

2019 G20 Osaka Summit Interim Compliance Report

Prepared by

Sofia Lopez and the G20 Research Group

University of Toronto

Toronto

and

Irina Popova and the Center for International Institutions Research

Russian Presidential Academy of National Economy and Public Administration,

Moscow

From 30 June 2019 to 10 May 2020

14 October 2020

“The University of Toronto ... produced a detailed analysis to the extent of which each G20 country has met its commitments since the last summit ... I think this is important; we come to these summits, we make these commitments, we say we are going to do these things and it is important that there is an organisation that checks up on who has done what.”

— *David Cameron, Prime Minister, United Kingdom, at the 2012 Los Cabos Summit*

Contents

Preface.....	3
Introduction and Summary.....	6
Commitment Breakdown.....	6
Selection of Commitments.....	6
Interim Compliance Scores.....	7
Interim Compliance by Member.....	7
Interim Compliance by Commitment.....	7
Table 1: 2019 G20 Osaka Summit Commitments Selected for Compliance Monitoring.....	8
Table 2: 2019 G20 Osaka Summit Interim Compliance Scores.....	10
Table 3: 2019 G20 Osaka Summit Interim Compliance by Member.....	11
Table 4: 2019 G20 Osaka Summit Interim Compliance by Commitment.....	11
Table 5: G20 Compliance by Member, 2008–2018.....	12
Conclusions.....	14
Future Research and Reports.....	14
Considerations and Limitations.....	14
Appendix: General Considerations.....	15
1. Macroeconomics: Inclusive Growth.....	16
2. Macroeconomics: Exchange Rates.....	83
3. Trade: Open Markets.....	92
4. Trade: Reform of the World Trade Organization.....	109
5. Infrastructure: Quality Infrastructure Investment.....	141
6. Digital Economy: Frameworks.....	183
7. International Taxation: Digitalization.....	201
8. Crime and Corruption: Cyber Resilience.....	215
9. Terrorism: Internet Security.....	237
10. Labour and Employment: Opportunities for Youth.....	268
11. Gender: Education and Training.....	289
12. Gender: Labour Market.....	315
13. Development: Energy.....	350
14. Development: Investment in Human Capital.....	370
15. Health: Ageing Populations.....	416
16. Health: Public Health Preparedness.....	458
17. Environment: Marine Plastic Litter and Microplastics.....	490
18. Climate Change: Financing for Sustainable Development.....	508
19. Climate Change: Innovation.....	528

6. Digital Economy: Frameworks

“We will cooperate to encourage the interoperability of different frameworks [for data free flow with trust]”

G20 Leaders’ Osaka Declaration

Assessment

	No Compliance	Partial Compliance	Full Compliance
Argentina		0	
Australia		0	
Brazil		0	
Canada			+1
China		0	
France			+1
Germany			+1
India			+1
Indonesia			+1
Italy	-1		
Japan			+1
Korea			+1
Mexico			+1
Russia	-1		
Saudi Arabia		0	
South Africa	-1		
Turkey	-1		
United Kingdom			+1
United States		0	
European Union			+1
Average		+0.30 (65%)	

Background

Digitalization is a relatively new addition to the G20 agenda. G20’s initiatives address the most general issues of digital growth. In 2015, G20 members approved national adjusted growth strategies; several of them, including Germany’s, indicated “investing in research ... and expanding the ‘High Tech Strategy’” as a key long-term task.¹¹³⁶ Approving adjusted growth strategies focused on the wide use of digital technologies in various spheres was the first step towards more specific initiatives and commitments. At Antalya, G20 leaders committed to “bridge the digital divide” and also noted that “states have a special responsibility to promote security, stability, and economic ties with other nations” in information communications and technology (ICT).¹¹³⁷

At Hangzhou in 2016, in the G20 Blueprint on Innovative Growth, for the first time G20 leaders addressed the issue of proliferation of the digital economy, which they defined the digital economy as “a broad range of economic activities that includes using digitized information and knowledge as the key factor of production, modern information networks as the important activity space, and the

¹¹³⁶ Adjusted Growth Strategy: Germany. URL: <https://www.ranepa.ru/images/media/g20/2015Antalya/Adjusted-Growth-Strategy-2015-Germany.pdf> (accessed: 22 December 2019)

¹¹³⁷ G20 Leaders’ Communique Antalya Summit. Access date: 22 December 2019. <https://www.ranepa.ru/images/media/g20/2015Antalya/000111117.pdf>

effective use of Information and Communication Technology (ICT) as an important driver for efficiency-enhancing and economic structural optimization.”¹¹³⁸ The leaders pledged to “offer policy support for an open, and secure ICT environment, including recognizing the key role of adequate and effective protection and enforcement of intellectual property rights to the development of the digital economy” by means of “cultivating transparent digital economy policy-making” and “supporting the development and use of international standards.”¹¹³⁹ To facilitate “the G20 agenda on innovation, new industrial revolution and digital economy,” G20 leaders decided to establish a designated task force supported by the Organisation for Economic Co-operation and Development (OECD).¹¹⁴⁰

At Hamburg in 2017, the G20 addressed the issue of digital skills promotion. The #eSkills4Girls Initiative touched on the issue within broader context of development and gender policy.¹¹⁴¹ To facilitate implementing commitments on digital growth, the Digital Economy Task Force (DETF) was established following the decision made in Hangzhou in 2016.¹¹⁴² The leaders concluded with commitments aimed at harnessing digitalization and digital growth such as a pledge to promote digital literacy and digital skills, ensure effective competition to foster investment and innovation, promote effective cooperation of all stakeholders and encourage the development and use of market- and industry-led international standards for digitized production, products and services.¹¹⁴³

During Argentina’s G20 presidency in 2018, the DETF presented political tools for digital growth including the G20 Digital Governance Principles, recommendation for measuring the digital economy, gender equality in digital sphere and digital infrastructure development.¹¹⁴⁴ At Buenos Aires, the G20 leaders pledged to “promote measures to boost micro, small and medium enterprises and entrepreneurs, bridge the digital gender divide and further digital inclusion, support consumer protection, and improve digital government, digital infrastructure and measurement of the digital economy.”¹¹⁴⁵

Japan’s G20 presidency in 2019 greatly expanded the G20 digital agenda. In Osaka, the G20 leaders presented the Statement on Preventing Exploitation of the Internet for Terrorism and Violent Extremism Conducive to Terrorism (VECT), which tackled cyber security.¹¹⁴⁶ In addition, the Osaka

¹¹³⁸ G20 Blueprint on Innovative Growth. URL: <https://www.ranepa.ru/images/media/g20/2016Hangzhou/G20%20Blueprint%20on%20Innovative%20Growth.pdf> (accessed: 22 December 2019)

¹¹³⁹ G20 Blueprint on Innovative Growth. URL: <https://www.ranepa.ru/images/media/g20/2016Hangzhou/G20%20Blueprint%20on%20Innovative%20Growth.pdf> (accessed: 22 December 2019)

¹¹⁴⁰ G20 Leaders' Communique Hangzhou Summit September 5, 2016. URL: <https://www.ranepa.ru/images/media/g20/2016Hangzhou/G20%20Leaders%E2%80%99%20Communique%20Hangzhou%20Summit.pdf> (accessed: 22 December 2019)

¹¹⁴¹ G20 Initiative “#eSkills4Girls”. URL: <https://www.ranepa.ru/images/media/g20/2017hamburg/2017-g20-initiative-eskills4girls-en.pdf> (accessed: 22 December 2019)

¹¹⁴² G20 Leaders' Communique Hangzhou Summit September 5, 2016. URL: <https://www.ranepa.ru/images/media/g20/2016Hangzhou/G20%20Leaders%E2%80%99%20Communique%20Hangzhou%20Summit.pdf> (accessed: 22 December 2019)

¹¹⁴³ G20 Leaders' Hamburg Declaration. URL: https://www.ranepa.ru/images/media/g20/2017hamburg/G20%20Hamburg%20leaders_%20communiqu%C3%A9.pdf (accessed: 22 December 2019)

¹¹⁴⁴ G20 Digital Economy Ministerial Declaration. URL: <https://g20digitalrepo.org/G20%20DETF%20Ministerial%20Declaration%20Salta.pdf> (accessed: 22 December 2019)

¹¹⁴⁵ G20 Leaders' declaration. URL: https://www.ranepa.ru/images/media/g20/2018buenosaires/buenos_aires_leaders_declaration.pdf (accessed: 22 December 2019)

¹¹⁴⁶ G20 Statement on Preventing Exploitation of the Internet for Terrorism and Violent Extremism Conducive to Terrorism (VECT). URL: https://www.ranepa.ru/images/News_ciir/Project/G20_new_downloadings/G20_OSAKA_LEADERS_STATEMENT_ON_PREVENTING_EXPLOITATION_OF_THE_INTERNET_FOR_TERRORISM.pdf (accessed: 22 December 2019)

Declaration on Digital Economy was adopted in which most G20 members (with exception of India, South Africa and Indonesia) declared the launch of the “Osaka track” to promote discussions on “trade-related aspects of electronic commerce at the WTO.”¹¹⁴⁷

Commitment Features

The commitment requires the G20 members to facilitate interoperability — the degree to which two products, programs, etc., can be used together, or the quality of being able to be used together¹¹⁴⁸ — of different legal frameworks, both domestic and international, to harness the opportunities of the digital economy, facilitate data free flow and strengthen consumer and business trust.¹¹⁴⁹ The “framework” in this context refers to a general definition of the term implying “a system of rules, ideas, or beliefs that is used to plan or decide something”¹¹⁵⁰

Thus, to achieve full compliance, a G20 member should take actions to improve its own legal framework and contribute to the development of international legal frameworks that regulate digital economy-related issues. “National” refers to changes in a member’s legislation that are aimed at digital growth, data free flow facilitation or strengthened consumer and business trust. “International” refers to actions taken by a G20 member, or a group of countries including a G20 member, in the form of a proposed initiative to an international or regional organization to tackle issues relating to digital growth, data free flow and trust building, e.g., relevant organizations in the United Nations system, the OECD or the World Trade Organization.

Scoring Guidelines

-1	G20 member does not improve the interoperability of different national or international digital frameworks
0	The G20 member takes actions to improve the interoperability of different digital frameworks, but these actions are either national OR international.
+1	G20 member improves the interoperability of different digital frameworks both nationally and internationally.

Centre for International Institutions Research

Argentina: 0

Argentina has partially complied with the commitment to improve interoperability of different national or international digital frameworks.

On 10 September 2019, the Ministry of Health and Social Development issued Resolution 2524/2019 which approved the Guide for the Unambiguous Identification of Persons in Health. The Secretary of Government also proposes to start, together with the jurisdictions, the path towards a health system that has technologies that facilitate the registration of the information in primary form, during the contact with the patient, in interoperable systems that allow information to be shared between levels of care and jurisdictions, building for each patient a national, longitudinal and complete medical history of clinical, statistical and management utility.¹¹⁵¹

¹¹⁴⁷ Osaka Declaration on Digital Economy. URL: https://www.ranepa.ru/images/News_ciir/Project/G20_new_downloadings/OSAKA_DECLARATION_ON_DIGITAL_ECONOMY_eng.pdf (accessed: 22 December 2019)
¹¹⁴⁸ Cambridge Dictionary. Accessed 13 April 2020. <https://dictionary.cambridge.org/dictionary/english/interoperability>
¹¹⁴⁹ G20 Osaka Leaders’ Declaration. URL: https://www.ranepa.ru/images/News_ciir/Project/G20_new_downloadings/FINAL_G20_Osaka_Leaders_Declaration.pdf (accessed: 22 December 2019)
¹¹⁵⁰ Cambridge dictionary. Accessed 13 April 2020. <https://dictionary.cambridge.org/dictionary/english/framework>
¹¹⁵¹ Resolución 2524/2019, Legislative Information of Agrentina (Buenos Aires) 10 September 2019. Access date: 20 May 2020. <http://servicios.infoleg.gob.ar/infolegInternet/anexos/325000-329999/329903/norma.htm>

On 27 April 2020, Red Hat, Inc., the world's leading provider of open source solutions, announced that the Argentine Ministry of Health implemented a National Digital Health Network to vastly improve accessibility of universal healthcare coverage services and initiatives using Red Hat open hybrid cloud technologies and facilitate interoperability.¹¹⁵²

Argentina is taking steps to improve its national framework to harness the opportunities of the digital economy, but no evidence of Argentina contributing to development of international frameworks has been found.

Thus, it receives a score of 0.

Analyst: Irina Popova

Australia: 0

Australia has partially complied with the commitment to improve interoperability of different national or international digital frameworks.

On 31 October 2019, the Australian National Audit Office (ANAO) released an Auditor-General Report no. 11 detailing the extent to which Australian Government entities have implemented the Digital Continuity 2020 policy adopted in October 2015. One of the policy's goals was to ensure interoperability of information, systems and processes within the government structure. The ANAO concludes, however, that "Australian Government is unlikely to achieve the objectives of the Digital Continuity policy by the end of 2020, and the National Archives of Australia (the Archives) has been largely ineffective in monitoring, assisting, and encouraging entities to meet the targets of the policy."¹¹⁵³

On 23 October 2019, Australia along with Chile, Colombia, Costa Rica, Georgia, Hong Kong (China), Iceland, Israel, Mexico, New Zealand, Norway, Panama, Paraguay, Singapore and Switzerland issued a communication on the Work Programme on Electronic Commerce of the World Trade Organization (WTO), specifically on the subject of moratorium on customs duties on electronic transmissions. Australia and other co-signing WTO members called for an extension of the moratorium until the 12th Ministerial Conference, with a view to ensure "certainty and predictability for business and consumers." The WTO Work Programme on Electronic Commerce has a goal of establishing an international set of norms and standards, regulating transboundary trade in electronic goods and services.¹¹⁵⁴

On 29 November 2019, Australia issued a similar communication, this time in concert with Canada, Chile, Colombia, Costa Rica, Georgia, Guatemala, Hong Kong (China), Iceland, Israel, Republic of Korea, Mexico, New Zealand, Norway, Panama, Paraguay, Singapore, Switzerland, Thailand, and Uruguay.¹¹⁵⁵

No effective actions on improving international digital frameworks interoperability at the national level have been registered during the monitoring period. However, Australia was active with its proposals internationally.

¹¹⁵² Argentine Ministry of Health Enlists Red Hat to Help Establish a National Digital Health Network, Red Hat (Raleigh) 27 April 2020. Access date: 20 May 2020. <https://www.redhat.com/es/about/press-releases/argentine-ministry-health-enlists-red-hat-help-establish-national-digital-health-network>

¹¹⁵³ Implementation of the Digital Continuity 2020 Policy, Australian National Audit Office (Canberra) 31 October 2019, <https://www.anao.gov.au/work/performance-audit/implementation-digital-continuity-2020-policy>.

¹¹⁵⁴ Work Programme and Moratorium on Electronic Commerce, WTO (Geneve) 23 October 2019. Access Date: 18 May 2020. <https://docs.wto.org/dol2fe/Pages/SS/directdoc.aspx?filename=q:/WT/GC/W782R1.pdf>.

¹¹⁵⁵ Work Programme and Moratorium on Electronic Commerce, WTO (Geneve) 29 November 2019. Access Date: 18 May 2020. <https://docs.wto.org/dol2fe/Pages/SS/directdoc.aspx?filename=q:/WT/GC/W782R2.pdf>.

Thus, it is awarded a score of 0 for partial compliance.

Analyst: Andrei Sakharov

Brazil: 0

Brazil has partially complied with the commitment to improve interoperability of different national or international digital frameworks.

On 9 October 2019, decree No. 10,046 was issued. It provides for governance in data sharing within the scope of the federal public administration and institutes the Citizen Base Register and the Central Data Governance Committee. The main goals of the decree are to simplify the provision of public services; guide and optimize the formulation, implementation, evaluation and monitoring of public policies; make it possible to analyze the conditions for accessing and maintaining social and tax benefits; promote the improvement of the quality and reliability of data held by the federal public administration; and increase the quality and efficiency of the internal operations of the federal public administration.¹¹⁵⁶

On 28 November 2019, the Brazilian government published Interoperability Standards for digital government. The architecture of Interoperability Standards (ePING) defines a minimum set of assumptions, policies and technical specifications that regulate the use of Information and Communication Technology in the Federal Government, establishing the conditions for interaction with other Powers and spheres of government and with the society in general.¹¹⁵⁷

Brazil is taking steps to improve its national framework to harness the opportunities of the digital economy, but no evidence of Brazil contributing to development of international frameworks has been found.

Thus, it receives a score of 0.

Analyst: Irina Popova

Canada: +1

Canada has fully complied with the commitment to improve interoperability of different national or international digital frameworks.

On 7 August 2019, the Government of Canada released the National Cyber Security Action Plan and re-launched the Cyber Security Cooperation Program. The latter is designed to support projects aimed at improving Canada's cyber systems to increase innovation and cooperation including through establishing international partnerships.¹¹⁵⁸

On 4 September 2019, Canada issued a communication to the World Trade Organization (WTO) within the electronic commerce track on Preventing the Use of Personal Information from being used for the Discrimination or Persecution of Natural Persons. In the communication Canada stated, that it continued to adapt and modernize its approach to digital trade policy and expressed its interest

¹¹⁵⁶ Decree No. 10,046, of October 9, 2019, Presidency of the Republic Sub-General Secretariat for Legal Affairs (Brasilia) 9 October 2019. Access date: 19 May 2020. http://www.planalto.gov.br/ccivil_03/_Ato2019-2022/2019/Decreto/D10046.htm

¹¹⁵⁷ Interoperability Standards, Government of Brazil (Brasilia) 28 November 2019. Access date: 19 May 2020. <https://www.gov.br/governodigital/pt-br/governanca-de-dados/padroes-de-interoperabilidade>

¹¹⁵⁸ The Government of Canada advances cyber security innovation and cooperation, Government of Canada (Ottawa) 7 August 2019. Access Date: 18 May 2020. <https://www.canada.ca/en/public-safety-canada/news/2019/08/the-government-of-canada-advances-cyber-security-innovation-and-cooperation.html>.

in strengthening provisions related to the protection of personal information under the WTO Joint Statement Initiative on E-commerce. Canada proposed to include the following passage into the potential international arrangement on the issue: “No Party/Member shall use the personal information of users of digital trade to persecute or discriminate against a natural person on the basis of race, colour, sex, sexual orientation, gender, language, religion, political or other opinion, national or social origin, property, birth or other status, or disability.”¹¹⁵⁹

On 9 October 2019, Canada and New Zealand issued a joint communication to the WTO on the Transparency in WTO negotiations and application to the Joint Statement Initiative (JSI) e-commerce negotiations. The communication called for increased transparency of the JSI negotiation process, including the publishing of records of meetings and other documentation.¹¹⁶⁰

On 29 November 2019, Canada issued a communication, in concert with Australia, Chile, Colombia, Costa Rica, Georgia, Guatemala, Hong Kong (China), Iceland, Israel, Republic of Korea, Mexico, New Zealand, Norway, Panama, Paraguay, Singapore, Switzerland, Thailand, and Uruguay. In this communication on the WTO Work Programme on Electronic Commerce, Canada and other co-signing WTO members called for an extension of the moratorium until the 12th Ministerial Conference, with a view to ensure “certainty and predictability for business and consumers.” The WTO Work Programme on Electronic Commerce has a goal of establishing an international set of norms and standards, regulating transboundary trade in electronic goods and services.¹¹⁶¹

On 21 January 2020, Bank of Canada, the Bank of England, the Bank of Japan, the European Central Bank, the Sveriges Riksbank and the Swiss National Bank, together with the Bank for International Settlements (BIS), have created a group to share experiences as they assess the potential cases for central bank digital currency in their home jurisdictions. The group will assess those cases; economic, functional and technical design choices, including cross-border interoperability; and the sharing of knowledge on emerging technologies. It will closely coordinate with the relevant institutions and forums — in particular, the Financial Stability Board and the Committee on Payments and Market Infrastructures.¹¹⁶²

On 10 February 2020, Canada, New Zealand and Ukraine issued a joint communication to the WTO on the Transparency in WTO negotiations and application to the JSI e-commerce negotiations. The communication called for increased transparency of the JSI negotiation process, including the publishing of records of meetings and other documentation.¹¹⁶³

Canada took actions to improve interoperability of different frameworks at both national and international levels.

¹¹⁵⁹ Joint Statement on Electronic Commerce Communication from Canada Concept Paper — Preventing the Use of Personal Information from being used for the Discrimination or Persecution of Natural Persons, WTO (Geneva) 10 September 2019. Access Date: 18 May 2020.

<https://docs.wto.org/dol2fe/Pages/SS/directdoc.aspx?filename=q:/INF/ECOM/39.pdf>.

¹¹⁶⁰ Joint Statement on Electronic Commerce — Communication from New Zealand and Canada — Non paper — Transparency in WTO negotiations and application to the JSI, WTO (Geneva) 9 October 2019. Access Date: 18 May 2020. <https://docs.wto.org/dol2fe/Pages/SS/directdoc.aspx?filename=q:/INF/ECOM/42R1.pdf>.

¹¹⁶¹ Work Programme and Moratorium on Electronic Commerce, WTO (Geneve) 29 November 2019. Access Date: 18 May 2020. <https://docs.wto.org/dol2fe/Pages/SS/directdoc.aspx?filename=q:/WT/GC/W782R2.pdf>.

¹¹⁶² Central bank group to assess potential cases for central bank digital currencies, Bank Of Japan (Tokyo) 21 January 2020. Access date: 20 May 2020. https://www.boj.or.jp/en/announcements/release_2020/rel200121a.htm/

¹¹⁶³ Joint Statement on Electronic Commerce — Communication from New Zealand, Canada and Ukraine — Non paper — Transparency in WTO negotiations and application to the JSI, WTO (Geneva) 10 February 2020. Access Date: 18 May 2020. <https://docs.wto.org/dol2fe/Pages/SS/directdoc.aspx?filename=q:/INF/ECOM/42R2.pdf>.

Thus, it is awarded a score of +1.

Analyst: Andrei Sakharov

China: 0

China has partially complied with the commitment on improvement of interoperability of different national or international frameworks.

On 26 October 2019, China approved the first national law on encryption. The regulation came into force on the 1 January 2020. It broadens the current regulatory scope of encryption, liberalizes commercial encryption at national-law level and proposes a market-oriented regulatory regime for the commercial encryption industry.¹¹⁶⁴

On 6 November 2019, China launched six new pilot zones for innovation and development of the digital economy. These zones are said to serve as the mechanism to optimize the allocation of data and to keep up government regulation with new issues emerging from the fast growth in the digital economy.¹¹⁶⁵

China is taking steps to improve its national framework to harness the opportunities of the digital economy, but no evidence of China contributing to development of international frameworks has been found.

Thus, China receives a score of 0.

Analyst: Alexander Ignatov

France: +1

France has fully complied with the commitment on improvement of interoperability of different national or international frameworks.

On 30 March 2020, the French Tax Authority issued draft guidance on the scope and computation of the new digital services tax (DST) and the related compliance issues. Services subject to the tax include targeted online advertising, including the sale of user data; and online 'digital intermediation' services such as platforms and marketplaces. Each category has its own set of rules in terms of territoriality and computation of the ratio of French-deemed services (the French presence ratio).¹¹⁶⁶

On 26 December 2019, the French Financial Markets Authority published new regulations concerning the licensing of digital assets providers. Licensed providers are required to have professional indemnity insurance or a minimum amount of reserve funds, at least one effective senior manager, resilient information technology systems, an internal control system, a claims handling procedure, an organization enabling it to avoid conflicts of interests and procedures to prevent money laundering and terrorist financing.¹¹⁶⁷

¹¹⁶⁴ China Cybersecurity and Data Protection: China publishes first law on encryption, Lexology (London) 12 November 2019. Access date: 24 March 2020. <https://www.lexology.com/library/detail.aspx?g=53282dfc-c7f6-4cef-8de6-8f180fed8b31>

¹¹⁶⁵ China to push public data sharing in digital economy pilot zones, Xinhua (Beijing) 06 November 2019. Access date: 24 March 2020.: http://www.xinhuanet.com/english/2019-11/06/c_138533926.htm

¹¹⁶⁶ France issues comprehensive draft guidance on digital services tax, the Society of Trust and Estate Practitioners (London) 16 April 2020. Access date: 15 May 2020. <https://www.step.org/news/france-issues-comprehensive-draft-guidance-digital-services-tax>

¹¹⁶⁷ Crypto Firms Can Now Apply for a License in France, Yahoo Finance 26 December 2019. Access date: 03 April 2020. <https://finance.yahoo.com/news/crypto-firms-now-apply-license-170000940.html>

On 22 August 2019, France and India presented a Roadmap on Cybersecurity and Digital Technology. India and France affirmed their willingness to reinforce cooperation, notably through the sharing of information between their cybersecurity agencies, in order to prevent malicious activities, undertake immediate corrective response, mitigate their potential impact and identify their causes. Recognizing the need to strengthen the security of digital processes, products and services, France and India intend to share information on the legal and regulatory framework and best practices, including on the protection of economic information infrastructure impacting national security, and on testing and certification of digital products. In this context, France and India intend to work together on the risks associated with the deployment of 5G technologies and the technical solutions adopted to deal with them.¹¹⁶⁸

France is taking steps to improve both national and international frameworks to harness the opportunities of the digital economy.

Thus, France receives a score of +1.

Analyst: Alexander Ignatov

Germany: +1

Germany has fully complied with the commitment on digitalization.

On 6 November 2019, German federal ministry for economic affairs and energy and the ministry of economy, trade and industry of Japan issued a joint statement on economic policy and cooperation. Both sides committed to accelerating discussions on a digital economy, including international rule-making on trade-related aspects of electronic commerce at the World Trade Organization, under the “Osaka Track” launched at the margin of the G20 Osaka Summit. They mentioned that this work would be guided in particular by the concept of data free flow with trust, and thus both sides would work together to enhance trust concerning data security, while respecting each other’s respective regulatory framework.¹¹⁶⁹

On 19 February 2020, the European Commission presented the European data strategy. The strategy provides for measure to ensure free flow of data within the European Union and free and safe flow of data with third countries, subject to exceptions and restrictions for public security, public order and other legitimate public policy objectives of the European Union, in line with international obligations.¹¹⁷⁰

Germany has taken actions to improve interoperability of different frameworks at both national and international levels.

Thus, it receives a score of +1.

Analyst: Andrey Shelepov

¹¹⁶⁸ Indo-French Roadmap on Cybersecurity and Digital Technology. Government of India Ministry of Foreign Affairs (New Delhi) 22 August 2019. Access date: 03 April 2020. <https://mea.gov.in/bilateral-documents.htm?dtl/31757/IndoFrench+Roadmap+on+Cybersecurity+and+Digital+Technology+August+22+2019>

¹¹⁶⁹ Joint Statement of the Federal Ministry for Economic Affairs and Energy of the Federal Republic of Germany and the Ministry of Economy, Trade and Industry of Japan on economic policy and cooperation, German federal ministry for economic affairs and energy 6 November 2019. Access Date: 3 April 2020. https://www.bmwi.de/Redaktion/EN/Downloads/joint-statement-on-economic-policy-and-cooperation.pdf?__blob=publicationFile&v=2.

¹¹⁷⁰ A European strategy for data, European Commission 19 February 2020. Access Date: 3 April 2020. https://ec.europa.eu/info/sites/info/files/communication-european-strategy-data-19feb2020_en.pdf.

India: +1

India has fully complied with the commitment improvement of interoperability of different national or international frameworks.

On 2 August 2019, the Department of Consumer Affairs, Ministry of Consumer Affairs, Food and Public Distribution issued the e-commerce guidelines for consumer protection, 2019 in order to safeguard the interest of the consumers. The guidelines are only applicable to business-to-customer (B2C) e-commerce entities. The Guidelines are also applicable to all B2C e-commerce entities involved in digital content products.¹¹⁷¹

On 22 August 2019, France and India presented a Roadmap on Cybersecurity and Digital Technology. India and France affirmed their willingness to reinforce cooperation, notably through the sharing of information between their cybersecurity agencies, in order to prevent malicious activities, undertake immediate corrective response, mitigate their potential impact and identify their causes. Recognizing the need to strengthen the security of digital processes, products and services, France and India intend to share information on the legal and regulatory framework and best practices, including on the protection of economic information infrastructure impacting national security, and on testing and certification of digital products. In this context, France and India intend to work together on the risks associated with the deployment of 5G technologies and the technical solutions adopted to deal with them.¹¹⁷²

On 4 December 2019, the cabinet of Prime Minister Narendra Modi approved a data protection bill for tabling in parliament, taking the country a step closer to framing a privacy law. The bill mandates that personal data categorized as sensitive will be stored or processed only in India, the source said, declining to be named as details about the bill in its current form are not public. It also says that data deemed sensitive will have to be stored in India but can be processed outside of the country.¹¹⁷³

India is taking steps to improve both national and international frameworks to harness the opportunities of the digital economy.

Thus, it receives a score of +1.

Analyst: Irina Popova

Indonesia: +1

Indonesia has fully complied with the commitment improvement of interoperability of different national or international frameworks.

On 17 August 2019, Bank of Indonesia launched a quick response (QR) code standard for payments through server-based e-money applications, electronic wallets and mobile banking known as QR Code Indonesian Standard (QRIS). National QRIS implementation will be effective from 1st January 2020 in order to provide an adequate transition period for payment system service providers to

¹¹⁷¹ Advisory to State Governments / Union Territories: Model Framework for Guidelines on e-Commerce for consumer protection, Government of India Ministry of Consumer Affairs, Food & Public Distribution (Department of Consumer Affairs) (Delhi) 2 August 2019. Access date: 19 May 2020. <https://consumeraffairs.nic.in/sites/default/files/file-uploads/latestnews/Guidelines%20on%20e-Commerce.pdf>

¹¹⁷² Indo-French Roadmap on Cybersecurity and Digital Technology. Government of India Ministry of Foreign Affairs (New Delhi) 22 August 2019. Access date: 03 April 2020. <https://mea.gov.in/bilateral-documents.htm?dtl/31757/IndoFrench+Roadmap+on+Cybersecurity+and+Digital+Technology+August+22+2019>

¹¹⁷³ India's cabinet clears data protection bill for tabling in parliament, CNBC 4 December 2019. Access date: 19 May 2020. <https://www.cnbc.com/2019/12/04/reuters-america-update-1-indias-cabinet-clears-data-protection-bill-for-tabling-in-parliament.html>

prepare for the new standard. QRIS launching is part of the roll-out of the Indonesian Payment System Vision for 2025, announced in May 2019. QRIS was compiled by Bank Indonesia along with the Indonesia Payment System Association, using EMV Co. 1 international standards to support broader payment system instrument interconnectedness and accommodate the specific needs of Indonesia, thus providing interoperability between providers, instruments and other countries.¹¹⁷⁴

On 28 November 2019, Bank Indonesia issued a blueprint titled Bank Indonesia: Menavigasi Sistem Pembayaran Nasional di Era Digital (Bank Indonesia: Navigating the National Payment System in the Digital Era) as a follow-up to Indonesia's 2025 Payment System Visions that were introduced in May this year. Through the 2025 visions, Bank Indonesia intends to: support the integration of national digital economy and finance, support banking digitalization, guarantee the interlink between fintech and banking, ensure there is a balance between innovation, consumer protection and healthy business competition, safeguard national interests in cross-border digital economy and finance. It is planned that Bank Indonesia, together with industry, will develop an integrated payment interface to ensure interoperability from the transaction's starting point.¹¹⁷⁵

On 1 February 2020, Bank Indonesia made a deal with Bangko Sentral ng Pilipinas to boost their ties in improving payment systems and digital financial innovation. The deal complements the previous central banks' cooperation related to anti-money laundering and preventing terrorism financing in the field of payment systems. In a joint statement, the central banks said their Memorandum of Understanding looks to "provide a framework of closer cooperation between the two central banks" in order to attain a "more secure, efficient and reliable payment system, and to promote digital financial innovation."¹¹⁷⁶

Indonesia taking steps to improve both national and international framework to harness the opportunities of the digital economy.

Thus, it receives a score of +1.

Analyst: Irina Popova

Italy: -1

Italy has failed to comply with the commitment to improve interoperability of different national or international digital frameworks.

No actions on improving international digital frameworks interoperability at the national or international level have been registered during the monitoring period.

Thus, Italy is awarded a score of -1.¹¹⁷⁷

Analyst: Andrei Sakbarov

¹¹⁷⁴ QRIS, One QR Code for all Payments, Bank of Indonesia (Jakarta) 17 August 2019. Access date: 20 May 2020. https://www.bi.go.id/en/ruang-media/siaran-pers/Pages/SP_216219.aspx

¹¹⁷⁵ Indonesia Payment Systems Blueprint 2025 Bank Indonesia: Navigating the National Payment Systems in the Digital Era, Bank Indonesia (Jakarta) 28 November 2019. Access date: 20 May 2020. <https://www.bi.go.id/en/publikasi/sistem-pembayaran/riset/Documents/Indonesia-Payment-Systems-Blueprint-2025.pdf>

¹¹⁷⁶ Indonesia, Philippines Central Bank Inks Deal on Payment Systems, TheInsiderStories (Jakarta) 1 February 2020. Access date: 20 May 2020. <https://theinsiderstories.com/indonesia-philippines-central-bank-inks-deal-on-payment-systems/>

¹¹⁷⁷ Websites of Italy's Ministry of Digital Infrastructure and Information Technology, Ministry of Economic Development and national government as well as open sources were searched.

Japan: +1

Japan has fully complied with the commitment on digitalization.

On 10-11 October 2019, Ministry of Economy, Trade and Industry (METI), the Ministry of Internal Affairs and Communications, the National Center of Incident readiness and Strategy for Cybersecurity, the Personal Information Protection Commission, the Ministry of Foreign Affairs) and other organizations jointly participated in a U.S.-Japan Policy Cooperation Dialogue on the Internet Economy (the tenth director general-level meeting) which was held in Tokyo. The dialogue included discussions with private sector representatives from both countries on “promotion of open, interoperable, reliable, and secure fifth generation mobile technologies (5G) networks and services”; “public-private cooperation on the deployment in third countries of digital infrastructure and services”; “international coordination on areas such as sharing of best practices of Internet of Things (IoT) security and promotion of free flows of data”; and “public-private partnership regarding the social implementation of artificial intelligence (AI) in a manner that fosters public trust in AI.”¹¹⁷⁸

On 6 November 2019, the German federal ministry for economic affairs and energy and METI issued a joint statement on economic policy and cooperation. Both sides committed to accelerating discussions on a digital economy, including international rule-making on trade-related aspects of electronic commerce at the World Trade Organization, under the Osaka Track launched at the margin of the G20 Osaka Summit. They mentioned that this work would be guided in particular by the concept of data free flow with trust, and thus both sides would work together to enhance trust concerning data security, while respecting each other’s respective regulatory framework.¹¹⁷⁹

On 20 December 2019, METI announced that in response to Japan’s submission to the ISO/IEC Joint Technical Committee of a proposal for developing new international standards for enhancing data collaboration among IoT systems, the committee decided to advance deliberations on standardization of the proposed technology. These new standards are expected to: encourage different industrial fields to mutually utilize IoT equipment among their systems; help companies reduce costs for system development; and encourage companies to collaboratively develop IoT systems.¹¹⁸⁰

On 27 December 2019, METI revised the Cybersecurity Guidelines for Energy Resource Aggregation Business, a compilation of cybersecurity measures that companies participating in the energy resource aggregation business (ERAB) framework should take. The first key point of the revision is dedicated to securing interoperability of cyber physical systems. The ERAB system aims not only to protect information but also to secure resilience to encourage electricity systems to continue to work physically, and to this end, the revised guidelines additionally require ERAB companies to formulate security measures for entire supply chains.¹¹⁸¹

¹¹⁷⁸ Tenth U.S.-Japan Policy Cooperation Dialogue on the Internet Economy Held, Ministry of Economy, Trade and Industry of Japan (Tokyo) 18 October 2019. Access date: 20 May 2020. https://www.meti.go.jp/english/press/2019/1018_005.html

¹¹⁷⁹ Joint Statement of the Federal Ministry for Economic Affairs and Energy of the Federal Republic of Germany and the Ministry of Economy, Trade and Industry of Japan on economic policy and cooperation, German federal ministry for economic affairs and energy 6 November 2019. Access Date: 3 April 2020. https://www.bmwi.de/Redaktion/EN/Downloads/joint-statement-on-economic-policy-and-cooperation.pdf?__blob=publicationFile&v=2.

¹¹⁸⁰ Development of New International Standards for Vitalizing IoT, Ministry of Economy, Trade and Industry of Japan (Tokyo) 20 December 2019. Access date: 20 May 2020. https://www.meti.go.jp/english/press/2019/1220_004.html

¹¹⁸¹ Cybersecurity Guidelines for Energy Resource Aggregation Business Revised, Ministry of Economy, Trade and Industry of Japan (Tokyo) 27 December 2019. Access date: 20 May 2020. https://www.meti.go.jp/english/press/2019/1227_005.html

On 21 January 2020, Bank of Canada, the Bank of England, the Bank of Japan, the European Central Bank, the Sveriges Riksbank and the Swiss National Bank, together with the Bank for International Settlements, have created a group to share experiences as they assess the potential cases for central bank digital currency in their home jurisdictions. The group will assess the cases; economic, functional and technical design choices, including cross-border interoperability; and the sharing of knowledge on emerging technologies. It will closely coordinate with the relevant institutions and forums — in particular, the Financial Stability Board and the Committee on Payments and Market Infrastructures.¹¹⁸²

Japan has taken actions to improve interoperability of different frameworks at both national and international levels.

Thus, it receives a score of +1.

Analyst: Irina Popova

Korea: +1

Korea has fully complied with the commitment improvement of interoperability of different national or international frameworks.

On 5 March 2020, the National Assembly passed a new legislation on cryptocurrency trading. The regulation authorizes Korea's financial regulators to effectively oversee the growing industry and develop rules around anti-money laundering among other processes.¹¹⁸³

On 18 May 2020, the Financial Services Commission of Korea unveiled the 5th Plan for Financial Hub Policy for 2020–2022. The specific strategies include pursuing regulatory reforms to promote private sector-driven innovation, building infrastructure to continue innovative growth in the financial industry and adopting a “selection and concentration” approach to build global capacity with a particular attention paid to the ASEAN markets. Among the main pillars of the policy, the key factors are the development of the digital financial technologies and promotion of anti-money laundering framework.¹¹⁸⁴

Korea is taking steps to improve both national and international framework to harness the opportunities of the digital economy.

Thus, it receives a score of +1.

Analyst: Alexander Ignatov

Mexico: +1

Mexico has fully complied with the commitment to improve interoperability of different national or international digital frameworks.

On 14 August 2019, the Official Office of the Ministry of Finance and Public Credit and the Tax Administration Service signed a collaboration agreement for the interoperability, exchange of

¹¹⁸² Central bank group to assess potential cases for central bank digital currencies, Bank Of Japan (Tokyo) 21 January 2020. Access date: 20 May 2020. https://www.boj.or.jp/en/announcements/release_2020/rel200121a.htm/

¹¹⁸³ "암호화폐 거래 제도화" 특금법 통과..향후 쟁점은 (Special Act on Institutionalization of Cryptocurrency trading Passed), DAUM (Seoul) 05 March 2020. Access date: 18 May 2020. <https://news.v.daum.net/v/20200305173114246>

¹¹⁸⁴ FSC Unveils 5th Plan for Financial Hub Policy, Financial Services Commission (Seoul) 18 May 2020. Access date: 18 May 2020. http://meng.fsc.go.kr/common/pdfjs/web/viewer.html?file=/upload/press1/20200518111610_58dffdf1.pdf

information and automation of the Electronic System of Public Government Information on acquisitions, leases, public works and services related.¹¹⁸⁵

On 5 September 2019, the Executive Secretariat of the National Anticorruption System presented the beta version of the National Digital Platform (PDN), which contains data for Public Server Systems that intervene in contracting processes and the System of Public and Private Servants Sanctioned, provided by the Ministry of Public Function and the State of Mexico. The PDN is an interoperability tool that will work with the input of data from government agencies at the state and federal levels, as well as from autonomous agencies, to exchange strategic information to prevent and punish possible acts of corruption.¹¹⁸⁶

On 11 September 2019, the 16th meeting of the Latin American and Caribbean Council on Civil Registry, Identity and Vital Statistics took place. General Director of the Mexican National Registry of Population and Identity Jorge Wheatley Fernández rendered the report on progress on the management of regulations, data protection and diversity, including a project on preparing the legal document to the interoperability of the databases. These projects will help strengthen the mechanisms for exchanging information between member countries and obtaining best practices that contribute to guaranteeing the right to identity in the region.¹¹⁸⁷

On 18 September 2019, National Telecommunications and Antennas Laboratory of the National Polytechnic Institute collaborated with the Secretariat of Communications and Transportation in the implementation of the model and in the development of test protocols. The results of these tests demonstrated that interoperability between different technologies is currently possible only at the voice level.¹¹⁸⁸

On 29 November 2019, the Digital Agency for Public Innovation presented the Digital Citizenship Plan. It is a road map for digital transformation and innovation whose general objective is to strengthen the relationship between citizens and the city government. One key element is the Interoperability Track. It suggests standards for consultation of information and documents between public entities, which guarantee the security and confidentiality of the information and allow the interaction of the systems of the entities.¹¹⁸⁹

Mexico is taking steps to improve both national and international framework to harness the opportunities of the digital economy.

Thus, it receives a score of +1.

Analyst: Irina Popova

¹¹⁸⁵Comunicado No. 076 Firman convenio la Oficialía Mayor de la SHCP y el SAT, Mexican Government (Mexico City) 14 August 2019. Access date: 19 May 2020. <https://www.gob.mx/shcp/prensa/comunicado-no-076-firman-convenio-la-oficialia-mayor-de-la-shcp-y-el-sat?idiom=es-MX>

¹¹⁸⁶Lanza Sesna Versión Beta De Plataforma Digital Nacional, Mexican Government (Mexico City) 5 September 2019. Access date: 19 May 2020. <https://www.gob.mx/sesna/prensa/lanza-sesna-version-beta-de-plataforma-digital-nacional>

¹¹⁸⁷XVI Encuentro del Consejo Latinoamericano y del Caribe de Registro Civil, Identidad y Estadísticas Vitales, Mexican Government (Mexico City) 11 September 2019. Access date: 19 May 2020. <https://www.gob.mx/segob%7Crenapo/articulos/xvi-encuentro-del-consejo-latinoamericano-y-del-caribe-de-registro-civil-identidad-y-estadisticas-vitales>

¹¹⁸⁸Condujo la SCT procesos y pruebas en apoyo a la modernización de redes de seguridad pública, Mexican Government (Mexico City) 18 September 2019. Access date: 19 May 2020. <https://www.gob.mx/sct/prensa/condujo-la-sct-procesos-y-pruebas-en-apoyo-a-la-modernizacion-de-redes-de-seguridad-publica>

¹¹⁸⁹Presentación del Plan de Ciudadanía Digital, Digital Agency for Public Innovation (Mexico) 29 November 2019. Access date: 19 May 2020. <https://adip.cdmx.gob.mx/comunicacion/nota/presentacion-del-plan-de-ciudadania-digital>

Russia: -1

Russia has failed to comply with the commitment on digitalization.

No facts of Russia's actions to improve interoperability of different frameworks for the flow of data at either national or international level have been registered during the compliance period.

Thus, Russia receives a score of -1.¹¹⁹⁰

Analyst: Andrey Shelepov

Saudi Arabia: 0

Saudi Arabia has partially complied with the commitment on improvement of interoperability of different national or international frameworks.

On 26 July 2019, Saudi Arabia issued the e-commerce law to regulate and oversee the transactions conducted online. The primary objective is to regulate the practice of e-commerce by increasing transparency, ensuring consumer protection and enhancing trust in online transactions.¹¹⁹¹

On 27 August 2019, the Council of Ministers of Saudi Arabia issued a five-year strategy for the information and communication technology sector. The strategy includes an ambitious action plan to attract leading international companies in the priority areas of emerging technologies, increase the share of local content in the information technology sector, improve the technical skills of the relevant local workforce, enhance technical and digital knowledge, drive technical innovation through the promotion of research and development in Saudi Arabia's startup ecosystem, enable the development of mega projects, as well as to support coordination and synergy between the relevant entities in information and communications technologies in the public and private sectors.¹¹⁹²

On 25 February 2020, the Saudi Arabian Monetary Authority released additional licensing guidelines and criteria for digital-only banks operating in Saudi Arabia. Guidelines for digital-only banks include that applicants for licenses must be set up as a locally incorporated joint-stock company and maintain a physical presence in Saudi Arabia.¹¹⁹³

Saudi Arabia is taking steps to improve its national framework to harness the opportunities of the digital economy, but no evidence of Saudi Arabia contributing to development of international frameworks has been found.

Thus, Saudi Arabia receives a score of 0.

Analyst: Alexander Ignatov

¹¹⁹⁰ Websites of the national government, President of Russia, Ministry of Ministry of Digital Development and Mass Communications of the Russian Federation as well as open sources were searched.

¹¹⁹¹ Saudi Arabia: Saudi Arabia introduces New E-Commerce Law, Mondaq 24 September 2019. Access date: 30 March 2020. <https://www.mondaq.com/saudi-arabia/Consumer-Protection/847524/Saudi-Arabia-introduces-New-E-Commerce-Law>

¹¹⁹² Saudi Arabia's ICT Strategy Shapes The Future Of Innovation And Digital Economy, Says Minister Al-Swaha, Ministry of Communications and Information Technology 27 August 2019. Access date: 30 March 2020. <https://www.mcit.gov.sa/en/media-center/news/175651>

¹¹⁹³ Saudi central bank issues additional licensing guidelines for digital-only banks, Salaam Gateway 25 February 2020. Access date: 30 March 2020. <https://www.salaamgateway.com/story/saudi-central-bank-issues-additional-licensing-guidelines-for-digital-only-banks>

South Africa: -1

South Africa has failed to comply with the commitment on improvement of interoperability of different national or international frameworks.

No record proving that South Africa is taking steps to improve its national or international framework to harness the opportunities of the digital economy has been found.

Thus, South Africa receives a score of -1.¹¹⁹⁴

Analyst: Alexander Ignatov

Turkey: -1

Turkey has failed to comply with the commitment on improvement of interoperability of different national or international frameworks.

No record proving that Turkey is taking steps to improve its national or international framework to harness the opportunities of the digital economy has been found.

Thus, it receives a score of -1.¹¹⁹⁵

Analyst: Pavel Doronin

United Kingdom: +1

The United Kingdom has fully complied with the commitment on digitalization.

On 9 October 2019, UK International Trade Secretary Liz Truss in her address at the World Trade Organization (WTO) stated that one of the UK's priorities within the WTO agenda is "to reform digital trade rules so that they are fit for the 21st century, reducing restrictions to market access to support e-commerce and ensure the free flow of data across borders."¹¹⁹⁶

On 21 January 2020, Bank of Canada, the Bank of England, the Bank of Japan, the European Central Bank, the Sveriges Riksbank and the Swiss National Bank, together with the Bank for International Settlements, have created a group to share experiences as they assess the potential cases for central bank digital currency in their home jurisdictions. The group will assess the cases; economic, functional and technical design choices, including cross-border interoperability; and the sharing of knowledge on emerging technologies. It will closely coordinate with the relevant institutions and forums — in particular, the Financial Stability Board and the Committee on Payments and Market Infrastructures.¹¹⁹⁷

On 3 February 2020, Prime Minister Boris Johnson declared that the UK will seek 'adequacy decisions' from the European Union under both the General Data Protection Regulation and the Law Enforcement Directive before the end of the transition period to maintain the continued free flow of personal data from the EU to the UK. This will allow the continued free flow of personal data from the countries in the European Economic Area to the UK, including for law enforcement

¹¹⁹⁴ Websites of the national government, Ministry of Communications and Digital Technologies as well as open sources were searched.

¹¹⁹⁵ Websites of the Republic of Turkey Directorate of Communications, national government as well as open sources were searched.

¹¹⁹⁶ International Trade Secretary WTO address, UK Government 9 October 2019. Access Date: 3 April 2020. <https://www.gov.uk/government/speeches/international-trade-secretary-wto-address>.

¹¹⁹⁷ Central bank group to assess potential cases for central bank digital currencies, Bank Of Japan (Tokyo) 21 January 2020. Access date: 20 May 2020. https://www.boj.or.jp/en/announcements/release_2020/rel200121a.htm/

purposes.¹¹⁹⁸ On 13 March 2020, the Department for Digital, Culture, Media and Sport published a pack of explanatory material providing an overview of the UK's legal framework underpinning data protection standards in order to assist the European Commission in conducting its assessment.¹¹⁹⁹

The UK has taken actions to improve interoperability of different frameworks at both national and international levels.

Thus, it receives a score of +1.

Analyst: Andrey Shelepov

United States: 0

The United States partially complied with the commitment to improve interoperability of different national or international digital frameworks.

On 10-11 October 2019, US representatives from the Department of State, the Department of Commerce, the Federal Communications Commission and from the American Chamber of Commerce in Japan participated in the US-Japan Policy Co-operation Dialogue on the Internet Economy in Japan. The dialogue included discussions with private sector representatives from both countries on “promotion of open, interoperable, reliable, and secure fifth generation mobile technologies (5G) networks and services”; “public-private cooperation on the deployment in third countries of digital infrastructure and services”; “international coordination on areas such as sharing of best practices of Internet of Things (IoT) security and promotion of free flows of data”; and “public-private partnership regarding the social implementation of artificial intelligence (AI) in a manner that fosters public trust in AI.”¹²⁰⁰

On 15 May 2020, the Federal Data Strategy 2020 Action Plan was adjusted to include COVID-19 response data. The Action Plan 2020 “identifies initial actions for agencies that are essential for establishing processes, building capacity, and aligning existing efforts to better leverage data as a strategic asset.” One of the Federal Data Strategy goals is to establish interoperability, and skills consistency across the United States government agencies.¹²⁰¹

No actions on improving international digital frameworks interoperability at the national level have been registered during the monitoring period. But the US cooperated on the issue of interoperability of digital frameworks with Japan.

Thus, the United States is awarded a score of 0.

Analyst: Andrei Sakharov

¹¹⁹⁸ The Future Relationship with the EU. The UK's Approach to Negotiations, UK Government 3 February 2020. Access Date: 3 April 2020. https://assets.publishing.service.gov.uk/government/uploads/system/uploads/attachment_data/file/868874/The_Future_Relationship_with_the_EU.pdf.

¹¹⁹⁹ Explanatory framework for adequacy discussions, UK Government 13 March 2020. Access Date: 3 April 2020. <https://www.gov.uk/government/publications/explanatory-framework-for-adequacy-discussions>.

¹²⁰⁰ Tenth U.S.-Japan Policy Cooperation Dialogue on the Internet Economy Held, Ministry of Economy, Trade and Industry of Japan (Tokyo) 18 October 2019. Access date: 20 May 2020. https://www.meti.go.jp/english/press/2019/1018_005.html

¹²⁰¹ Federal Data Strategy 2020 Action Plan, Federal Data Strategy (Washington) 14 May 2020. Access Date: 18 May 2020. <https://strategy.data.gov/assets/docs/2020-federal-data-strategy-action-plan.pdf>.

European Union: +1

The European Union has fully complied with the commitment on interoperability of different national or international digital frameworks.

On 25 July 2019, Consultation on the future of investment in Europe's digital economy was launched by the European Commission. The Commission is currently planning the Digital Europe programme, which would bring direct investment worth a total of EUR9.2 billion (subject to the agreement of the Council and the European Parliament) for the deployment of innovative digital technologies in five key areas: supercomputing, artificial intelligence, cybersecurity, advanced digital skills, and ensuring a wide use of these digital technologies across the economy and society in line with Europe's ambitious sustainability goals and values. Implementation of the programme will facilitate deploying open, interoperable, trustworthy urban digital platforms tailored to communities' needs, offering easy standardised access to new datasets, and the large scale roll-out of AI-driven services in Smart Energy, Smart Mobility, waste and secondary resource management, industry and (re)manufacturing, healthcare and e-government.¹²⁰²

On 27 November 2019, directive on better enforcement and modernisation of Union consumer protection rules was introduced. New provisions in the regulation include a call for stronger co-ordinated mechanisms to investigate and tackle EU-wide widespread infringements. The new regulation will also improve the current framework by requesting consumer authorities in EU member states to have additional minimum powers to deal with infringements in the digital era (such as the possibility to close websites, carry out test purchases and mystery shopping).¹²⁰³

On 21 January 2020, Bank of Canada, the Bank of England, the Bank of Japan, the European Central Bank, the Sveriges Riksbank and the Swiss National Bank, together with the Bank for International Settlements, have created a group to share experiences as they assess the potential cases for central bank digital currency in their home jurisdictions. The group will assess the cases; economic, functional and technical design choices, including cross-border interoperability; and the sharing of knowledge on emerging technologies. It will closely coordinate with the relevant institutions and forums — in particular, the Financial Stability Board and the Committee on Payments and Market Infrastructures.¹²⁰⁴

On 19 February 2020, the European Commission unveiled its new digital package with ideas and actions for a digital transformation in Europe. This package includes the strategic document Shaping Europe's digital future, European strategy for data and White Paper on Artificial Intelligence. Interoperability is mentioned as one of the key aspects. A reinforced EU governments interoperability strategy scheduled for the end of 2021 will be a key action to ensure coordination and common standards for secure and borderless public sector data flows and services.¹²⁰⁵

¹²⁰² Consultation on the future of investment in Europe's digital economy, European Commission (Brussels) 25 July 2019. Access date: 19 May 2020. <https://ec.europa.eu/digital-single-market/en/news/consultation-future-investment-europes-digital-economy>

¹²⁰³ Directive (EU) 2019/2161 of the European Parliament And Of The Council of 27 November 2019 amending Council Directive 93/13/EEC and Directives 98/6/EC, 2005/29/EC and 2011/83/EU of the European Parliament and of the Council as regards the better enforcement and modernisation of Union consumer protection rules, Official Journal of the European Union (Brussels) 18 December 2019. Access date: 19 May 2020. <https://eur-lex.europa.eu/legal-content/EN/TXT/PDF/?uri=CELEX:32019L2161&from=EN>

¹²⁰⁴ Central bank group to assess potential cases for central bank digital currencies, Bank Of Japan (Tokyo) 21 January 2020. Access date: 20 May 2020. https://www.boj.or.jp/en/announcements/release_2020/rel200121a.htm/

¹²⁰⁵ Interoperability is at the heart of the new EU digital strategy, European Commission (Brussels) 24 February 2020. Access date: 19 May 2020. https://ec.europa.eu/isa2/news/interoperability-heart-new-eu-digital-strategy_en

On 19 February 2020, the European Commission presented the European data strategy. The strategy provides for measure to ensure free flow of data within the EU and free and safe flow of data with third countries, subject to exceptions and restrictions for public security, public order and other legitimate public policy objectives of the European Union, in line with international obligations.¹²⁰⁶

On 3 April 2020, the Commission and North Macedonia signed an agreement, granting the country access to the EU ISA² (Interoperability solutions for public administrations, businesses and citizens) Programme to develop and share solutions for digital public administrations. The ISA² Programme is a EUR131 million initiative of the Commission aimed at simplifying administrative procedures all along Europe as well as supporting the development of interoperable digital public services that benefit businesses and citizens.¹²⁰⁷

The EU has taken actions to improve interoperability of different frameworks at both national and international levels.

Thus, it receives a score of +1.

Analyst: Irina Popovaana

¹²⁰⁶ A European strategy for data, European Commission 19 February 2020. Access Date: 3 April 2020. https://ec.europa.eu/info/sites/info/files/communication-european-strategy-data-19feb2020_en.pdf.

¹²⁰⁷ North Macedonia joins the EU ISA² programme for digital public administrations and the EU Strategy for the Adriatic and Ionian Region, European Commission (Brussels) 3 April 2020. Access date: 19 May 2020. https://ec.europa.eu/neighbourhood-enlargement/news_corner/news/north-macedonia-joins-eu-isa%C2%B2-programme-digital-public-administrations-and-eu_en