

Preliminary 2020 G20 Extraordinary Virtual Summit Interim Compliance Report

Prepared by

Alessandra Cicci and the G20 Research Group

University of Toronto

Toronto

and

Irina Popova and the Center for International Institutions Research

Russian Presidential Academy of National Economy and Public Administration,

Moscow

From 27 March 2020 to 26 May 2020

14 September 2020

Feedback, as always, is welcome and is kept anonymous.

Unlike the regular annual compliance reports produced by the G20 Research Group and RANEPA, this report has not been sent to stakeholders for review prior to publication. Scores can be recalibrated if new material becomes available that meets the requirements set by the methodology used for monitoring compliance.

**This is therefore a preliminary report
and we encourage readers to send comments to**

G20@utoronto.ca

Contents

Preface	3
Research Team	4
G20 Research Group Team	4
CIIR G20 Research Team	4
Introduction	5
Key Findings	5
Commitment Breakdown	6
Selection of Commitments	6
Interim Compliance Scores	7
Interim Compliance by Member	7
Interim Compliance by Commitment	7
Future Research and Reports	7
Considerations and Limitations	7
Table 1: 2020 G20 Extraordinary Virtual Summit Commitments Selected for Compliance Monitoring	8
Table 2: 2020 G20 Extraordinary Virtual Summit Interim Compliance Scores	9
Table 3: 2020 G20 Extraordinary Virtual Summit Interim Compliance by Member	10
Table 4: 2020 G20 Extraordinary Virtual Summit Interim Compliance by Commitment	10
Table 5: G20 Compliance by Member, 2008–2018	11
Appendix: General Considerations	13
1. Health: Strengthening the World Health Organization	14
2. Health: System Strengthening	45
3. Health: Digital Technologies	64
4. Health: Research and Development	78
5. Global Economy: Policy Tools	104
6. Global Economy: Fiscal Support	153
7. Global Economy: Debt Vulnerabilities	174
8. Labour and Employment: Job and Income Protection	192
9. Trade: Flow of Goods and Services	215
10. Trade: Avoiding Unnecessary Interference	286
11. Finance: Global Cooperation	301

3. Health: Digital Technologies

“[We further commit to work together to] ... leverage digital technologies.”

Extraordinary G20 Leaders’ Summit: Statement on COVID-19

Assessment

	No Compliance	Partial Compliance	Full Compliance
Argentina		0	
Australia		0	
Brazil		0	
Canada	-1		
China	-1		
France	-1		
Germany		0	
India			+1
Indonesia		0	
Italy		0	
Japan		0	
Korea		0	
Mexico	-1		
Russia		0	
Saudi Arabia	-1		
South Africa	-1		
Turkey	-1		
United Kingdom		0	
United States		0	
European Union		0	
Overall Score	-0.30 (35%)		

Background

The role of digital technologies in health governance has received increasing policy attention from G20 leaders, at ministerial meetings and from supporting stakeholders.

On 5 September 2016, at the G20 summit in Hangzhou, China, G20 leaders adopted the G20 Digital Economy Development and Cooperation Initiative. This summit document briefly elucidated the role of information and communication technologies (ICTs) and digital technologies in improving health outcomes and healthcare services.²⁹⁹

On 12 January 2017, the Organisation for Economic Co-operation and Development (OECD) Secretariat published a report entitled “Key Issues for Digital Transformation in the G20.”³⁰⁰ The report was prepared for a joint G20 presidency-OECD conference on this subject, and it analyzed

²⁹⁹ G20 Digital Economy Development and Cooperation Initiative, G20 Information Center (Hangzhou) 5 September 2016. Access Date: 10 May 2020. www.g20.utoronto.ca/2016/160905-digital.html

³⁰⁰ Key Issues for Digital Transformation in the G20, OECD (Berlin) 12 January 2017. Access Date: 10 May 2020. <https://www.oecd.org/g20/key-issues-for-digital-transformation-in-the-g20.pdf>

the potential of digital health technologies to promote social inclusion, improve access to information and care, and deliver quality health outcomes.³⁰¹

Published on 4 October 2018 in Mar del Plata, Argentina, the G20 Health Ministers Declaration under Argentina's presidency noted the importance of developing and operationalizing digital health systems.³⁰²

On 12 February 2019, the World Health Organization (WHO) published a report entitled "WHO Contribution to G20 2019 Presidency on Health-Related Issues." One section of this report presented the Digitalization and New Technologies for Health Working Group's findings and recommendations.³⁰³

On 20 October 2019, the G20 health ministers met in Okayama, Japan. The resulting ministerial declaration emphasized the importance of digital health technologies and information for achieving universal health coverage. The declaration further welcomed the WHO's guidelines on digital health.³⁰⁴

On 30 April 2020, the G20 digital economy ministerial meeting produced the "Extraordinary G20 Digital Economy Ministerial Meeting: COVID-19 Response Statement."³⁰⁵ This statement reaffirmed a commitment made by G20 leaders on 26 March 2020 to leverage digital technologies in light of the COVID-19 pandemic.³⁰⁶ Specifically, the digital economy ministers highlighted research and development of digital technologies for health, recognizing the potential of digital technologies to fight and prevent pandemics. This message echoes a previous G20 health ministerial meeting earlier that month, which similarly discussed digital solutions in current and future pandemics.³⁰⁷

COVID-19 has placed digital health technologies at the forefront of the G20's pandemic response. The present commitment to "[work together to] ... leverage digital technologies" for health is found in the leaders' statement on COVID-19 adopted at the virtual Extraordinary G20 Leaders' Summit on 26 March 2020.³⁰⁸

Commitment Features

Definitions

The G20 commitment is to "[further commit to work together to] ... leverage digital technologies (health)."

³⁰¹ Key Issues for Digital Transformation in the G20, OECD (Berlin) 12 January 2017. Access Date: 10 May 2020.

<https://www.oecd.org/g20/key-issues-for-digital-transformation-in-the-g20.pdf>

³⁰² "Declaration: G20 Meeting of Health Ministers." G20 Information Center (Mar del Plata) 4 October 2018. Access Date: 10 May 2020. www.g20.utoronto.ca/2018/2018-10-04-health.html

³⁰³ WHO Contribution to G20 2019 Presidency on Health-Related Issues, World Health Organization (Geneva) 12 February 2019. Access Date: 10 May 2020. <https://www.who.int/ageing/g20-feb-2019.pdf>

³⁰⁴ Okayama Declaration of the G20 Health Ministers, G20 Information Centre (Okayama) 20 October 2019. Access Date: 10 May 2020. <http://www.g20.utoronto.ca/2019/2019-g20-health.html>

³⁰⁵ Extraordinary G20 Digital Economy Ministerial Meeting: COVID-19 Response Statement, G20 Information Centre (Toronto) 30 April 2020. Access Date: 10 May 2020. <http://www.g20.utoronto.ca/2020/2020-g20-digital-0430.html>

³⁰⁶ Extraordinary G20 Digital Economy Ministerial Meeting: COVID-19 Response Statement, G20 Information Centre (Toronto) 30 April 2020. Access Date: 10 May 2020. <http://www.g20.utoronto.ca/2020/2020-g20-digital-0430.html>

³⁰⁷ G20 Health Ministers Coordinate Efforts to Combat COVID-19. G20 Information Centre (Riyadh) 19 April 2020. Access Date: 11 May 2020. www.g20.utoronto.ca/2020/2020-g20-health-0419.html

³⁰⁸ Extraordinary G20 Leaders' Summit: Statement on COVID-19, G20 Information Centre (Riyadh) 26 March 2020. Access Date: 10 May 2020. www.g20.utoronto.ca/2020/2020-g20-statement-0326.html

The term “commit” is defined as “to do or perform, to pledge or bind (a person or an organization) to a certain course or policy.”³⁰⁹

Concepts

“Leverage” is understood to mean the power to influence and achieve new or better desired results by taking advantage of something already obtained.³¹⁰

“Digital technologies” are interpreted as computerized or electronic tools, systems, devices, and resources that generate, store or process data. Commonly, digital technologies refer to computer-based products, algorithms, or applications, including examples such as data pooling, internet services and artificial intelligence.³¹¹

In the context of this health commitment, digital technologies refer to electronic and internet-based modes of delivering health services and running health systems. According to the WHO, “common uses of digital technologies include searching medical knowledge resources, facilitating clinical support, monitoring quality of care, and mapping and monitoring the spread of infectious diseases, as well as tracking supplies of drugs and vaccines.”³¹² From telemedicine to assistive devices, digital health technologies are instrumental in improving health information systems and addressing structural barriers to positive health outcomes such as distance and socioeconomic disparities.³¹³

In the context of pandemics, digital and data-based tools can support more accurate and timely decision-making for “preventing, detecting, and responding to outbreaks.”³¹⁴ Digital technologies also play a crucial role in informing national capacities of outbreak prediction, projections, and preparedness.

Non-health-related digital technologies are excluded from the scope of this commitment.

General Interpretive Guidelines

G20 leaders are committed to working together and leveraging digital health technologies amidst the global COVID-19 outbreak. Considering the definitions and concepts elaborated above, the crux of this commitment is to cooperate in maximizing the advantages brought by existing and innovative digital health technologies.

In order to differentiate between full and partial compliance, this report uses a depth analysis as per the Compliance Coding Manual.³¹⁵ To fully comply with this commitment, and receive a score of +1, the G20 member must take substantive policy action to work together with other G20 member(s) to leverage digital health technologies. Examples include concrete data-sharing efforts, collectively enhancing epidemic preparedness by analyzing collected data, or jointly strengthening the capacity of

³⁰⁹ Compliance Coding Manual for International Institutional Commitments, Global Governance Program (Toronto) 6 August 2019. Access Date: 10 May 2020. http://www.g7.utoronto.ca/compliance/Compliance_Coding_Manual_2019.pdf.

³¹⁰ Leverage, Cambridge English Dictionary (Cambridge) Access Date: 10 May 2020. <https://dictionary.cambridge.org/dictionary/english/leverage>

³¹¹ The Impact of Digital Technologies, United Nations (New York) Access Date: 10 May 2020. <https://www.un.org/en/un75/impact-digital-technologies>

³¹² Digital Technologies: Shaping the Future of Primary Healthcare, World Health Organization (Geneva) 2018. Access Date: 10 May 2020. <https://www.who.int/docs/default-source/primary-health-care-conference/digital-technologies.pdf>

³¹³ Digital Technologies: Shaping the Future of Primary Healthcare, World Health Organization (Geneva) 2018. Access Date: 10 May 2020. <https://www.who.int/docs/default-source/primary-health-care-conference/digital-technologies.pdf>

³¹⁴ Can Digital Health Help Stop the Next Epidemic? Center for Strategic and International Studies (Washington D.C.) 11 October 2019. Access Date: 10 May 2020. <https://www.csis.org/analysis/can-digital-health-help-stop-next-epidemic>

³¹⁵ Compliance Coding Manual for International Institutional Commitments, Global Governance Program (Toronto) 6 August 2019. Access Date: 10 May 2020. http://www.g7.utoronto.ca/compliance/Compliance_Coding_Manual_2019.pdf.

domestic health systems using digital mechanisms such as artificial intelligence and internet of things technology.³¹⁶ Thus, the key component is working bilaterally and/or multilaterally with other G20 members in leveraging these digital technologies to combat COVID-19.

Actions in which a G20 member only demonstrates a verbal declaration of cooperation will receive a score of 0 for partial compliance. In this scenario, the G20 member is demonstrating support but lacking the threshold of working together substantively, the necessary depth to achieve full compliance. Other examples of partial compliance include public reaffirmations of the commitment in principle, awareness campaigns and other indirect contributors to enhancing the role of digital health technologies. Similarly, if a G20 member leverages digital health technologies on a domestic scale yet fails to work together with its G20 counterparts, a score of 0 will be assigned.

An absence of relevant actions or actions taken against the objectives of this commitment, such as deliberately undermining bilateral and/or multilateral cooperation, will be recognized with a score of -1 for non-compliance.

Actions must have been taken between 27 March 2020 and 26 May 2020 to be counted for compliance.

Scoring Guidelines

-1	G20 member took no action to work together to leverage digital health technologies through concrete data-sharing efforts, collectively enhancing epidemic preparedness by analyzing collected data, or jointly strengthening the capacity of domestic health systems using digital mechanisms such as artificial intelligence and internet of things technology.
0	G20 member took limited action to work together to leverage digital health technologies through concrete data-sharing efforts, collectively enhancing epidemic preparedness by analyzing collected data, or jointly strengthening the capacity of domestic health systems using digital mechanisms such as artificial intelligence and internet of things technology.
+1	G20 member took substantive action to work together to leverage digital health technologies through concrete data-sharing efforts, collectively enhancing epidemic preparedness by analyzing collected data, or jointly strengthening the capacity of domestic health systems using digital mechanisms such as artificial intelligence and internet of things.

Compliance Director: Angela Min Yi Hou

Argentina: 0

Argentina partially complied with its commitment to work together to leverage digital health technologies.

On 27 April 2020, the Ministry of Health implemented the National Digital Health Network to improve the accessibility of universal coverage services and initiatives.³¹⁷ To digitalize and modernize the country’s healthcare infrastructure, the Ministry will use Red Hat Inc.’s open hybrid cloud

³¹⁶ How digital infrastructure can help us through the COVID-19 crisis, World Economic Forum (Geneva) 1 April 2020. Access Date: 12 May 2020. <https://www.weforum.org/agenda/2020/04/digital-infrastructure-public-health-crisis-covid-19/>.

³¹⁷ Argentine Ministry of Health Enlists Red Hat to Help Establish a National Digital Health Network, RedHat (Raleigh) 27 April 2020. Access Date: 24 May 2020. <https://www.redhat.com/es/about/press-releases/argentine-ministry-health-enlists-red-hat-help-establish-national-digital-health-network>

technologies to increase access to clinical records, prescriptions and healthcare information, including up-to-date pandemic developments and COVID-19 case reporting.³¹⁸

Argentina took domestic action to leverage digital health technologies. However, it did not work together with other G20 members in doing so, thus scoring partial compliance.

Thus, Argentina receives a score of 0.³¹⁹

Analyst: Angela Min Yi Hou

Australia: 0

Australia partially complied with its commitment to work together to leverage digital health technologies.

On 29 March 2020, Prime Minister Scott Morrison announced AUD 1.1 billion in funding to increase access to Medicare telehealth services in light of the COVID-19 outbreak. Such services include medical consultations via telephone or video conferencing, mental health treatment, chronic disease management, access to nurse practitioners and more.³²⁰ As part of this arrangement, the federal government lifted insurance reimbursement restrictions on telehealth services, allowing access to such services under Medicare subsidies.³²¹

On 26 April 2020, the government launched Covidsafe, a coronavirus contact tracing mobile application. The application is part of the government's strategy to identify and trace potential COVID-19 carriers and their contacts through Bluetooth technology.³²²

On 1 May 2020, to support national COVID-19 efforts and the digital healthcare industry, the Australian Digital Health Agency launched an innovation challenge to seek solutions in data and healthcare analytics from the digital health, engineering, and biomedical industries.³²³

On 20 May 2020, the government announced an AUD 32 million investment in the Medical Research Future Fund. Of the selected research grantees, two projects are related to digital health technologies: "evidence-based digital technologies for health behaviour" and "a purpose-built digital

³¹⁸ Argentine Ministry of Health Enlists Red Hat to Help Establish a National Digital Health Network, RedHat (Raleigh) 27 April 2020. Access Date: 24 May 2020. <https://www.redhat.com/es/about/press-releases/argentine-ministry-health-enlists-red-hat-help-establish-national-digital-health-network>

³¹⁹ Sources checked include: Ministry of Health and other respective government websites, The Buenos Aires Times, Clarín, and other news sources found through Google News.

³²⁰ All Australians will be able to access telehealth under new \$1.1 billion coronavirus program, The Conversation (Canberra) 28 March 2020. Access Date: 24 May 2020. <https://theconversation.com/all-australians-will-be-able-to-access-telehealth-under-new-1-1-billion-coronavirus-program-134987>

³²¹ Bulk-billed telehealth to combat coronavirus: Australia's big Medicare changes explained, The New Daily (Canberra) 30 March 2020. Access Date: 24 May 2020. <https://thenewdaily.com.au/life/tech/2020/03/30/telehealth-australia-bulk-billed/>

³²² Covid safe: Australian government launches coronavirus tracing app amid lingering privacy concerns, The Guardian. 26 April 2020. Access Date: 24 May 2020. <https://www.theguardian.com/australia-news/2020/apr/26/australias-coronavirus-tracing-app-set-to-launch-today-despite-lingering-privacy-concerns>

³²³ Media release - Future proofing Australia's healthcare: Government launches a nation-wide Innovation Challenge, Australian Government - Australian Digital Health Agency (Canberra) 1 May 2020. Access Date: 24 May 2020. <https://www.digitalhealth.gov.au/news-and-events/news/future-proofing-australia-s-healthcare-government-launches-a-nation-wide-innovation-challenge>

assessment tool to determine the mechanisms driving addictive behaviours and its utility to improve treatment engagement and outcomes.”³²⁴

Although Australia took substantive measures to leverage digital health technologies domestically, it did not work together with other G20 members in doing so, thus scoring partial compliance.

Thus, Australia receives a score of 0.

Analyst: Angela Min Yi Hou

Brazil: 0

Brazil partially complied with its commitment to work together to leverage digital health technologies.

On 18 May 2020, the Ministry of Health announced a partnership with telecommunications provider Embratel to migrate public health website data to cloud storage, in order to ensure data security during the pandemic.³²⁵ This contract will strengthen the country’s digital transformation strategy for 2020-2022.

On 27 May 2020, the Ministry of Science, Technology, Innovations and Communications signed a memorandum of understanding with Cisco. This cooperation included the launch of “Brasil Digital e Inclusivo,” Cisco’s Country Digital Acceleration program to spur innovative healthcare projects. This initiative will support the public healthcare system with telemedicine services and a remote patient monitoring digital platform.³²⁶

Brazil partnered with private sector actors to leverage digital health technologies domestically. However, it did not work together with other G20 members in doing so, thus scoring partial compliance.

Thus, Brazil receives a score of 0.³²⁷

Analyst: Angela Min Yi Hou

Canada: -1

Canada failed to comply with its commitment to work together to leverage digital health technologies.

This report consulted relevant ministry and government websites, major news sources, and COVID-19 government response trackers from Oxford University, Organisation for Economic Co-operation and Development, the International Monetary Fund, and Center for Strategic and International Studies (CSIS). No national government actions were identified within the parameter of the present

³²⁴ \$32 million for the next generation of clinician researchers to pursue critical health and medical research, Australian Government - Department of Health (Canberra) 20 May 2020. Access Date: 24 May 2020. <https://www.health.gov.au/news/32-million-for-the-next-generation-of-clinician-researchers-to-pursue-critical-health-and-medical-research>

³²⁵ Brazil shifts public health websites to the cloud, ZDNet. 18 May 2020. Access Date: 28 May 2020. <https://www.zdnet.com/article/brazil-shifts-public-health-websites-to-the-cloud/>

³²⁶ Government of Brazil signs agreement with Cisco to boost digitization. Cisco. 27 May 2020. Access Date: 28 May 2020. <https://newsroom.cisco.com/feature-content?type=webcontent&articleId=2076852>

³²⁷ Sources consulted include Brazil’s Ministry of Health and other relevant government agencies, as well as news sources found through Google News including Correio Braziliense and Estado de Minas.

commitment to work together on digital health technologies and within the compliance period of 27 March 2020 to 26 May 2020.³²⁸

Thus, Canada receives a score of -1.

Analyst: Angela Min Yi Hou

China: -1

China failed to comply with its commitment to work together to leverage digital health technologies.

This report consulted relevant ministry and government websites, major news sources, and COVID-19 government response trackers from Oxford University, Organisation for Economic Co-operation and Development, the International Monetary Fund, and Center for Strategic and International Studies (CSIS). No national government actions were identified within the parameter of the present commitment to work together on digital health technologies and within the compliance period of 27 March 2020 to 26 May 2020.

Thus, China receives a score of -1.³²⁹

Analyst: Angela Min Yi Hou

France: -1

France failed to comply with its commitment to work together to leverage digital health technologies.

This report consulted relevant ministry and government websites, major news sources, and COVID-19 government response trackers from Oxford University, Organisation for Economic Co-operation and Development, the International Monetary Fund, and Center for Strategic and International Studies (CSIS). No national government actions were identified within the parameter of the present commitment to work together on digital health technologies and within the compliance period of 27 March 2020 to 26 May 2020.

Thus, France receives a score of -1.

Analyst: Angela Min Yi Hou

Germany: 0

Germany partially complied with its commitment to work together to leverage digital health technologies.

On 15 April 2020, the Federal Office of Information Security published security guidelines for mobile and digital health applications, including provisions on personal data protection.³³⁰

On 21 April 2020, the Regulation on the Requirements and Reimbursement Process for Digital Health Applications entered into force. The regulation stipulates information technology security and

³²⁸ Sources consulted include Health Canada, Innovation, Science and Economic Development Canada, and other relevant government websites, as well as major news sources such as CBC and The Globe and Mail, as well a university research websites.

³²⁹ Sources consults include the National Health Commission of the People's Republic of China and other respective government agencies, as well as news sources found through Google News including China Daily.

³³⁰ Digital health apps: German guideline on security requirements, Simmons and Simmons. 28 April 2020. Access Date: 28 May 2020. <https://www.simmons-simmons.com/en/publications/ck9k6nlf7cg709307zz7cxj0/digital-health-apps-german-guideline-on-security-requirements>

privacy requirements for digital health applications that seek insurance reimbursements from state health schemes.³³¹

Although Germany took substantive actions to leverage digital health technologies through new domestic guidelines and regulations, Germany did not work together with other G20 members in doing so, thus demonstrating partial compliance.

Thus, Germany receives a score of 0.

Analyst: Angela Min Yi Hou

India: +1

India fully complied with its commitment to work together to leverage digital health technologies.

On 3 April 2020, India reached out to China, Korea, and Germany to procure tech-driven medical equipment and solutions to the ongoing COVID-19 outbreak. Indian missions in these countries are currently identifying areas of cooperation, engaging relevant authorities to procure medical equipment and technology, and learning from the successes of digital tracking for COVID testing.³³²

India worked together with other G20 counterparts in leveraging digital health technologies during the COVID-19 outbreak, thus scoring full compliance.

Thus, India receives a score of +1.

Analyst: Angela Min Yi Hou

Indonesia: 0

Indonesia partially complied with its commitment to work together to leverage digital health technologies.

On 27 March 2020, the COVID-19 task force announced that it will enhance partnerships with domestic health technology firms by listing 20 telehealth services on its website and creating a digital call centre, Sociomile, to direct call traffic.³³³ Through telehealth, patients can access verified medical guidance, obtain free doctor consultations via video, telephone or text, and receive medication prescriptions and delivery.³³⁴

Indonesia partnered with private sector actors to leverage digital health technologies domestically. However, it did not work together with other G20 members in doing so, thus scoring partial compliance.

³³¹ German Federal Agencies Publish Privacy and IT Security Requirements for Digital Health Applications, Inside Privacy. 7 May 2020. Access Date: 28 May 2020. <https://www.insideprivacy.com/health-privacy/germany-digav-it-security/>

³³² India reaches out to China, South Korea, Germany for tech-driven solutions for COVID-19, India Times. 3 April 2020. Access Date: 28 May 2020. <https://government.economictimes.indiatimes.com/news/technology/india-reaches-out-to-china-south-korea-germany-for-tech-driven-solutions-for-covid-19/74960156>

³³³ Indonesian Health Apps Join Forces for Covid-19 Home Consultations, Jakarta Globe. 27 March 2020. Access Date: 28 May 2020. <https://jakartaglobe.id/tech/indonesian-health-apps-join-forces-for-covid19-home-consultations>

³³⁴ Indonesia leans on health tech start-ups to cope with coronavirus surge, The Straits Times. 10 April 2020. Access Date: 28 May 2020. <https://www.straitstimes.com/asia/se-asia/indonesia-leans-on-healthtech-startups-to-cope-with-coronavirus-surge>

Thus, Indonesia receives a score of 0.³³⁵

Analyst: Angela Min Yi Hou

Italy: 0

Italy partially complied with its commitment to work together to leverage digital health technologies.

On 17 April 2020, the government announced that it will use a mobile application and Bluetooth technology for contact tracing during the COVID-19 outbreak.³³⁶ The application is intended to assist the transition to phase II emergency once the nation-wide lockdown is lifted.

Although Italy took contact tracing measures to leverage digital health technologies domestically, it did not work together with other G20 members in doing so, thus scoring partial compliance.

Thus, Italy receives a score of 0.³³⁷

Analyst: Angela Min Yi Hou

Japan: 0

Japan partially complied with its commitment to work together to leverage digital health technologies.

On 8 May 2020, the government introduced a smartphone contact tracing app, which utilizes Bluetooth signals to notify individuals who have been in close contact with infected persons.³³⁸

Although Japan took contact tracing measures to leverage digital health technologies domestically, it did not work together with other G20 members in doing so, thus scoring partial compliance.

Thus, Japan receives a score of 0.

Analyst: Angela Min Yi Hou

Korea: 0

Korea partially complied with its commitment to work together to leverage digital health technologies.

On 14 May 2020, the Ministry of Small and Medium-Sized Enterprises and Startups announced the designation of additional regulation-free businesses in the field of digital healthcare in Gangwon Province.³³⁹

On 14 May 2020, the Ministry of Economic and Finance temporarily eased restrictions on telemedicine to allow tele-treatment for COVID-19 patients with mild symptoms, in an effort to review a potential deregulation of nationwide telemedicine services.³⁴⁰

³³⁵ Sources consulted include Indonesia's Ministry of Health and other respective government agencies, as well as news sources found through Google News including The Jakarta Post.

³³⁶ Italy to use app to track coronavirus contacts, Anadolu Agency (Rome) 17 April 2020. Access Date: 28 May 2020. <https://www.aa.com.tr/en/europe/italy-to-use-app-to-track-coronavirus-contacts/1808841#>

³³⁷ Sources checked include Italian Ministry of Health Cooperation and other government agencies, as well as news agencies including La Repubblica, The Local, and La Stampa.

³³⁸ Japan Poised to Introduce Coronavirus Contact-Tracing App, Nippon.com (Tokyo) 8 May 2020. Access Date: 28 May 2020. <https://www.nippon.com/en/news/yjj2020050801056/>

³³⁹ Telemedicine push amid Covid-19 meets strong opposition from doctors, Korea Biomedical Review. 15 May 2020. Access Date: 28 May 2020. www.koreabiomed.com/news/articleView.html?idxno=8256

Korea took substantive actions to leverage digital health technologies through domestic regulations and legal changes. However, Korea did not work together with other G20 members in doing so, demonstrating partial compliance.

Thus, Korea receives a score of 0.³⁴¹

Analyst: Angela Min Yi Hou

Mexico: -1

Mexico failed to comply with its commitment to work together to leverage digital health technologies.

This report consulted relevant ministry and government websites, major news sources, and COVID-19 government response trackers from Oxford University, Organisation for Economic Co-operation and Development, the International Monetary Fund, and Center for Strategic and International Studies (CSIS). No national government actions were identified within the parameter of the present commitment to work together on digital health technologies and within the compliance period of 27 March 2020 to 26 May 2020.

Thus, Mexico receives a score of -1.³⁴²

Analyst: Angela Min Yi Hou

Russia: 0

Russia partially complied with its commitment to work together to leverage digital health technologies.

On 30 March 2020, the Russian government announced a draft bill in the Federation Council and Parliament to digitalize healthcare with biometric authentication during the COVID-19 outbreak.³⁴³ This legal change will allow doctors to use telemedicine technologies for remote consultations and improve identification and authentication through electronic signatures and biometric data.

Although Russia took action to leverage digital health technologies domestically, it did not work together with other G20 members in doing so, thus scoring partial compliance.

Thus, Russia receives a score of 0.

Analyst: Angela Min Yi Hou

Saudi Arabia: -1

Saudi Arabia failed to comply with its commitment to work together to leverage digital health technologies.

³⁴⁰ S. Korea to actively consider telemedicine services amid coronavirus pandemic, The Korea Herald (Seoul) 14 May 2020. Access Date: 28 May 2020. www.koreaherald.com/view.php?ud=20200514000688

³⁴¹ Sources consulted include the Ministry of Health and Welfare and other respective government sites, as well as news sources including the Korea Times and the Korea Herald and other sources on Google News.

³⁴² Sources consulted include Mexico's Ministry of Health and other respective government agencies, major research universities, as well as news sources found through Google News, including La Jornada, El Universal and Reforma.

³⁴³ Russian healthcare digitalization bill for remote patients includes biometrics for authentication, Biometric Update (Moscow) 30 March 2020. Access Date: 28 May 2020. <https://www.biometricupdate.com/202003/russian-healthcare-digitalization-bill-for-remote-patients-includes-biometrics-for-authentication>

This report consulted relevant ministry and government websites, major news sources, and COVID-19 government response trackers from Oxford University, Organisation for Economic Co-operation and Development, the International Monetary Fund, and Center for Strategic and International Studies (CSIS). No national government actions were identified within the parameter of the present commitment to work together on digital health technologies and within the compliance period of 27 March 2020 to 26 May 2020.

Thus, Saudi Arabia receives a score of -1 .³⁴⁴

Analyst: Angela Min Yi Hou

South Africa: -1

South Africa failed to comply with its commitment to work together to leverage digital health technologies.

This report consulted relevant ministry and government websites, major news sources, and COVID-19 government response trackers from Oxford University, Organisation for Economic Co-operation and Development, the International Monetary Fund, and Center for Strategic and International Studies (CSIS). No national government actions were identified within the parameter of the present commitment to work together on digital health technologies and within the compliance period of 27 March 2020 to 26 May 2020.³⁴⁵

Thus, South Africa receives a score of -1 .

Analyst: Angela Min Yi Hou

Turkey: -1

Turkey failed to comply with its commitment to work together to leverage digital health technologies.

This report consulted relevant ministry and government websites, major news sources, and COVID-19 government response trackers from Oxford University, Organisation for Economic Co-operation and Development, the International Monetary Fund, and Center for Strategic and International Studies (CSIS). No national government actions were identified within the parameter of the present commitment to work together on digital health technologies and within the compliance period of 27 March 2020 to 26 May 2020.³⁴⁶

Thus, Turkey receives a score of -1 .

Analyst: Angela Min Yi Hou

United Kingdom: 0

United Kingdom partially complied with its commitment to work together to leverage digital health technologies.

In April 2020, the NHSX, the technology and digital unit of the National Health Service (NHS), published its draft Digital Health Technology Standard for public consultation until 22 April 2020.

³⁴⁴ Sources consulted include the Ministry of Health and other respective government agencies, university research sources and news agencies found through Google News including Arab News and Saudi Gazette.

³⁴⁵ Sources consulted include the Department of Health and other respective government agencies, various research institutions, as well as news sources found through Google News including Cape Argus and IOL.

³⁴⁶ Sources consulted include the Ministry of Health and other respective government agencies, various research institutions as well as news sources found through Google News including Hurriyet News.

This draft standard seeks to expedite and streamline the review and commissioning of health technologies for use in the NHS.³⁴⁷

Although the UK took action to leverage digital health technologies domestically, it did not work together with other G20 members in doing so, thus scoring partial compliance.³⁴⁸

Thus, the UK receives a score of 0.

Analyst: Angela Min Yi Hou

United States: 0

The United States partially complied with its commitment to work together to leverage digital health technologies.

On 27 March 2020, the White House Coronavirus Task Force and the US Department of Health and Human Services announced a partnership with Apple Inc.³⁴⁹ This partnership entails an application and website that guide citizens through health-related inquiries, guidance on social distancing, monitoring symptoms, testing recommendations and more.

On 2 April 2020, the Federal Communications Commission announced USD 200 million in funding for the COVID-19 Telehealth Program.³⁵⁰ This program will help “health care providers provide connected care services to patients at their homes or mobile locations” in response to the COVID-19 outbreak.³⁵¹

On 14 April 2020, the Federal Food and Drug Administration published nonbinding recommendations entitled “Enforcement Policy for Digital Health Devices For Treating Psychiatric Disorders During the Coronavirus Disease 2019 (COVID-19) Public Health Emergency.”³⁵² The recommendations cover the scope of two dimensions: 1) computerized behavioral therapy devices and other digital health therapeutic devices for psychiatric disorders and 2) low-risk general wellness and digital health products for mental health or psychiatric conditions.³⁵³

Although the US took action to leverage digital health technologies domestically, it did not work together with other G20 members in doing so, thus scoring partial compliance.

³⁴⁷ Designing and building products and services, NHSX (London) Access Date: 28 May 2020.

<https://www.nhs.uk/key-tools-and-info/designing-and-building-products-and-services/>

³⁴⁸ Sources consulted include the UK’s Department of Health and Social Care as well as other government agencies, major research institutions, and news sources such as the BBC and the Guardian and other sources found through Google News.

³⁴⁹ CDC Statement on COVID-19 Apple App, CDC Newsroom (Washington D.C.) 27 March 2020. Access Date: 28 May 2020. <https://www.cdc.gov/media/releases/2020/s0327-statement-covid-19-apple-app.html>

³⁵⁰ FCC Adopts \$200 Million COVID-19 Telehealth Program, Federal Communications Commission (Washington D.C.) 2 April 2020. Access Date: 29 May 2020. <https://docs.fcc.gov/public/attachments/DOC-363498A1.pdf>

³⁵¹ COVID-19 Telehealth Program, Federal Communications Commission (Washington D.C.) 29 May 2020. Access Date: 29 May 2020. <https://www.fcc.gov/covid-19-telehealth-program>

³⁵² Enforcement Policy for Digital Health Devices For Treating Psychiatric Disorders During the Coronavirus Disease 2019 (COVID-19) Public Health Emergency,” Food and Drug Administration (Washington D.C.) 14 April 2020. Access Date: 29 May 2020. <https://www.fda.gov/media/136939/download>

³⁵³ Enforcement Policy for Digital Health Devices For Treating Psychiatric Disorders During the Coronavirus Disease 2019 (COVID-19) Public Health Emergency,” Food and Drug Administration (Washington D.C.) 14 April 2020. Access Date: 29 May 2020. <https://www.fda.gov/media/136939/download>

Thus, US receives a score of 0.³⁵⁴

Analyst: Angela Min Yi Hou

European Union: 0

The European Union partially complied with its commitment to work together to leverage digital health technologies.

On 1 April 2020, the EU adopted a recommendation on a European electronic health record exchange format. This recommendation facilitates the flow of health data across the borders of EU member states and seeks to enable the digital transformation of healthcare in a digital single market.³⁵⁵

On 8 April 2020, the EU adopted a Commission recommendation “on a common Union toolbox for the use of technology and data to combat and exit from the COVID-19 crisis, in particular concerning mobile applications and the use of anonymised mobility data.”³⁵⁶ The document recognized the role of digital technologies in the COVID-19 crisis and the importance of developing a common EU approach to digital technologies by “involving officials from national regulatory authorities for electronic communications, ministries in charge of digital matters and data protection authorities.”³⁵⁷

On 19 May 2020, the EU announced a budget of EUR 56 million for medical technology, digital tools and artificial intelligence solutions to COVID-19.³⁵⁸ This funding aims to improve response capabilities to the COVID-19 crisis, enhance recovery processes, and strengthen preparedness for future public health emergencies.

On 29 May 2020, the European Council adopted the “Draft Council Conclusions on Shaping Europe’s Digital Future — Preparation for the approval — Decision to use the written procedure.”³⁵⁹ This document emphasizes the post-COVID development of “e-Health, digital education, e-Government, data sharing and broadband connectivity,” digital services and identity.³⁶⁰

The EU took substantive actions to leverage digital health technologies between its member states. However, the EU did not work together with other G20 counterparts in doing so, thus demonstrating partial compliance.

³⁵⁴ Sources consulted include U.S. Department of Health & Human Services, The President and the White House, and other respective government agencies, major research institutions, as well as news sources found through Google News including CNN, The New York Times, the Washington Post and others.

³⁵⁵ Exchange of Electronic Health Records across the EU, European Commission (Brussels) 1 April 2020. Access Date: 28 May 2020. <https://ec.europa.eu/digital-single-market/en/exchange-electronic-health-records-across-eu>

³⁵⁶ Commission Recommendation, European Commission (Brussels) 8 April 2020. Access Date: 28 May 2020. https://ec.europa.eu/info/sites/info/files/recommendation_on_apps_for_contact_tracing_4.pdf

³⁵⁷ Commission Recommendation, European Commission (Brussels) 8 April 2020. Access Date: 28 May 2020. https://ec.europa.eu/info/sites/info/files/recommendation_on_apps_for_contact_tracing_4.pdf

³⁵⁸ Coronavirus response: €56 million for solutions using medical technologies, digital tools and artificial intelligence, European Commission (Brussels) 19 May 2020. Access Date: 29 May 2020. <https://ec.europa.eu/digital-single-market/en/news/coronavirus-response-eu56-million-solutions-using-medical-technologies-digital-tools-and>

³⁵⁹ Document Information, European Council (Brussels) 29 May 2020. Access Date: 29 May 2020. https://www.consilium.europa.eu/register/en/content/out?&typ=ENTRY&i=ADV&DOC_ID=ST-8098-2020-INIT

³⁶⁰ LEAK: EU in push for digital transformation after COVID-19 crisis, Euractiv (Brussels) 6 April 2020. Access Date: 29 May 2020. <https://www.euractiv.com/section/digital/news/leak-eu-in-push-for-digital-transformation-after-covid-19-crisis/>

Thus, the European Union receives a score of 0.³⁶¹

Analyst: Angela Min Yi Hon

³⁶¹ Sources consulted include the European Commission's Public Health website and other respective government sources, major research institutions, and news sources found through Google News.