure - for the healthy development of e-commerce.¹¹⁵⁸

On 27 October 2016, China launched the National Quality Monitoring Center for cross-border e-commerce in Hangzhou. The platform is comprised of a big data center to monitor cross-border e-

¹¹⁵² The 13th China International SME Fair to open in Guangzhou on Monday, News GD 9 October 2016. Access Date: 3 February 2017. http://www.newsgd.com/news/2016-10/09/content_157161666.htm

¹¹⁵³ The 13th China International SME Fair to open in Guangzhou on Monday, News GD 9 October 2016. Access Date: 3 February 2017. http://www.newsgd.com/news/2016-10/09/content_157161666.htm

¹¹⁵⁴ The 13th China International SME Fair to open in Guangzhou on Monday, News GD 9 October 2016. Access Date: 3 February 2017. http://www.newsgd.com/news/2016-10/09/content_157161666.htm

¹¹⁵⁵ 5 things Indo-China bilateral trade cooperation could do for Indian Businesses, Entrepreneur India 13 October 2016. Date Accessed: 29 January 2017. <https://www.entrepreneur.com/article/283695>

¹¹⁵⁶ EU and China discuss trade, investment, overcapacity and cooperation on state aid control at the 6th High-level Economic and Trade Dialogue, European Commission (Brussels) 18 October 2016. Access Date: 13 November 2016. http://europa.eu/rapid/press-release_IP-16-3441_en.htm

¹¹⁵⁷ South Korea, China, Japan Agree to Act against Trade Protectionism, Business Korea (South Korea) 1 November 2016. Access Date: 13 November 2016. <http://www.businesskorea.co.kr/english/news/politics/16338-against-protectionism-south-korea-china-japan-agree-act-against-trade>

¹¹⁵⁸ China tech groups to share data with state in online fraud battle, Financial Times (United Kingdom) 25 October 2016. Access Date: 13 November 2016. <https://www.ft.com/content/4ebc5fb6-9a70-11e6-8f9b-70e3cabccfae>

commerce and will serve several functions, including risk monitoring, evaluation and treatment, quality source tracing, and credit rating.¹¹⁵⁹

On 5 November 2016, Chinese Premier Li Keqiang attended the fifth summit of China and Central and Eastern European Countries (CEEC). To address enhancement of pragmatic cooperation, the two parties discussed further cooperation on enhancing trade through e-commerce platforms. Also, they encouraged Chinese and CEE companies to promote exports and imports of their high-quality and characteristic products through e-commerce.¹¹⁶⁰

On 16 November 2016, Prime Minister Matteo Renzi met with Chinese President Xi Jinping on the Sardinia Island of Italy. Renzi expressed Italy's willingness to actively participate in the "Belt and Road" construction and deepen cooperation with China in areas such as trade and economy.¹¹⁶¹ The "Belt and Road" initiative encompasses many e-commerce services and online trading platforms.¹¹⁶²

China has deepened discussions on e-commerce issues related specifically to SMEs and developing countries. China has deepened e-commerce cooperation through trade facilitation, enhancing consumer protection and improving online trustworthiness. Thus, China receives a score of +1.

Analyst: Edward Ji Ho Kim

France: +1

France has fully complied with its commitments to deepen discussions on e-commerce and to deepen cooperation on e-commerce issues.

On 7 October 2016, the French Digital Republic Bill was adopted by the Senate.¹¹⁶³ The Bill intends to align the French legal data protection framework with the EU General Data Protection Regulation (GDPR) requirements before the GDPR becomes applicable in May 2018.¹¹⁶⁴ This law introduces new provisions that will regulate the digital economy as a whole, such as open data, online cooperative economy, the right to data portability and enhanced information and control of the individual of personal data.¹¹⁶⁵

On 24-28 October 2016, nine selected French start-ups and Small and Medium Enterprises (SMEs) visited India as part of the Trade & Investment Commission of France in India to promote French technology and build bridges and business synergies with Indian tech ecosystems.¹¹⁶⁶

¹¹⁵⁹ China cross-border e-commerce quality monitoring center launched, China Daily (China) 27 October 2016. Access Date: 13 November 2016. http://www.chinadaily.com.cn/business/2016-10/27/content_27190593.htm

¹¹⁶⁰ Premier's Latvia visit adds fresh impetus to China-CEE ties, Xinhua News (China) 6 November 2016. Access Date: 13 November 2016. http://news.xinhuanet.com/english/2016-11/06/c_135810001.htm

¹¹⁶¹ Xi Jinping Meets with Prime Minister Matteo Renzi of Italy, Ministry of Foreign Affairs of the People's Republic of China (Beijing) 17 November 2016. Access Date: 29 January 2017. http://www.fmprc.gov.cn/mfa_eng/zxxx_662805/t1416478.shtml

¹¹⁶² Chinese e-commerce services bring wealth, opportunities to "Belt-Road" countries, Global Times (Beijing) 16 August 2016. Access Date: 29 January 2017. <http://www.globaltimes.cn/content/1000566.shtml>

¹¹⁶³ Entry into Force of the French Digital Republic Bill, Hunton & Williams 31 October 2016. Access Date: 1 February 2017. <https://www.huntonprivacyblog.com/2016/10/31/entry-force-french-digital-republic-bill/>

¹¹⁶⁴ Entry into Force of the French Digital Republic Bill, Hunton & Williams 31 October 2016. Access Date: 1 February 2017. <https://www.huntonprivacyblog.com/2016/10/31/entry-force-french-digital-republic-bill/>

¹¹⁶⁵ France Adopts Digital Republic Law, Fieldfisher 6 October 2016. Access Date: 1 February 2017. <http://privacylawblog.fieldfisher.com/2016/france-adopts-digital-republic-law/>

¹¹⁶⁶ French Tech Tour to India 2016, French Embassy (New Delhi) 24 October 2016. Access Date: 1 February 2017. <http://www.ambafrance-in.org/French-tech-tour>

On 21-22 November 2016, Slovakian President Andrej Kiska visited Paris, France, in a demonstration of the common will of the two countries to strengthen to strengthen their economic links, especially regarding digital technology.¹¹⁶⁷

France has deepened discussions on e-commerce issues related specifically to small and medium sized enterprises (SMEs) and developing countries. France has deepened e-commerce cooperation through data protection and economic cooperation. Thus, France receives a score of +1.

Analyst: Natalia Valencia

Germany: 0

Germany has partially complied with its commitments to deepen discussions on e-commerce and to deepen cooperation on e-commerce issues.

On 20 October 2016, the German Ministry for Economic Affairs and Energy released a monitoring report, which included an analysis of the current state of e-commerce in Germany.¹¹⁶⁸

On 3 November 2016, the German cabinet endorsed a draft for a law, which is intended to increase the protection of individual travel bookings online. This is part of the attempt to increase e-commerce security.¹¹⁶⁹

Germany has not deepened discussions on e-commerce issues related specifically to small and medium sized enterprises (SMEs) and developing countries. Germany has deepened e-commerce cooperation through taxation, improved efforts to measure e-commerce, and protection of customer confidence. Thus, Germany receives a score of 0.

Analyst: Anton Rizor

India: +1

India has fully complied with its commitments to deepen discussions on e-commerce and to deepen cooperation on e-commerce issues.

On 10 October 2016, the 13th China International Small and Medium Enterprises (SMEs) Fair was held in China. India was a co-host of the fair.¹¹⁷⁰ 11 countries attended the fair: Cote d'Ivoire, India, South Africa, Nigeria, Bulgaria, Kenya, Burma, Mexico, Vietnam, Russia and Poland.¹¹⁷¹ The event aimed to create a platform of "display, trade, exchange, and cooperation" for SMEs from around the world and showcase overseas and domestic exhibitions on cross-border e-commerce.¹¹⁷²

¹¹⁶⁷ French Ambassador: Slovakia is very Pro-European, Spectator (Slovakia) 20 January 2017. Access Date: 1 February 2017. <https://spectator.sme.sk/c/20437522/french-ambassador-slovakia-is-very-pro-european.html>

¹¹⁶⁸ Monitoring-Report Wirtschaft DIGITAL 2016, Bundesregierung (Berlin) 20 October 2016. Access Date: 12 November 2016. https://www.bundesregierung.de/Content/Infomaterial/BMWI/monitoring-report-wirtschaft-digital-2016_786208.html

¹¹⁶⁹ Entwurf eines Dritten Gesetzes zur Änderung reiserechtlicher Vorschriften, Bundesregierung (Berlin) 3 November 2016. Access Date: 13 November 2016. http://www.bmju.de/SharedDocs/Gesetzgebungsverfahren/Dokumente/RegE_Drittes_Gesetz_Pauschalreiserichtlinie.pdf?__blob=publicationFile&v=2

¹¹⁷⁰ The 13th China International SME Fair to open in Guangzhou on Monday, News GD 9 October 2016. Access Date: 3 February 2017. http://www.newsgd.com/news/2016-10/09/content_157161666.htm

¹¹⁷¹ The 13th China International SME Fair to open in Guangzhou on Monday, News GD 9 October 2016. Access Date: 3 February 2017. http://www.newsgd.com/news/2016-10/09/content_157161666.htm

¹¹⁷² The 13th China International SME Fair to open in Guangzhou on Monday, News GD 9 October 2016. Access Date: 3 February 2017. http://www.newsgd.com/news/2016-10/09/content_157161666.htm

On 13 October 2016, Indian Commerce Minister Nirmala Sitharaman held a bilateral meeting with Chinese Commerce Minister Wang Shouwen. The discussion focused on the potential benefits that Indo-China bilateral trade cooperation for local businesses. The two discussed in particular the potential of Information Technology and Information Technology Enabled Services (ITeS) projects.¹¹⁷³

On 20 October 2016, Minister of Commerce and Industry of India Nirmala Sitharaman and US Trade Representative Ambassador Michael Froman met in Delhi for the tenth ministerial-level meeting of the India and US Trade Policy Forum (TPF). The released joint statement recognized the importance of e-commerce and India stated that “100 per cent foreign direct investment (FDI) is now permitted in the marketplace model of e-commerce as well as in the distribution of food products produced in India, including through e-commerce.” The statement also noted, “to ensure that e-commerce companies can take full advantage of this market opening, India noted the continuous efforts for facilitating investment in e-commerce.”¹¹⁷⁴

On 12 December 2016, during a bilateral meeting between Indian Prime Minister Modi and Indonesian President Joko Widodo, the two sides signed a Memorandum of Understanding (MoU) on trade standardization. Indonesia invited India to step up investment cooperation in information technology, which is critical to developing the e-commerce industry.¹¹⁷⁵

On 16 January 2017, India and the US signed a Memorandum of Understanding (MoU) on cyber security cooperation. The official statement said that “the MoU intends to promote closer cooperation and the exchange of information pertaining to the cyber security in accordance with the relevant laws, rules and regulations of each economy and this MoU and on the basis of equality, reciprocity and mutual benefit.”¹¹⁷⁶

India has deepened discussions on e-commerce issues related specifically to small and medium sized enterprises (SMEs) and developing countries. India has deepened cooperation on e-commerce related issues such as cyber security and trade and investment cooperation in information technology. Thus, India receives a score of +1.

Analyst: Alissa Wang

Indonesia: +1

Indonesia has fully complied with its commitments to deepen discussions on e-commerce and to deepen cooperation on e-commerce issues.

On 9 September 2016, Communications and Information Minister Rudiantara announced that Alibaba’s Jack Ma from China will become an adviser to the Indonesian e-commerce steering

¹¹⁷³ 5 things Indo-China bilateral trade cooperation could do for Indian Businesses, Entrepreneur India 13 October 2016. Date Accessed: 29 January 2017. <https://www.entrepreneur.com/article/283695>

¹¹⁷⁴ India and United States Joint Statement on the Trade Policy Forum, Office of the United States Trade Representative (Washington) 20 October 2016. Access Date: 5 November 2016. <https://ustr.gov/about-us/policy-offices/press-office/press-releases/2016/october/%E2%80%8BIndia-US-Joint-Statement-TPF>

¹¹⁷⁵ Indonesia plans to cooperate with India in forming digital economy, Antara News (New Delhi) 13 December 2017. Access Date: 29 January 2017. <http://www.antaranews.com/en/news/108360/indonesia-plans-to-cooperate-with-india-in-forming-digital-economy>

¹¹⁷⁶ India, US sign another agreement on cyber security cooperation, Data Center 16 January 2017. Access Date: 29 January 2017. <http://www.datacenterdynamics.com/content-tracks/security-risk/india-us-sign-another-agreement-on-cyber-security-cooperation/97606.fullarticle>

committee and the government is also looking for other global e-commerce figures for the advisory board.”¹¹⁷⁷

On 21 September 2016, President Joko Widodo stated that the country has seen a drastic increase in cyber crime, especially in the e-commerce sector. He stated that the government can “expand or consolidate units at ministries or institutions that have cyber security functions” and that the country’s e-commerce roadmap aims to strengthen surveillance and educate the society about the importance of cyber security, especially during transactions.¹¹⁷⁸

On 27 September 2016, President Joko Widodo emphasized the potential role of the e-commerce industry in Indonesia to support the country’s 56 million small and medium-sized enterprises (SMEs). Communications and Information Minister Rudiantara said that the government is in the process of preparing 31 initiatives on human resources, education, funding, taxation, consumer protection, cybersecurity, logistics and communications infrastructure to support the President’s e-commerce plans.¹¹⁷⁹

On 11 November 2016, the Indonesian government announced the 14th Economic Policy Package to turn “Indonesia into the biggest digital economy of the region by 2020 with a targeted value of USD130 billion. The policy package addresses issues of funding, taxation, consumer protection, human resources, logistics, communication infrastructure, cyber security and the establishment of a project management office. For example, the road map of the policy package includes grants and subsidies to start-ups to “boost their chances of surviving in the tough e-commerce industry,” reduction in taxes for locals investing in start-ups, a simplification of taxation procedure for e-commerce start-ups, and the repositioning of Indonesia as a logistical platform for Indonesian e-commerce.”¹¹⁸⁰

On 12 December 2016, during a bilateral meeting between Indian Prime Minister Modi and Indonesian President Joko Widodo, the two sides signed a Memorandum of Understanding (MoU) on trade standardization. Indonesia invited India to step up investment cooperation in information technology, which is critical to developing the e-commerce industry.¹¹⁸¹

On 12 December 2016, following a bilateral meeting with Indian Prime Minister Modi, Indonesian President Joko Widodo announced the signing of a Memorandum of Understanding (MoU) on trade standardization between Indonesia and India. He stated that Indonesia invited India to step up

¹¹⁷⁷ Indonesia seeks more global e-commerce champs to advise with Jack Ma, The Jakarta Post (Jakarta) 9 September 2016. Access Date: 29 January 2017. <http://www.thejakartapost.com/news/2016/09/09/indonesia-seeks-more-global-e-commerce-champs-to-advise-with-jack-ma.html>

¹¹⁷⁸ Indonesia experiences “drastic increase” in cyber attacks, especially on e-commerce sites, E27 21 September 2016. Access Date: 29 January 2017. <https://e27.co/indonesia-experiences-drastic-increase-cyber-attacks-especially-e-commerce-sites-20160921/>

¹¹⁷⁹ Incentives sought to propel e-commerce, The Jakarta Post (Jakarta) 28 September 2016. Access Date: 29 January 2017. <http://www.thejakartapost.com/news/2016/09/28/incentives-sought-to-propel-e-commerce-.html>

¹¹⁸⁰ Indonesia wants to lead the region in e-commerce, The Jakarta Post (Jakarta) 11 November 2016. Access Date: 29 January 2017. <http://www.thejakartapost.com/news/2016/11/11/indonesia-wants-to-lead-the-region-in-e-commerce.html>

¹¹⁸¹ Indonesia plans to cooperate with India in forming digital economy, Antara News (New Delhi) 13 December 2017. Access Date: 29 January 2017. <http://www.antaranews.com/en/news/108360/indonesia-plans-to-cooperate-with-india-in-forming-digital-economy>

investment cooperation in information technology, which is critical to developing the e-commerce industry.¹¹⁸²

On 13 December 2016, President Joko Widodo asked Head of Investment Coordinating Board (BKPM) Thomas Trikasih Lembong to announce plans to cooperate with India in forming a digital economy and in supporting e-commerce. Lembong stated, “Indonesia is seeking opportunities to cooperate with India in the digital economy and e-commerce space. The digital economy and e-commerce in India is considered to be highly prospective.”¹¹⁸³

Indonesia has deepened on e-commerce issues related specifically to small and medium sized enterprises (SMEs) and developing countries. Indonesia has deepened e-commerce cooperation through taxation measures, investment cooperation, digital economy cooperation, consumer protection, cybersecurity, logistics and communications infrastructure. Thus, Indonesia receives a score of +1.

Analyst: Alissa Xinhe Wang

Italy: 0

Italy has partially complied with its commitments to deepen discussions on e-commerce and to deepen cooperation on e-commerce issues.

On 16 November 2016, Prime Minister Matteo Renzi met with Chinese President Xi Jinping on the Sardinia Island of Italy. Renzi expressed Italy’s willingness to actively participate in the “Belt and Road” construction and deepen cooperation with China in areas such as trade and economy.¹¹⁸⁴ The “Belt and Road” initiative encompasses many e-commerce services and online trading platforms.¹¹⁸⁵

On 22 November 2016, the Italian E-commerce Association hosted the conference “The Digital Future Of Business Between Companies: Models, Best Practices and Solutions for B2B companies.” The conference focuses on the theme of the digital future of the Business-to-Business (B2B) model. This conference offered the occasion for meeting and networking between e-commerce operators and companies to learn about the opportunities from the online industry. The conference also presented a report named “The digital future of B2B” that describes the online presence of Italian B2B (business-to-business) companies.¹¹⁸⁶

On 12 December 2016, Italian Deputy Minister Ivan Scalfarotto and 37 Italian businessmen met with Pakistan’s Minister for Industries Sheikh Allaudin, Minister for Finance Dr. Aisha Ghaus Pasha and President of Pakistan’s Lahore Chamber of Commerce & Industry Abdul Basit. Representatives discussed the potential of increasing trade volume.¹¹⁸⁷ In particular, the two countries discussed the

¹¹⁸² Indonesia plans to cooperate with India in forming digital economy, Antara News (New Delhi) 13 December 2016. Access Date: 29 January 2017. <http://www.antaranews.com/en/news/108360/indonesia-plans-to-cooperate-with-india-in-forming-digital-economy>

¹¹⁸³ Indonesia plans to cooperate with India in forming digital economy, Antara News (New Delhi) 13 December 2017. Access Date: 29 January 2017. <http://www.antaranews.com/en/news/108360/indonesia-plans-to-cooperate-with-india-in-forming-digital-economy>

¹¹⁸⁴ Xi Jinping Meets with Prime Minister Matteo Renzi of Italy, Ministry of Foreign Affairs of the People’s Republic of China (Beijing) 17 November 2016. Access Date: 29 January 2017. http://www.fmprc.gov.cn/mfa_eng/zxxx_662805/t1416478.shtml

¹¹⁸⁵ Chinese e-commerce services bring wealth, opportunities to “Belt-Road” countries, Global Times (Beijing) 16 August 2016. Access Date: 29 January 2017. <http://www.globaltimes.cn/content/1000566.shtml>

¹¹⁸⁶ The digital future of B2B, Ecommerce News (Milan) 22 November 2016. Access Date: 29 January 2017. <https://ecommercenews.eu/events/the-digital-future-of-b2b/>

¹¹⁸⁷ Pakistan, Italy agree to boost trade, economic ties, Geo TV (Lahore) 12 December 2016. Access Date: 29 January 2017. <https://www.geo.tv/latest/123410-Pakistan-Italy-agree-to-boost-trade-economic-ties>

potential of Italian entrepreneurs participating in the China Pakistan Economic Corridor, which is supplemented by a China Pakistan E-Corridor component.¹¹⁸⁸

Italy has not deepened discussions on e-commerce issues related specifically to small and medium sized enterprises (SMEs) and developing countries. Italy has deepened e-commerce cooperation through trade facilitation and economic cooperation. Thus, Italy receives a score of 0.

Analyst: Alissa Xinhe Wang

Japan: -1

Japan has not complied with its commitment to deepen discussions on e-commerce and to deepen cooperation on e-commerce issues.

On 12 October 2016, Japan's Financial Service Agency (FSA) and Finance Ministry have discussed about ending an 8 per cent sales-tax collection on the Bitcoin. This change is poised to propel the growth of Bitcoin and other cryptocurrencies as alternatives to traditional money, by reducing costs for buyers and relieve operators of administrative burden associated with dealing with tax.¹¹⁸⁹ However, no actions have been implemented.

On 29 October 2016, at the 11th trilateral ministerial meeting held in Japan, trade ministers from Japan, Korea and China agreed to further discussions for South Korea-China-Japan trilateral Free Trade Agreement (FTA), and the broader Regional Comprehensive Economic Partnership (RCEP), in order to take actions against trade protectionism issues addressed in the World Trade Organization and G20 summit. Three countries have agreed to strengthen economic cooperation, and they will work together to establish Digital Single Market (DSM), and conduct joint research on e-commerce.¹¹⁹⁰

Japan has not deepened discussions on e-commerce issues related specifically to small and medium sized enterprises (SMEs) and developing countries. Japan has not taken multiple steps to deepen e-commerce cooperation through trade cooperation and eliminating taxation. Thus, Japan receives a score of -1.

Analyst: Edward Ji Ho Kim

Korea: 0

Korea has partially complied with its commitment to deepen discussions on e-commerce and to deepen cooperation on e-commerce issues.

On 16 October 2016, Korea's Fair Trade Commission announced its plan to apply the same set of e-commerce laws that were applicable to the conventional e-commerce retailers, to the crowdfunding businesses. The application of e-commerce laws to the crowdfunding business is expected to reduce

¹¹⁸⁸ E-Corridor to supplement China-Pak Economic COrridor, Propakistani 1 February 2016. Access Date: 29 January 2017. <https://propakistani.pk/2016/02/01/e-corridor-to-supplement-china-pak-economic-corridor/>

¹¹⁸⁹ Japan set to drop sales tax on buying virtual currency, Nikkei (Japan) 12 October 2016. Access Date: 13 November 2016. http://asia.nikkei.com/Politics-Economy/Policy-Politics/Japan-set-to-drop-sales-tax-on-buying-virtual-currency?n_cid=NARAN012

¹¹⁹⁰ South Korea, China, Japan Agree to Act against Trade Protectionism, Business Korea (South Korea) 1 November 2016. Access Date: 13 November 2016. <http://www.businesskorea.co.kr/english/news/politics/16338-against-protectionism-south-korea-china-japan-agree-act-against-trade>

operating uncertainties for the corporations, while improving conflict resolution process for the consumers in case of fraud.¹¹⁹¹

On 24 October 2016, Chairman of the Korea's Financial Services Commission, Yim Jong-yong stated that "the government will push for the systematization of digital currency on a full scale in tandem with a global trend in the US, Japan and other countries" He also said that the government will also offer WON3 trillion (USD2.65 billion) in financial support over the next three years to develop fintech sector and remove unnecessary regulations on the field.¹¹⁹²

On 29 October 2016, at the 11th trilateral ministerial meeting held in Japan, trade ministers from South Korea, China and Japan agreed to further discussions for South Korea-China-Japan trilateral Free Trade Agreement (FTA), and the broader Regional Comprehensive Economic Partnership (RCEP), in order to take actions against trade protectionism issues addressed in the World Trade Organization and G20 summit. Three countries have agreed to strengthen economic cooperation, and they will work together to establish Digital Single Market (DSM), and conduct joint research on e-commerce.¹¹⁹³

On 9 November 2016, Korea Institute for Electronic Trade and Commerce Promotion (KIETaC) authorized a licensing system for e-trade and e-commerce system. KIETaC chairman Shim Dong-Sup stated that "Korea should train e-commerce experts to integrate Korea, China and Japan's digital markets into single market and to make the country a leader in global e-commerce" The system will take effect starting November 11, 2016.¹¹⁹⁴

Korea has not deepened discussions on e-commerce issues related specifically to small and medium sized enterprises (SMEs) and developing countries. Korea deepened cooperation in e-commerce through financial support, creation of a licensing system, protection of online consumers, and trade cooperation. Thus, Korea receives a score of 0.

Analyst: Edward Ji Ho Kim

Mexico: 0

Mexico has partially complied with its commitment to deepen discussions on e-commerce and to deepen cooperation on e-commerce issues.

On 10 October 2016, Mexico attended the the 13th China International Small and Medium Enterprises Fair.¹¹⁹⁵ The participants of the included Cote d'Ivoire, India, South Africa, Nigeria, Bulgaria, Kenya, Burma, Mexico, Vietnam, Russia and Poland.¹¹⁹⁶ The event aimed to create a

¹¹⁹¹ 'Korean Kickstarters' to protect consumers with e-commerce laws, Electronic News (South Korea) 16 October 2016.

Access Date: 12 November 2016. <http://www.etnews.com/20161014000416>

¹¹⁹² Korea to expand system for digital currency, Korea Herald (South Korea) 24 October 2016. Access Date: 13 November 2016. <http://www.koreaherald.com/view.php?ud=20161024000876>

¹¹⁹³ South Korea, China, Japan Agree to Act against Trade Protectionism, Business Korea (South Korea) 1 November 2016. Access Date: 13 November 2016. <http://www.businesskorea.co.kr/english/news/politics/16338-against-protectionism-south-korea-china-japan-agree-act-against-trade>

¹¹⁹⁴ Government approves e-biz licensing system, Korea Times (South Korea) 9 November 2016. Access Date: 13 November 2016. https://www.koreatimes.co.kr/www/news/biz/2016/11/123_217878.html

¹¹⁹⁵ The 13th China International SME Fair to open in Guangzhou on Monday, News GD 9 October 2016. Access Date: 3 February 2017. http://www.newsgd.com/news/2016-10/09/content_157161666.htm

¹¹⁹⁶ The 13th China International SME Fair to open in Guangzhou on Monday, News GD 9 October 2016. Access Date: 3 February 2017. http://www.newsgd.com/news/2016-10/09/content_157161666.htm

platform of “display, trade, exchange, and cooperation” for SMEs from around the world and showcase overseas and domestic exhibitions on cross-border e-commerce.¹¹⁹⁷

Mexico deepened discussions on e-commerce issues related specifically to small and medium sized enterprises (SMEs) and developing countries. Mexico has not deepened cooperation in e-commerce. Thus, Mexico receives a score of 0.

Analyst: Kelly Cholvat

Russia: +1

Russia has fully complied with its commitment to deepen discussions on e-commerce and to deepen cooperation on e-commerce issues.

On 14 September 2016, the meeting of the working group on the implementation of Support of Access to Foreign Market and Export Action Plan (Roadmap) was held. Experts from the Federal Customs Service, the Ministry of Finance, the Ministry of Economic Development and other agencies concerned, as well as exporters and representatives of business associations discussed the implementation of individual items of the roadmap, including exports through e-commerce channels. The main goals of the updated roadmap include further improvement of e-commerce mechanisms. The document was submitted to the Russian Government for final approval.¹¹⁹⁸

On 30 September 2016, Oleg Belozarov, President of Russian Railways, and Dimitry Strashnov, CEO of the Russian Post, signed the Roadmap for transporting mail between China and Europe by interstate rail transport.¹¹⁹⁹ Belozarov stated that “The advantages of this new mail route to all those involved in e-commerce are obvious. This offers a good alternative to air delivery, both in terms of delivery times and quality. For us, it is important not only to provide a convenient transit corridor for freight traffic between East and West, but also to establish favourable conditions for Russian exports.”¹²⁰⁰

On 10 October 2016, Russia attended the the 13th China International Small and Medium Enterprises (SMEs) Fair.¹²⁰¹ The participants of the fair included Cote d’Ivoire, India, South Africa, Nigeria, Bulgaria, Kenya, Burma, Mexico, Vietnam, Russia and Poland.¹²⁰² The event aimed to create a platform of “display, trade, exchange, and cooperation” for SMEs from around the world and showcases oversea and domestic exhibitions on cross-border e-commerce.¹²⁰³

¹¹⁹⁷ The 13th China International SME Fair to open in Guangzhou on Monday, News GD 9 October 2016. Access Date: 3 February 2017. http://www.newsgd.com/news/2016-10/09/content_157161666.htm

¹¹⁹⁸ Revised Version of Roadmap to Support Exports Submitted to the Government, Russian Export Center 15 September 2016. <https://www.exportcenter.ru/en/news/reviced-version-of-roadmap-to-support-exports-submitted-to-the-government/?navNum=1&page=1>

¹¹⁹⁹ Russian transport corridor connects China and Western Europe, Ecommerce News Europe 13 October 2016. Access Date: 6 February 2017. <https://ecommercenews.eu/russian-transport-corridor-connects-china-western-europe/>

¹²⁰⁰ Russian railways and Russian Post agree to develop postal transit freight between China-Russia-Europe, Russian Railways 1 October 2016. Access Date: 3 February 2017. http://eng.rzd.ru/newse/public/en?STRUCTURE_ID=15&layer_id=4839&refererLayerId=4537&refererPageId=704&id=106958

¹²⁰¹ The 13th China International SME Fair to open in Guangzhou on Monday, News GD 9 October 2016. Access Date: 3 February 2017. http://www.newsgd.com/news/2016-10/09/content_157161666.htm

¹²⁰² The 13th China International SME Fair to open in Guangzhou on Monday, News GD 9 October 2016. Access Date: 3 February 2017. http://www.newsgd.com/news/2016-10/09/content_157161666.htm

¹²⁰³ The 13th China International SME Fair to open in Guangzhou on Monday, News GD 9 October 2016. Access Date: 3 February 2017. http://www.newsgd.com/news/2016-10/09/content_157161666.htm

On 9 December 2016, at the meeting of the Presidium of the Russian Presidential Council on Strategic Development and Priority Projects the Government instructed the Ministry of Industry and Trade and other ministries and entities to develop a program of creating technical, regulatory, institutional and logistical environment conducive to increasing exports of SMEs through e-commerce channels. Ministry of Agriculture and other ministries and entities were instructed to develop proposal on creating logistical centers to export agricultural products to the Asia-Pacific countries, including through e-commerce channels.¹²⁰⁴

On 23 December 2016, the Russian Export Center published a manual on entering international e-commerce platforms. It is aimed to help new exporters to start using e-commerce platforms.¹²⁰⁵ The Russian Export Center is a joint-stock company established under the mandate of the Russian Government to offer a specialised one-stop-shop for exporters, providing financial and non-financial support, and interacting with relevant ministries and agencies. The Russian Government designated the legal status of the center as a state export support institution.¹²⁰⁶

Russia deepened discussions on e-commerce issues related specifically to small and medium sized enterprises (SMEs) and developing countries. Russia has taken multiple steps to deepen cooperation in e-commerce. Thus, Russia receives a score of +1.

Analysts: Sharon Ho & Mark Rakhmangulov

Saudi Arabia: -1

Saudi Arabia has not complied with its commitment to deepen discussions on e-commerce and to deepen cooperation on e-commerce issues.

On 15-16 November 2016, the fourth edition of the Saudi Trade Finance summit took place in Jeddah.¹²⁰⁷ This premier trade finance summit is one of the largest gathering of finance professionals from mid and large enterprises in the Kingdom along with key stakeholders from the government and regulatory authorities, financial institutions, technology providers, trade credit insurers, consulting and advisory firms.¹²⁰⁸ The summit aimed to discuss current trade trends and challenges, including the role of Small and Medium Enterprises (SMEs) in trade development and their contribution to Saudi's Gross Domestic Product.¹²⁰⁹

Saudi Arabia has deepened discussion on e-commerce issues related specifically to small and medium sized enterprises (SMEs) but not developing countries. Saudi Arabia has not taken multiple steps to deepen cooperation on e-commerce issues through investment cooperation, digital economy cooperation and consumer protection. Thus, Saudi Arabia receives a score of -1.

¹²⁰⁴ On the Decisions of the Meeting of the Presidium of the Russian Presidential Council on Strategic Development and Priority Projects Government of Russia, 9 December 2016. <http://government.ru/orders/selection/401/25598/>

¹²⁰⁵ Russian Export Center Published a Manual on Entering International E-Commerce Platforms, Russian Export Center 23 December 2016. <https://www.exportcenter.ru/news/rets-vypustil-metodicheskoe-posobie-po-vykhodu-na-mezhdunarodnye-elektronnye-torgovyie-ploshchadki/?navNum=1&page=1>

¹²⁰⁶ About, , Russian Export Center. <https://www.exportcenter.ru/en/company/>

¹²⁰⁷ Technology and Vision 2030 the 'Main Attractions' at Saudi Trade Finance Summit 2016, Saudi Projects Magazine (Saudi Arabia) 7 November 2016. Access Date: 2 February 2017. <http://www.saudiprojectsmagazine.com/news/2016/11/7/technology-and-vision-2030-the-main-attractions-at-saudi-trade-finance-summit-2016>

¹²⁰⁸ Technology and Vision 2030 the 'Main Attractions' at Saudi Trade Finance Summit 2016, Saudi Projects Magazine (Saudi Arabia) 7 November 2016. Access Date: 2 February 2017. <http://www.saudiprojectsmagazine.com/news/2016/11/7/technology-and-vision-2030-the-main-attractions-at-saudi-trade-finance-summit-2016>

¹²⁰⁹ Saudi Trade Finance Summit opens in Jeddah today, i Dubai News 15 November 2016. Access Date: 2 February 2017. <http://idubainews.com/saudi-trade-finance-summit-opens-in-jeddah-today/>

Analyst: Natalia Valencia

South Africa: +1

South Africa has fully complied with its commitment to deepen discussions on e-commerce and to deepen cooperation on e-commerce issues.

On 9 September 2016, the South African chapter of the Brazil, Russia, India, China, and South Africa (BRICS) Business Council launched the South Africa BRICS Business Council Portal. The portal presents a solution to address some of the challenges of doing business within Brazil, Russia, India and China. The portal was designed to “minimize business risk and equip individuals and business owners with relevant and up-to-date information to ensure they make informed trade and investment decisions.”¹²¹⁰

On 10 October 2016, South Africa attended the the 13th China International Small and Medium Enterprise (SME) Fair.¹²¹¹ The participants included Cote d’Ivoire, India, South Africa, Nigeria, Bulgaria, Kenya, Burma, Mexico, Vietnam, Russia and Poland. The event aimed to create a platform of “display, trade, exchange, and cooperation” for SMEs from around the world and showcase overseas and domestic exhibitions on cross-border e-commerce.¹²¹²

On 16-18 October 2016, South Africa hosted the fifth meeting of the African Internet Governance Forum (AfIGF). The AfIGF concluded with an Action Plan focused on amongst others:

- ensuring wider participation in the online economy;
- the promotion and protection of intellectual property;
- the promotion of cyber-security;
- privacy and access to key technical resources, such as domain names and Internet Protocol addresses, that all make Internet services possible.¹²¹³

South Africa has deepened discussions on e-commerce issues related specifically to SMEs and developing countries. South Africa has deepened e-commerce cooperation through investment cooperation, digital economy cooperation, consumer protection and cybersecurity, logistics. Thus, South Africa receives a score of +1.

Analyst: Natalia Valencia

Turkey: 0

Turkey has partially complied with its commitment to deepen discussions on e-commerce and to deepen cooperation on e-commerce issues.

On 6 October 2016, Turkey entered into negotiations over a free-trade agreement with Pakistan that particularly aims at improving e-commerce between the two countries.¹²¹⁴

¹²¹⁰ S.A Launches BRICS Business Council, CNBC Africa 23 September 2016. Access Date: 1 February 2017. <http://www.cnbc africa.com/news/special-report/2016/09/23/brics-business-council-launches-trade-and-investment-portal/>

¹²¹¹ The 13th China International SME Fair to open in Guangzhou on Monday, News GD 9 October 2016. Access Date: 3 February 2017. http://www.newsgd.com/news/2016-10/09/content_157161666.htm

¹²¹² The 13th China International SME Fair to open in Guangzhou on Monday, News GD 9 October 2016. Access Date: 3 February 2017. http://www.newsgd.com/news/2016-10/09/content_157161666.htm

¹²¹³ International Cooperation, Trade and Security Cluster briefing, Government Communications (South Africa) 13 December 2016. Access Date: 1 February 2017. <http://www.gcis.gov.za/newsroom/media-releases/international-cooperation-trade-and-security-cluster-briefing>

On 24 October 2016, the Ministry of Customs and Trade published two draft communiqués regarding “safety stamp” applications and notification obligations in e-commerce. The Ministry granted public institutions and organizations, professional organizations, associations and unions the opportunity to comment and provide feedback on the two draft communiqués.¹²¹⁵

On 25 October 2016, the Minister of Customs and Trade participated in the e-commerce Sector Council Meeting and presented the rising numbers of Turkish interest in e-commerce.¹²¹⁶ In the same meeting he set the target for the e-commerce market at TRY180 billion.¹²¹⁷

On 11 November 2016, the Turkish government announced a plan to support the expenses of exporting e-commerce companies on a project basis in order to ensure that exporters have the potential to be part of the global e-commerce trade. The plan is worth TRY3 billion.

Turkey did not deepen discussions on e-commerce issues related specifically to SMEs and developing countries. Turkey has deepened e-commerce cooperation through trade cooperation, safety applications and support of exports. Thus, Turkey receives a score of 0.

Analyst: Anton Rizor

United Kingdom: 0

The United Kingdom has partially complied with its commitment to deepen discussions on e-commerce and to deepen cooperation on e-commerce issues.

On 1 November 2016, the UK government committed to spend GBP2 billion over the next five years to improve cyber security in the country as part of its new cyber security strategy. The aim of the strategy is to make the UK “prosperous and confident in the digital world” and “the safest place to do business in the world.”¹²¹⁸ The UK Treasury also stated that it would work closely with industry partners to defend and safeguard citizens and businesses against cyber threats.¹²¹⁹

On 15 November 2016, the UK Department for International Trade created a digital platform, the “digital trade hub,” to help UK businesses in the export market. The platform supports the government’s e-exporting programme and will offer help to UK businesses in exporting to priority markets of India, China, Germany and the US. The platform aims to show the “international

¹²¹⁴ Ministry of Commerce starts negotiation with Thailand and Turkey for Free Trade Agreements, Lahore World (Lahore) 6 October 2016. Access Date: 13 November 2016. <http://lahoreworld.com/2016/10/06/ministry-commerce-starts-negotiation-thailand-turkey-free-trade-agreements/>

¹²¹⁵ Turkey Presents Two Draft Communiqués on E-Commerce, Lexology (Istanbul) 27 October 2016. Access Date: 13 November 2016. <http://www.lexology.com/library/detail.aspx?g=b3e26853-6b67-4ee4-b1f0-4244c9691135>

¹²¹⁶ Gümrük ve Ticaret Bakanı Bülent Tüfenkci'den 'e-ticaret' açıklaması, İhlas haber Ajansı (Ankara) 25 October 2016. Access Date: 13 November 2016. <http://www.ihha.com.tr/haber-gumruk-ve-ticaret-bakani-bulent-tufenkci-den-e-ticaret-aciklamasi-596495/>

¹²¹⁷ TOBB Türkiye E-Ticaret Sektör Meclisi Toplantısı, Haberler (Ankara) 27 October 2016. Access Date: 13 November 2016. <http://www.haberler.com/tobb-turkiye-e-ticaret-sektor-meclisi-toplantisi-8894253-haberi/>

¹²¹⁸ UK government re-announces 1.9bn cyber security spend, Computer Weekly 1 November 2016. Access Date: 2 February 2017. <http://www.computerweekly.com/news/450402098/UK-government-re-announces-19bn-cyber-security-spend>

¹²¹⁹ UK government vows to sink \$2.3 billion into new cybersecurity plan, Ars Technica 1 November 2016. Access Date: 2 February 2017. <https://arstechnica.com/security/2016/11/cyber-attacks-uk-vows-1-9-billion-cyber-security-strategy/>

audience that [the UK is] home to the most dynamic and innovative companies in the world and that Britain is open for business as never before.”¹²²⁰

The UK did not deepen discussion on e-commerce issues related specifically to SMEs and developing countries. The UK deepened cooperation on e-commerce issues through the creation of a digital trade hub and improving cyber security. Thus, the UK receives a score of 0.

Analyst: Alissa Xinhe Wang

United States: 0

The United States has partially complied with its commitment to deepen discussions on e-commerce and to deepen cooperation on e-commerce issues.

On 3 October to 7 October 2016, the US and the EU held the 15th Round of Transatlantic Trade and Investment Partnership (TTIP) negotiations in New York City.¹²²¹ The TTIP includes provisions to use e-commerce to improve trade, committing to not impose custom duties on digital products and allow the movement of cross-border information flow.¹²²²

On 20 October 2016, Minister of Commerce and Industry of India Nirmala Sitharaman and US Trade Representative Ambassador Michael Froman met in Delhi for the tenth ministerial-level meeting of the India and US Trade Policy Forum (TPF). The released joint statement recognized the importance of e-commerce and India stated that “100 per cent foreign direct investment (FDI) is now permitted in the marketplace model of e-commerce as well as in the distribution of food products produced in India, including through e-commerce.” The statement also noted, “to ensure that e-commerce companies can take full advantage of this market opening, India noted the continuous efforts for facilitating investment in e-commerce.”¹²²³

On 20 October 2016, Indian Minister of Commerce and Industry Nirmala Sitharaman and the US Trade Representative Ambassador Michael Froman met in Delhi for the tenth ministerial-level meeting of the India and United States Trade Policy Forum (TPF).¹²²⁴ E-commerce as a tool in facilitating trade was acknowledged by both parties.¹²²⁵

¹²²⁰ Government launches ‘digital trade hub’ in a bid to boost export market, Public Technology 15 November 2016. Access Date: 2 February 2017. <https://www.publictechnology.net/articles/news/government-launches-%E2%80%98digital-trade-hub%E2%80%99-bid-boost-export-market>

¹²²¹ T-TIP Round Information, Office of the United States Trade Representative (Washington) 3 October 2016. Access Date: 5 November 2016. <https://ustr.gov/ttip/ttip-round-information>

¹²²² Electronic Commerce and Information and Communication Technology (ICT) Services, Office of the United States Trade Representative (Washington). Access Date: 5 November 2016. <https://ustr.gov/trade-agreements/free-trade-agreements/transatlantic-trade-and-investment-partnership-t-tip/t-tip-15>

¹²²³ India and United States Joint Statement on the Trade Policy Forum, Office of the United States Trade Representative (Washington) 20 October 2016. Access Date: 5 November 2016. <https://ustr.gov/about-us/policy-offices/press-office/press-releases/2016/october/%E2%80%8BIndia-US-Joint-Statement-TPF>

¹²²⁴ India and United States Joint Statement on the Trade Policy Forum, Office of the United States Trade Representative (Washington) 20 October 2016. Access Date: 5 November 2016. <https://ustr.gov/about-us/policy-offices/press-office/press-releases/2016/october/%E2%80%8BIndia-US-Joint-Statement-TPF>

¹²²⁵ India and United States Joint Statement on the Trade Policy Forum, Office of the United States Trade Representative (Washington) 20 October 2016. Access Date: 5 November 2016. <https://ustr.gov/about-us/policy-offices/press-office/press-releases/2016/october/%E2%80%8BIndia-US-Joint-Statement-TPF>

On 7 November 2016, US Trade Representative Michael Froman traveled to Buenos Aires for the US-Argentina Trade and Investment Framework Agreement (TIFA) Council Meeting.¹²²⁶ TIFA was signed on 23 March 2016 and includes e-commerce as part of their initial work program.¹²²⁷

The US has not deepened discussion on e-commerce issues related specifically to small and medium sized enterprises (SMEs) and developing countries. The US deepened cooperation on e-commerce through the facilitation of trade and cross-border information flow. Thus, United States receives a score of 0.

Analyst: Hannah Girdler

European Union: 0

The European Union has partially complied with its commitment to deepen discussions and deepen cooperation on e-commerce issues.

On 15 September 2016, the European Commission published a preliminary report on an e-commerce sector inquiry. The preliminary report provides an overview of the main competition-relevant market trends identified in the e-commerce sector inquiry and points to possible competition concerns.¹²²⁸

On 3 October 2016, the European Commission published its Inception Impact Assessment titled “European free flow of data initiative within the Digital Single Market (DSM),” which reiterates the detriment to the Digital Economy when data is required to stay local.¹²²⁹

On 3 October to 7 October 2016, the US and the EU held the 15th Round of Transatlantic Trade and Investment Partnership (T-TIP) negotiations in New York City.¹²³⁰ The TTIP includes provisions to use e-commerce to improve trade, committing to not impose custom duties on digital products and allow the movement of cross-border information flow.¹²³¹

On 6 October 2016, the European Commission held a stakeholder conference in Brussels highlighting the preliminary findings of the e-commerce sector inquiry.¹²³²

On 17 October 2016, the European Commission released a report at the European Consumer Summit about e-commerce consumer rights. Since October 2015, the European Commission has

¹²²⁶ Trade and Investment Framework Agreement Between the Government of the United States of America and the Government of the Argentine Republic, Investment Policy Hub 23 March 2016. Access Date: 12 November 2016. <http://investmentpolicyhub.unctad.org/Download/TreatyFile/5099>

¹²²⁷ Trade and Investment Framework Agreement Between the Government of the United States of America and the Government of the Argentine Republic, Investment Policy Hub 23 March 2016. Access Date: 12 November 2016. <http://investmentpolicyhub.unctad.org/Download/TreatyFile/5099>

¹²²⁸ Sector inquiry into e-commerce, European Commission (Brussels) 10 October 2016. Access Date: 13 November 2016. http://ec.europa.eu/competition/antitrust/sector_inquiries_e_commerce.html

¹²²⁹ Inception Impact Assessment: “European free flow of data initiative within the Digital Single Market,” European Commission (Brussels) 3 October 2016. Access Date: 13 November 2016. http://ec.europa.eu/smart-regulation/roadmaps/docs/2016_cnect_001_free_flow_data_en.pdf

¹²³⁰ T-TIP Round Information, Office of the United States Trade Representative (Washington) 3 October 2016. Access Date: 5 November 2016. <https://ustr.gov/ttip/ttip-round-information>

¹²³¹ Electronic Commerce and Information and Communication Technology (ICT) Services, Office of the United States Trade Representative (Washington). Access Date: 5 November 2016. <https://ustr.gov/trade-agreements/free-trade-agreements/transatlantic-trade-and-investment-partnership-t-tip/t-tip-15>

¹²³² Sector inquiry into e-commerce, European Commission (Brussels) 10 October 2016. Access Date: 13 November 2016. http://ec.europa.eu/competition/antitrust/sector_inquiries_e_commerce.html

coordinated the work of 28 consumer authorities to ensure that e-commerce websites across the EU respect the pre-contractual information requirements of the Consumer Rights Directive. 743 websites were checked. And the authorities found one or several confirmed irregularities in almost 60 per cent of those websites. 87 per cent of those which still exist are now fully compliant after the national consumer authorities asked for corrections to be made.¹²³³

On 18 October 2016, the EU and China held the sixth annual EU-China High-level Economic and Trade Dialogue (HED). The EU and China agreed to explore further how to boost sustainable economic and societal development in line with the strategies for the Digital Single Market for Europe and Digital China.¹²³⁴

On 19 October 2016, the European Economic and Social Committee, an advisory board to the European Commission has urged the European Commission to follow through on promises related to geo-blocking, roaming and parcel delivery.¹²³⁵

On 8 November 2016, the European Commissioner for the DSM Andrus Ansip attended a roundtable discussion on the DSM at the Web Summit technology conference in Lisbon. At the conference he urged tax simplification concerning e-commerce in order to break down digital intra-EU trade barriers.¹²³⁶

The EU has not deepened discussion on e-commerce issues related specifically to SMEs and developing countries. The EU deepened cooperation through promoting barrier free-trade, urging the break down of barriers to market entry and addressing copyright, taxation and consumer rights issues. Thus, the EU receives a score of 0.

Analyst: Anton Rizor

¹²³³ Keynote speech by European Commissioner Věra Jourová on the review of consumer policy - 2016 European Consumer Summit, European Commission (Brussels) 17 October 2016. Access Date: 13 November 2016. http://europa.eu/rapid/press-release_SPEECH-16-3464_en.htm

¹²³⁴ EU and China discuss trade, investment, overcapacity and cooperation on state aid control at the 6th High-level Economic and Trade Dialogue, European Commission (Brussels) 18 October 2016. Access Date: 13 November 2016. http://europa.eu/rapid/press-release_IP-16-3441_en.htm

¹²³⁵ EESC - Europe needs to do better for consumers on Geo-blocking, Roaming & Parcel delivery, European Economic and Social Committee (Brussels) 19 October 2016. Access Date: 13 November 2016. <http://www.eesc.europa.eu/?i=portal.en.press-releases.40633>

¹²³⁶ EU Digital Single Market to Tackle Taxation Barriers, Bloomberg Bureau of National Affairs (Washington DC) 10 November 2016. Access Date: 13 November 2016. <http://www.bna.com/eu-digital-single-n57982082564/>