

The G20 Research Group
at Trinity College at the Munk School of Global Affairs and Public Policy
in the University of Toronto
presents the

2018 G20 Buenos Aires Summit Final Compliance Report

2 December 2018 to 10 May 2019

Prepared by
Alessandra Cicci, Ji Yoon Han and the G20 Research Group, Toronto,
and Irina Popova, Andrey Shelepov, Andrey Sakharov and Alexander Ignatov and the
Center for International Institutions Research
of the Russian Presidential Academy of National Economy and Public Administration,
Moscow

26 June 2019

www.g20.utoronto.ca
g20@utoronto.ca

“The University of Toronto ... produced a detailed analysis to the extent of which each G20 country has met its commitments since the last summit ... I think this is important; we come to these summits, we make these commitments, we say we are going to do these things and it is important that there is an organisation that checks up on who has done what.”

— *David Cameron, Prime Minister, United Kingdom, at the 2012 Los Cabos Summit*

munkschool.utoronto.ca



At Trinity College
1 Devonshire Place
Toronto, ON
Canada M5S 3K7
T: 416.946.8900 F: 416.946.8915

At the Observatory
315 Bloor Street West
Toronto, ON
Canada M5S 0A7
T: 416.946.8929 F: 416.946.8877

At the Canadiana Gallery
14 Queen's Park Crescent West
Toronto, ON
Canada M5S 3K9
T: 416.978.5120 F: 416.978.5079

Contents

Contents.....	2
Preface.....	3
Toronto Research Team	4
CIIR G20 Research Team	5
Introduction and Summary.....	6
Commitment Breakdown.....	7
Selection of Commitments	7
Final Compliance Scores.....	7
Final Compliance by Member	7
Final Compliance by Commitment	7
Table 1: 2018 G20 Buenos Aires Summit Commitments Selected for Compliance Monitoring	8
Table 2: 2018 G20 Buenos Aires Summit Final Compliance Scores	10
Table 4: 2018 G20 Buenos Aires Summit Final Compliance by Member	11
Table 5: 2018 G20 Buenos Aires Summit Final Compliance by Commitment	12
Table 6: G20 Compliance by Member, 2008–2017	13
Conclusions.....	14
Future Research and Reports	14
Considerations and Limitations	14
Appendix: General Considerations	15
1. Climate Change: Disaster Resilience.....	16
2. Development: Early Childhood Development	47
3. Digital Economy: Data Governance	74
4. Employment: Skills Development	104
5. Energy: Cleaner, Flexible and Transparent Systems	146
6. Financial Regulation: Tax Administration	208
7. Food Security: Malnutrition	240
8. Gender: Economic Empowerment.....	302
9. Reform of the International Financial Institutions: International Monetary Fund.....	358
10. Macroeconomics: Inclusive Growth.....	379
11. Climate Change: Paris Agreement.....	430
12. Digital Economy: Digital Infrastructure	461
13. Employment: Future of Work.....	490
14. Energy: Energy Security.....	513
15. Financial Regulation: Technology	541
16. Financial Regulation: International Taxation	567
17. Food and Agriculture: Sustainable Agriculture	584
18. Health: Universal Health Coverage.....	616
19. Infrastructure: Infrastructure Investment.....	651
20. Trade: Reform of the World Trade Organization	672

20. Trade: Reform of the World Trade Organization

“We therefore support the necessary reform of the WTO to improve its functioning.”

Buenos Leaders Aires Declaration

Assessment

	No Compliance	Partial Compliance	Full Compliance
Argentina			+1
Australia			+1
Brazil			+1
Canada			+1
China			+1
France		0	
Germany			+1
India		0	
Indonesia			+1
Italy		0	
Japan			+1
Korea			+1
Mexico			+1
Russia		0	
Saudi Arabia	-1		
South Africa	-1		
Turkey			+1
United Kingdom			+1
United States			+1
European Union			+1
Average Score		+0.60	

Background

International trade has been at the core of the G20 agenda since the first summit in 2008 in Washington. Throughout the following 10 years the G20 leaders affirmed their commitment to free, transparent and fair multilateral trading system, tackling such issues as protectionism, regional trade agreements, trade and development, e-commerce, etc.

The 2018 summit in Buenos Aires, however, saw dramatic decline in the number and specificity of the commitments on international trade. Convening against the backdrop of a global trade crisis brought about by the rise of unilateral trade barriers and counter-measures and the inability of the World Trade Organization (WTO) to effectively oppose this trend, the G20 leaders could not reach consensus on the major part of the traditional G20 trade agenda. The pledge to support the reform process necessary to improve the functioning of the WTO was effectively the only concrete commitment on international trade agreed in Buenos Aires.⁴¹³⁶

Commitment Features

The commitment requires the G20 countries to support the reform of the WTO, necessary to overcome its operational and structural weaknesses, impeding the effective functioning of the

⁴¹³⁶ G20 Leaders' Declaration: Building Consensus for Fair and Sustainable Development, G20 2018, G20 Information Centre University of Toronto (Buenos Aires) 3 December 2018. Access date: 28 May 2019. <http://www.g20.utoronto.ca/2018/2018-leaders-declaration.html>.

multilateral trading system. The WTO Director-General Roberto Azevêdo identified three main issue areas which the potential WTO reform should focus on:

1. Enhancing the WTO monitoring capacity (including such issues as notifications and transparency, creating platforms and mechanisms for discussing, clarifying and addressing specific trade concerns);
2. Addressing dispute settlement system issues (including the Appellate Body impasse);
3. Improving the WTO rule making system (including the modernization of the WTO trade rules, development of differentiated mechanisms of members' involvement in trade negotiations and adherence to certain rules, dealing with development-related issues).⁴¹³⁷

To comply with the commitment the G20 members need to take active participation in discussions on the WTO reform both within the framework of the WTO process, and at other multilateral and bilateral venues. This participation can include drafting reform proposals, backing proposals made by other WTO members, organizing and taking part in events devoted to the WTO reform, promoting discussions among non-government actors and academic community on the WTO reform. To fully comply with the commitment the G20 members need to actively engage in discussions and put forward proposals on WTO reform, containing issues listed above. To partially comply, members need to support the reform in general, but not promote any concrete reform proposals. Negative compliance implies no actions taken to promote the reform of WTO or openly opposing the reform.

Scoring Guidelines

-1	The G20 member did not take action to support the WTO reform or openly opposed it.
0	The G20 member took part in the promotion of the WTO reform, but didn't put forward any concrete proposals on reform.
+1	The G20 member took part in the promotion of the WTO reform and put forward concrete proposals on reform.

Argentina: +1

Argentina has fully complied with the commitment on reforming the World Trade Organization (WTO).

On 24 January 2019, Argentina, Norway and Japan circulated a new document with the aim of reaching an agreeable drafting for the Rules of Procedure to be applied to meetings of the Committee on Trade Facilitation.⁴¹³⁸ The document suggested that the Rules of Procedure for meetings of the General Council (WT/L/161) be applied *mutatis mutandis* to meetings of the Committee on Trade Facilitation with some exceptions.

Argentina took part in the promotion of the WTO reform and drafted several proposals on ways to enhance WTO's activities. Thus, it receives a score of +1.

Analyst: Elizaveta Safonkina

⁴¹³⁷ DG Azevêdo in US: This is a "once-in-a-generation opportunity" to renew trading system, WTO (Geneva) 5 December 2018. Access date: 28 May 2019. https://www.wto.org/english/news_e/news18_e/dgra_06dec18_e.htm.

⁴¹³⁸ RULES OF PROCEDURE FOR THE TRADE FACILITATION COMMITTEE. Proposal by Argentina, Japan and Norway, World Trade Organization (Geneva) 24 January 2019. Access Date: 15 February 2019. https://www.wto.org/english/tratop_e/tradfa_e/comm_tradfa_e.htm.

Australia: +1

Australia has fully complied with the commitment on reforming the World Trade Organization (WTO).

On 26 January 2019, Australia, Japan and Singapore hosted an informal meeting of Ministers on the WTO e-commerce initiative in the margins of the World Economic Forum Annual Meeting in Davos, Switzerland. Ministers exchanged views on how WTO negotiations can capture opportunities offered by e-commerce for businesses, consumers and the global economy. Following the meeting, 76 WTO Members representing over 90 percent of global trade issued a Joint Statement (Annex) confirming their intention to commence WTO negotiations on trade-related aspects of e-commerce, with the objective of achieving a high standard outcome with the participation of as many Members as possible.⁴¹³⁹

On 7 February 2019, Australia concluded negotiations to join the World Trade Organization Agreement on Government Procurement. The agreement's principles are transparency and non-discrimination, requiring Members to: offer other Members' suppliers' conditions 'no less favourable' than domestic suppliers; provide review procedures for suppliers to raise complaints about tender processes. Australia wants to join the agreement to protect and promote Australian businesses bidding for government procurement contracts in the markets of its 47 current members.⁴¹⁴⁰

On 24 January 2019, it was announced that Australia was going to start talks at the World Trade Organisation for a new regime covering e-commerce and corporate data flows, potentially plugging a critical gap in the multilateral trading system and easing companies' ability to do business across borders. Trade Minister Simon Birmingham met other trade ministers in Davos to get final endorsement for the plan, which will see a WTO grouping begin to develop clear and harmonised standards on electronic invoicing, cross-border data transfers, and the storage of data.⁴¹⁴¹

Australia supports the WTO reform in general and is a member of Ottawa Group, responsible for trade in services aspect of reform. Thus, it receives a score of +1.

Analyst: Anna Kotlyarova

Brazil: +1

Brazil has fully complied with the commitment on reforming the World Trade Organization (WTO).

On 28 March 2019, Brazil proposed guidelines for the performance of panels and the Appellate Body. The proposal seeks to improve procedures, to make the system more agile and efficient in strict compliance with the WTO Dispute Settlement Understanding, and to preserve the rights and obligations agreed in the Marrakesh Agreement which created the World Trade Organization. It also

⁴¹³⁹ Australia, Japan and Singapore welcome WTO electronic commerce negotiations, Minister for Trade, Tourism and Investment (Canberra) 26 January 2019. Access date: 31 March 2019. https://trademinister.gov.au/releases/Pages/2019/sb_mr_190126a.aspx

⁴¹⁴⁰ Agreement on Government Procurement, Department of Foreign Affairs and Trade (Canberra) 7 February 2019. Access date: 31 March 2019. <https://dfat.gov.au/trade/organisations/wto/Pages/wto-agreement-on-government-procurement.aspx>

⁴¹⁴¹ Australia leads the way on WTO talks to ease cross-border data sharing, Financial Review (Melbourne) 24 January 2019. Access date: 31 March 2019. <https://www.afr.com/news/economy/trade/australia-leads-the-way-on-wto-talks-to-ease-crossborder-data-sharing-20190124-h1afa2>

aims to overcome the impasse in the selection of new members of the Appellate Body, which could jeopardize the progress of disputes in the WTO.⁴¹⁴²

Brazil supports the WTO reform in general and presented a proposal of Appellate Body reform. Thus, it receives a score of +1.

Analyst: Polina Petrova

Canada: +1

Canada has fully complied with the commitment of reforming the World Trade Organization (WTO).

On 24 February 2019, Minister of International Trade Diversification Jim Carr chaired a meeting of the representative group of WTO members committed to improving and strengthening the multilateral trading system. In October 2018, Minister Carr hosted the inaugural meeting of the group in Ottawa, where ministers discussed reforms and the modernization of the rules-based order. As a follow-up to commitments made in Ottawa, the group of ministers discussed next steps and the need to conclude ongoing WTO negotiations, including those reducing harmful fisheries subsidies. These negotiations will deliver economic, environmental and development benefits.⁴¹⁴³

Canada supports the WTO reform in general and is the leader of the Ottawa group, whose goal is to elaborate a comprehensive reform of the WTO, its dispute settlement mechanism and multilateral trade system in general. Thus, it receives a score of +1.

Analyst: Uliana Koptiyukh

China: +1

China has fully complied with the commitment on reforming the World Trade Organization (WTO).

On 12 December 2019, China, The European Union and other WTO members delivered a joint statement emphasizing the urgent need to unblock the appointment of WTO Appellate Body members.⁴¹⁴⁴

On 20 December 2018, “China’s Position Paper on WTO Reform” was issued. China put forward three basic principles of WTO reform including the preservation of the core values of the multilateral trading system, safeguarding the development interests of developing members and following the practice of decision-making by consensus.⁴¹⁴⁵

⁴¹⁴² Brasil circula proposta para superar impasse do Órgão de Apelação na OMC, Ministério das Relações Exteriores (Brasilia) 28 March 2019. Access Date: 30 March 2019. <http://www.itamaraty.gov.br/pt-BR/notas-a-imprensa/20234-brasil-circula-proposta-para-superar-impasse-do-orgao-de-apelacao-na-omc>

⁴¹⁴³ Canada-led WTO meeting concludes in Davos, Switzerland. Global Affairs Canada, Government of Canada (Ottawa) 24 February 2019. Access date: 19 February 2019. <https://www.canada.ca/en/global-affairs/news/2019/01/canada-led-wto-meeting-concludes-in-davos-switzerland.html>

⁴¹⁴⁴ EU, China stress urgent need to unblock appointment of WTO Appellate Body members, Xinhua News Agency (Beijing) 12 December 2018. Access date: 20 April 2019. http://www.xinhuanet.com/english/2018-12/12/c_137669445.htm

⁴¹⁴⁵ China’s Position Paper on WTO Reform, Ministry of Commerce of the People’s Republic of China (Beijing) 6 December 2018. Access date: 20 April 2019. <http://english.mofcom.gov.cn/article/counselorsreport/americaandocanreport/201812/20181202813857.shtml>

On 3 April 2019, Assistant Minister of Commerce Li Chenggang held talks with Japanese Vice-Minister for International Affairs of the Ministry of Economy, Trade and Industry Tatsuya Terazawa in Beijing. The two sides exchanged their views on the WTO reform.⁴¹⁴⁶

On 9 April 2019, Chinese Premier Li Keqiang, President of the European Council Donald Tusk, and President of the European Commission Jean-Claude Juncker held a meeting in Beijing. During the meeting they reaffirmed their joint commitment to cooperate on WTO reform to ensure its continued relevance and allow it to address global trade challenges. They agreed to continue working to resolve the crisis in the WTO Appellate Body.⁴¹⁴⁷

On 13 April 2019, Chinese Premier Li Keqiang delivered a speech at the eighth summit of heads of government of China and Central and Eastern European Countries where he emphasized that certain aspects of the WTO rules need to be reformed and improved in order to better reflect changing realities and enhance their authority and effectiveness.⁴¹⁴⁸

China supports WTO reform in general and puts forward proposals on possible ways of reforming the organisation. Thus, it gets a score +1.

Analyst: Yekaterina Litvintseva

France: 0

France has partially complied with the commitment on reforming the World Trade Organization (WTO).

On 17 January 2019, it was announced that France and China were conducting high-level communication and exchanges on issues surrounding the reform of the WTO. Both countries emphasized that multilateralism is very important for global trade and trade disputes should be discussed and settled within the multilateral frameworks of the WTO and G20.⁴¹⁴⁹

On 26 March 2019, in their joint statement China and France announced that they will make joint efforts to promote multilateralism based on international law, uphold a rules-based multilateral trading system, and fully implement the 2015 Paris climate accord, according to a joint statement of the two countries.⁴¹⁵⁰

France supports the reform of WTO in general and puts forward a proposal on WTO reform. Thus, it receives a score of 0.

Analyst: Dariya Myasnikova

⁴¹⁴⁶ Assistant Minister Li Chenggang Holds Consultations with Japanese Vice-Minister for International Affairs of the Ministry of Economy, Trade and Industry on RCEP, Ministry of Commerce of the People's Republic of China (Beijing) 3 April 2019. Access date: 21 April 2019.

<http://lichenggang2.mofcom.gov.cn/article/activity/201904/20190402851575.shtml>

⁴¹⁴⁷ China, EU issue joint statement of 21st leaders' meeting, Xinhua News Agency (Beijing) 10 April 2019. Access date: 20 April 2019. http://www.xinhuanet.com/english/2019-04/10/c_137963618.htm

⁴¹⁴⁸ Full text of Chinese premier's speech at 8th summit of heads of government of China, CEEC, Xinhua News Agency (Beijing) 13 April 2019. Access date: 20 April 2019. http://www.xinhuanet.com/english/europe/2019-04/13/c_137974076.htm

⁴¹⁴⁹ France, China working on issues related to WTO reform: ambassador, Global Times (Beijing) 17 January 2019. Access date: 23 May 2019. <http://www.globaltimes.cn/content/1136174.shtml>

⁴¹⁵⁰ China, France vow to uphold multilateralism, Paris climate accord, CGTN (Beijing) 26 March 2019. Access date: 23 May 2019. <https://news.cgtn.com/news/3d3d674d334d6a4e33457a6333566d54/index.html>

Germany: +1

Germany has fully complied with the commitment on reforming the World Trade Organization (WTO).

On 23-24 January 2019, German Minister for Economic Affairs and Energy Peter Altmaier attended the 2019 World Economic Forum Annual Meeting in Davos. The aim of his participation was to work together with representatives of various countries and companies on solutions regarding open markets, the modernization of the WTO and artificial intelligence.⁴¹⁵¹

On 4 February 2019, German Chancellor Angela Merkel met with the Prime Minister of Japan Shinzo Abe. They exchanged views regarding current situation in international trade and shared the view that Japan and Germany will cooperate for maintaining and strengthening a free and open economic system, including through the WTO reform.⁴¹⁵²

On 22 February 2019, Minister Altmaier participated in the meeting of the EU Trade Ministers. Minister Altmaier mentioned: “Without the WTO, the principle that ‘might is right’ would prevail in trade relations. The WTO is a very important organization to promote rules-based international trade. We need to position it better and strengthen it to be able to tackle the challenges of the 21st century. For this purpose, we are, together with the European Commission, engaged in talks with numerous international partners, including the U.S. and China.” Issues related to the WTO reform discussed at the meeting include reestablishing a functioning of the WTO dispute settlement mechanism, closing gaps in the WTO rules, for example on subsidies or e-commerce, and improving the work of the WTO, its committees and bodies.⁴¹⁵³

Germany supports the reform of WTO in general and puts forward a proposal on WTO reform. Thus, it receives a score of +1.

Analyst: Andrey Shelepov

India: 0

India has partially complied with the commitment on reforming the World Trade Organization (WTO).

On 4 February 2019, Minister of State of Commerce and Industry informed that India has recently co-sponsored a proposal with the European Union and other members on reform of the dispute settlement mechanism addressing various challenges. The proposal, inter alia, addresses various imperative issues of timelines, the appointment process of the Appellate Body members, their tenure and other conditions so that the Appellate Body and the Dispute Settlement Mechanism work more efficiently.⁴¹⁵⁴

⁴¹⁵¹ Minister Altmaier attends World Economic Forum in Davos: dialogue in times of international trade conflicts more important than ever!, German Federal Ministry for Economic Affairs and Energy (Berlin) 22 January 2019. Access Date: 15 April 2019. <https://www.bmwi.de/Redaktion/EN/Pressemitteilungen/2019/20190122-altmaier-attends-world-economic-forum-in-davos.html>.

⁴¹⁵² Japan-Germany Summit Meeting, Ministry of Foreign Affairs of Japan (Tokyo) 4 February 2019. Access Date: 15 April 2019. https://www.mofa.go.jp/erp/c_see/page6e_000166.html.

⁴¹⁵³ Minister Altmaier: Europe relies on free trade against protectionism, German Federal Ministry for Economic Affairs and Energy (Berlin) 22 February 2019. Access Date: 15 April 2019. <https://www.bmwi.de/Redaktion/EN/Pressemitteilungen/2019/20190222-altmaier-europe-relies-on-free-trade-against-protectionism.html>.

⁴¹⁵⁴ WTO issues and challenges, Public Information Bureau (Delhi) 4 February. Access date: 4 February. <http://www.pib.nic.in/PressReleaseDetail.aspx?PRID=1558207>

India supports the WTO reform in general and the Appellate Body reform proposal by Ottawa group, however, India doesn't suggest its own reform proposals.

Thus, it receives a score of 0.

Analyst: Polina Shtanko

Indonesia: +1

Indonesia has fully complied with the commitment on reforming the World Trade Organization (WTO).

On 21 January 2019, a joint statement of the 22nd EU-ASEAN Ministerial meeting (with Indonesia's participation) was issued.⁴¹⁵⁵ The statement reaffirms strong support for preserving and strengthening an open, fair, non-discriminatory, transparent, rules-based multilateral trading system with the World Trade Organization at its core, and the need to address barriers to international trade; expresses deep concern about the systemic impact of protectionist measures that are incompatible with WTO rules and that put the multilateral trading system at risk; and underlines the urgent need to strengthen and reform the WTO to meet new challenges and to improve its negotiating, monitoring, rule-making and dispute settlement functions.⁴¹⁵⁶

Indonesia was also among the members of the WTO, which initiated a joint ministerial statement on electronic commerce published on 25 January 2019.⁴¹⁵⁷ The statement confirms the WTO's members intention to commence negotiations on trade-related aspects of electronic commerce; to achieve a high standard outcome that builds on existing WTO agreements and frameworks with the participation of as many WTO Members as possible; to recognize and take into account the unique opportunities and challenges faced by different members, including developing countries and least development countries, as well as by micro, small and medium sized enterprises, in relation to electronic commerce; and to continue to encourage all WTO Members to participate in order to further enhance the benefits of electronic commerce for businesses, consumers and the global economy.⁴¹⁵⁸

Indonesia supports the WTO reform in general and is one of the initiates of Joint ministerial statement on electronic commerce.

Thus, it receives a score of +1.

Analyst: Pavel Doronin

Italy: 0

Italy has partially complied with the commitment on reforming the World Trade Organization (WTO).

⁴¹⁵⁵ Joint statement of the 22nd EU-ASEAN ministerial meeting, European Council (Brussels) 21 January 2019. Access date: 15 April 2019. <https://www.consilium.europa.eu/en/press/press-releases/2019/01/21/joint-statement-of-the-22nd-eu-asean-ministerial-meeting/>

⁴¹⁵⁶ Joint statement of the 22nd EU-ASEAN ministerial meeting, European Council (Brussels) 21 January 2019. Access date: 15 April 2019. <https://www.consilium.europa.eu/en/press/press-releases/2019/01/21/joint-statement-of-the-22nd-eu-asean-ministerial-meeting/>

⁴¹⁵⁷ Joint Statement on Electronic Commerce, European Commission (Brussels) 25 January 2019. Access date: 15 April 2019. http://trade.ec.europa.eu/doclib/docs/2019/january/tradoc_157643.pdf

⁴¹⁵⁸ Joint Statement on Electronic Commerce, European Commission (Brussels) 25 January 2019. Access date: 15 April 2019. http://trade.ec.europa.eu/doclib/docs/2019/january/tradoc_157643.pdf

On 25 January 2019, during the 9th Meeting of the China-Italy Joint Government Committee Italy and China expressed support for the reform of the WTO, with the aim of reinforcing its role.⁴¹⁵⁹

On 24 April 2019, Prime Minister Conte welcomed Prime Minister Abe's visit to Italy. The two leaders shared the view that Japan and Italy will cooperate in a variety of areas, including promotion of free trade, WTO reform, data governance, quality infrastructure, and environmental and global issues.⁴¹⁶⁰

Italy supports the reform of WTO in general but has not put forward its own proposal on WTO reform.

Thus, it receives a score of 0.

Analyst: Svetlana Kochetkova

Japan: +1

Japan has fully complied with the commitment on reforming the World Trade Organization (WTO).

On 9 January 2019, Japan, the European Union and the United States Ministers, Responsible for Trade, issued another joint statement, including on WTO reform, having noted that the three countries agreed to intensify engagement with other trading partners to advance their joint transparency and notification proposal to the Council for Trade in Goods submitted in November 2018, and that they confirmed their agreement to work towards strengthening the regular committees' activities, as well as their call on advanced WTO Members claiming developing country status to undertake full commitments in ongoing and future WTO negotiations.⁴¹⁶¹ The Ministers also confirmed their support for the timely initiation of WTO negotiations on trade-related aspects of electronic commerce that seek to achieve a high standard agreement with the participation of as many WTO members as possible, and instructed their staff to finalize "trilateral text-based work" on industrial subsidies by spring to engage other key WTO members.⁴¹⁶²

On 24-25 January 2019, at the World Economic Forum, Japan's Minister of Economy, Trade and Industry Hiroshige Seko took part in the meeting of the Ottawa Ministerial on WTO Reform, and hosted the informal meeting of Ministers, Responsible for Trade, on the WTO e-commerce related issues⁴¹⁶³. Following the latter, the joint statement on e-commerce by 76 WTO members was issued, which highlighted that signatories⁴¹⁶⁴:

⁴¹⁵⁹ Joint Statement on the 9th Meeting of the China-Italy Joint Government Committee, Ministero degli Affari Esteri e della Cooperazione Internazionale (Rome) 25 January 2019. Access date: 30 March 2019.

https://www.esteri.it/mae/en/sala_stampa/archivionotizie/comunicati/2019/01/comunicato-congiunto.html

⁴¹⁶⁰ Japan-Italy Summit Meeting, Ministry of Foreign Affairs of Japan (Tokyo) 24 April 2019. Access date: 23 May 2019.

https://www.mofa.go.jp/erp/we/it/page4e_001014.html

⁴¹⁶¹ Joint Statement of the Trilateral Meeting of the Trade Ministers of the European Union, Japan and the United States, Delegation of the European Union to the United States (Washington) 9 January 2019. Access date: 9 January 2019. https://eeas.europa.eu/delegations/united-states-america/56329/joint-statement-trilateral-meeting-trade-ministers-european-union-japan-and-united-states_en

⁴¹⁶² Joint Statement of the Trilateral Meeting of the Trade Ministers of the European Union, Japan and the United States, Delegation of the European Union to the United States (Washington) 9 January 2019. Access date: 9 January 2019. https://eeas.europa.eu/delegations/united-states-america/56329/joint-statement-trilateral-meeting-trade-ministers-european-union-japan-and-united-states_en

⁴¹⁶³ METI Minister Seko Visits Switzerland, Japan's Ministry of Economy, Trade and Industry (Tokyo) 28 January 2019. Access date: 15 April 2019. https://www.meti.go.jp/english/press/2019/0128_002.html

⁴¹⁶⁴ Joint Statement on Electronic Commerce, WTO 25 January 2019. Access date: 15 April 2019. http://trade.ec.europa.eu/doclib/docs/2019/january/tradoc_157643.pdf

- Confirm their intention to commence WTO negotiations on trade-related aspects of electronic commerce;
- Will seek to achieve a high standard outcome that builds on existing WTO agreements and frameworks with the participation of as many WTO Members as possible;
- Recognize and will take into account the unique opportunities and challenges faced by Members, including developing countries and the least developed countries, as well as by micro, small and medium sized enterprises, in relation to electronic commerce.

On 24 April 2019, Prime Minister Conte welcomed Prime Minister Abe's visit to Italy. The two leaders shared the view that Japan and Italy will cooperate in a variety of areas, including promotion of free trade, WTO reform, data governance, quality infrastructure, and environmental and global issues.⁴¹⁶⁵

Japan supports the WTO reform in general and is one of the authors of Ottawa group proposal on WTO reform.

Thus, it receives a score of +1.

Analyst: Pavel Doronin

Korea: +1

Korea has fully complied with the commitment on reforming the World Trade Organization (WTO).

On 24 January 2019, Kim Hyun-chong, Minister of Trade of Korea, attended a meeting devoted to discussion of the proposed agenda of WTO reform in Davos, Switzerland. The minister expressed support for the need to create a set of WTO rules to cope with the spread of digital commerce and other related matters. At Davos meeting alliance on WTO Appellate body reform emerged.⁴¹⁶⁶

On 29 January 2019, the Ottawa group (a Canada-led initiative of 13 countries including Korea) announced its intention to seek more members and launch discussions on specific areas of the WTO reform process.⁴¹⁶⁷

Korea supports the WTO reform in general and as a member of Ottawa Group puts forward a reform proposal.

Thus, it receives a score of +1.

Analyst: Alexander Ignatov

Mexico: +1

Mexico has fully complied with the commitment on reforming the World Trade Organization (WTO).

On 29 January 2019, the Ottawa group (a Canada-led initiative of 13 countries including Mexico) announced its intention to seek more members and launch discussions on specific areas of the WTO reform process.⁴¹⁶⁸

⁴¹⁶⁵ Japan-Italy Summit Meeting, Ministry of Foreign Affairs of Japan 24 April 2019. Access date: 23 May 2019. https://www.mofa.go.jp/erp/we/it/page4e_001014.html

⁴¹⁶⁶ Trade minister to attend WTO reform meeting in Davos, Korea Herald (Seoul) 24 January 2019. Access date: 2 April 2019. <http://www.koreaherald.com/view.php?ud=20190121000342>

⁴¹⁶⁷ WTO reform initiative moving forward, National News Watch (Ottawa) 29 January 2019. Access date: 2 April 2019. <https://www.nationalnewswatch.com/2019/01/29/wto-reform-initiative-moving-forward/#.XKYVX1UzaCg>

On 12 February 2019, Foreign Secretary Marcelo Ebrard met with a delegation of more than 60 business executives from the Japan Chamber of Commerce and Industry interested in boosting trade and investment between the two countries. Developing of bilateral trade relations allows to develop international trade system.⁴¹⁶⁹

On 18 February 2019, Matías Romero Institute announced call for The “Train For Trade” program on International Merchandise Trade Statistics, which is offered free of charge by the Association of Caribbean States in coordination with the Statistics Division of the United Nations Organization, the Conference of the United Nations for Trade and Development, and the World Trade Organization. Establishment of the joint educational program contributes to development of the international trade and expertise on the international trade.⁴¹⁷⁰

On 5 March 2019, Foreign Secretary Marcelo Ebrard met with Minister for Trade and Export Growth of New Zealand, David Parker. The two officials agreed to increase the two countries’ economic and political cooperation due to their similar views on issues such as social inclusion, environmental protection and multilateralism, which contributes to international trade development and transformation.⁴¹⁷¹

Mexico supports the WTO reform in general and as a member of Ottawa Group puts forward a reform proposal. Thus, it receives a score of +1.

Analyst: Nadezhda Kamenkovich

Russia: 0

Russia has partially complied with the commitment on reforming the World Trade Organization (WTO).

On 25 January 2019, Russian Minister of Economic Development Maxim Oreshkin said that restoring the effective functioning of the WTO should be the main goal of global governance system. Maxim Oreshkin also stressed some long-standing problems that require a new look. First of all, these are issues related to the expansion of the WTO agenda and progress on the negotiation tracks.⁴¹⁷²

Russia supports the WTO reform in general, however, doesn’t suggest its own reform proposals.

Thus, it receives a score of 0.

Analyst: Anna Piekalnits

⁴¹⁶⁸WTO reform initiative moving forward, National News Watch (Ottawa) 29 January 2019. Access date: 2 April 2019. <https://www.nationalnewswatch.com/2019/01/29/wto-reform-initiative-moving-forward/#.XKYVX1UzaCg>

⁴¹⁶⁹ Foreign Secretary Marcelo Ebrard Meets with Japanese Trade Mission, Mexican Government (Mexico) 12 February 2019. Access date: 21 March 2019. <https://www.gob.mx/sre/prensa/foreign-secretary-marcelo-ebrard-meets-with-japanese-trade-mission?idiom=en>

⁴¹⁷⁰ Programa “Train For Trade” sobre Estadísticas del Comercio Internacional de Mercancías (AEC), Mexican Government (Mexico) 18 February 2019. Access date: 21 March 2019. <https://www.gob.mx/imr/documentos/programa-train-for-trade-sobre-estadisticas-del-comercio-internacional-de-mercancias-aec>

⁴¹⁷¹ Secretary Marcelo Ebrard Meets with New Zealand Trade Minister David Parker, Mexican Government (Mexico) 5 March 2019. Access date: 21 March 2019. <https://www.gob.mx/sre/prensa/158721>

⁴¹⁷² Maxim Oreshkin: Restoring the effective functioning of the WTO should be our main goal, Russian Ministry for Economic Development (Moscow) 25 January 2019. Access date: 13 May 2019. <http://economy.gov.ru/minec/about/structure/depTorg/2019250103>

Saudi Arabia: -1

Saudi Arabia has not complied with the commitment on reforming the World Trade Organization (WTO).

No actions taken by Saudi Arabia to support the WTO reform were found within the compliance period.

Thus, Saudi Arabia receives a score of -1.⁴¹⁷³

Analyst: Alexander Ignatov

South Africa: -1

South Africa has not complied with the commitment on reforming the World Trade Organization (WTO).

No actions taken by Saudi Arabia to support the WTO reform were found within the compliance period.

Thus, South Africa receives a score of -1.⁴¹⁷⁴

Analyst: Arseniy Zakharov

Turkey: +1

Turkey has fully complied with the commitment on reforming the World Trade Organization (WTO).

Turkey was among the members of the WTO Dispute Settlement Body, which initiated joint statements on Appellate Body appointments following the meetings of the WTO Dispute Settlement Body of 18 December 2018 and 25 February 2019.⁴¹⁷⁵ The statements urge the WTO Dispute Settlement Body to launch recruitment processes to fill 4 vacancies in the Appellate Body, to establish a Selection Committee in line with previous selection processes composed of the Director-General and the Chairpersons of the General Council, the Goods Council, the Services Council, the TRIPS Council and the Dispute Settlement Body, to be Chaired by the Dispute Settlement Body Chair, and to set deadlines for selection process (30 days for nomination and 60 days after nomination ends to form recommendations by the Selection Committee).⁴¹⁷⁶

Turkey was among the members of the WTO, which initiated a joint ministerial statement on electronic commerce published on 25 January 2019.⁴¹⁷⁷ The statement confirms the WTO's members intention to commence negotiations on trade-related aspects of electronic commerce; to achieve a high standard outcome that builds on existing WTO agreements and frameworks with the participation of as many WTO Members as possible; to recognize and take into account the unique opportunities and challenges faced by different members, including developing countries and least development countries, as well as by micro, small and medium sized enterprises, in relation to

⁴¹⁷³ Additional information has been provided on a confidential basis suggesting progress on WTO reform but cannot be included towards the scoring assessment.

⁴¹⁷⁴ Additional information has been provided on a confidential basis suggesting progress on WTO reform but cannot be included towards the scoring assessment.

⁴¹⁷⁵ Dispute Settlement Body, WTO (Geneva) 18 December 2018. Access date: 15 April 2019. https://www.wto.org/english/tratop_e/dispu_e/dispu_body_e.htm

⁴¹⁷⁶ Dispute Settlement Body, WTO (Geneva) 18 December 2018. Access date: 15 April 2019. https://www.wto.org/english/tratop_e/dispu_e/dispu_body_e.htm

⁴¹⁷⁷ Joint Statement on Electronic Commerce, European Commission (Brussels) 25 January 2019. Access date: 15 April 2019. http://trade.ec.europa.eu/doclib/docs/2019/january/tradoc_157643.pdf

electronic commerce; and to continue to encourage all WTO Members to participate in order to further enhance the benefits of electronic commerce for businesses, consumers and the global economy.⁴¹⁷⁸

Turkey supports the WTO reform in general and is among initiators of e-commerce statement and supporters of Appellate body reform. Thus, it receives a score of +1.

Analyst: Pavel Doronin

United Kingdom: +1

United Kingdom has fully complied with the commitment on reforming the World Trade Organization (WTO).

As still a member on European Union, whose trade policy is in the full competence of the supranational level, the UK supports the reform of the WTO and especially its Appellate body through the proposal of Ottawa Group.

On 13 December 2018, the UK welcomed approval of new trade agreement with Japan. Consumers to be given more choice at lower prices and an increase in job opportunities thanks to the recent EU-Japan Economic Partnership Agreement.⁴¹⁷⁹

On 18 January 2019, the UK and Australia agreed continuity of Mutual Recognition Agreement. The International Trade Secretary signed an arrangement which will help boost British trade with Australia.⁴¹⁸⁰

On 31 January 2019, the UK signed Eastern and Southern Africa trade continuity agreement. Trade Policy Minister George Hollingbery signed the trade continuity agreement in London with a number of representative governments.⁴¹⁸¹

On 1 February 2019, the UK signed a new trade continuity agreement with the Faroe Islands.⁴¹⁸²

On 18 February 2019, International Trade Secretary and President of the Board of Trade the Rt Hon Dr Liam Fox signed the UK-Israel agreement in Tel Aviv with Minister of Economy and Industry Eli Cohen.⁴¹⁸³

On 30 January 2019, the UK and Chile signed a new trade continuity agreement. This trade continuity agreement will see British businesses and consumers benefiting from preferential trading arrangements with Chile after the country leaves the European Union.⁴¹⁸⁴

⁴¹⁷⁸ Joint Statement on Electronic Commerce, European Commission (Brussels) 25 January 2019. Access date: 15 April 2019. http://trade.ec.europa.eu/doclib/docs/2019/january/tradoc_157643.pdf

⁴¹⁷⁹ UK welcomes approval of new trade agreement with Japan, UK Government (London) 13 December 2018. Access date: 20 March 2019. <https://www.gov.uk/government/news/uk-welcomes-approval-of-new-trade-agreement-with-japan>

⁴¹⁸⁰ UK and Australia agree continuity of Mutual Recognition Agreement, UK Government (London) 18 February 2019. Access date: 20 March 2019. <https://www.gov.uk/government/news/uk-and-australia-agree-continuity-of-mutual-recognition-agreement>

⁴¹⁸¹ UK signs Eastern and Southern Africa trade continuity agreement, UK Government (London) 31 January 2019. Access date: 20 March 2019. <https://www.gov.uk/government/news/uk-signs-eastern-and-southern-africa-trade-continuity-agreement>

⁴¹⁸² UK and Faroe Islands sign trade continuity agreement, UK Government (London) 1 February 2019. Access date: 20 March 2019. <https://www.gov.uk/government/news/uk-and-faroe-islands-sign-trade-continuity-agreement>

⁴¹⁸³ UK and Israel sign trade continuity agreement, UK Government (London) 18 February 2019. Access date: 20 March 2019. <https://www.gov.uk/government/news/uk-and-israel-sign-trade-continuity-agreement>

United Kingdom supports the WTO reform in general and as a member of Ottawa Group puts forward a reform proposal. Thus, it receives a score of +1.

Analyst: Mariya Kalugina

United States: +1

United States has fully complied with the commitment on reforming the World Trade Organization (WTO).

On 12 December 2018, the U.S. rejected the European Union’s proposal to reform the World Trade Organization, dealing a blow to international efforts to bolster the Geneva-based body, which has come under attack from President Donald Trump’s administration.⁴¹⁸⁵

On 14 February 2019, the United States proposed a reform of the World Trade Organization that would slash the number of countries that are eligible for “special and differential treatment,” a plan likely to be resisted by China, India and other countries.⁴¹⁸⁶

On 2 March 2019, the U.S. argued that it no longer makes sense for China to receive special World Trade Organization privileges that were originally designed to assist developing nations.⁴¹⁸⁷

United States has rejected the Appellate body reform proposal put forward by Ottawa group and backed by many WTO members. It also proposed its reform of the WTO. Thus, it receives a score of +1.

Analyst: Dmitriy Lukanin

European Union: +1

European Union has fully complied with the commitment on reforming the World Trade Organization (WTO).

On 6-7 December 2018, the European Union took part in the 2018 annual session of the parliamentary conference on the WTO. According to the outcome document published on 7 December 2018, the European Union claimed that it was a matter of urgency to proceed with discussing the ways and means of improving the WTO in the light of the latest developments and to review several aspects of the functioning of the WTO with a view to increasing both its effectiveness, transparency, and authority through the upholding of its core values and fundamental principles, and legitimacy.⁴¹⁸⁸

On 6-7 December 2018, as a result of the 2018 annual session of the parliamentary conference on the WTO, the outcome document was published by the European Parliament, stating that the EU urged all Members of the WTO to fully respect the rules of the WTO, while urgently seeking a solution for the dispute settlement body, for example through proposing transitional rules for

⁴¹⁸⁴ UK and Chile sign continuity agreement, UK Government (London) 30 January 2019. Access date: 20 March 2019. <https://www.gov.uk/government/news/uk-and-chile-sign-continuity-agreement>

⁴¹⁸⁵ The U.S. rejects EU’s WTO reformation plan, Bloomberg (London) 12 December 2018. Access Date: 1 April 2019. <https://www.bloomberg.com/news/articles/2018-12-12/u-s-rejects-the-eu-s-trade-reform-proposal-putting-wto-at-risk>

⁴¹⁸⁶ The U.S. propose a reform of WTO to halt handouts for big and rich states, Reuters (Washington) 14 February 2019. Access Date: 1 April 2019 <https://www.reuters.com/article/us-usa-trade-wto-idUSKCN1Q426T>

⁴¹⁸⁷ US takes aim at China’s status as a developing nation, Nikkei (Tokyo) 2 March 2019. Access Date: 1 May 2019. <https://asia.nikkei.com/Economy/Trade-war/US-takes-aim-at-China-s-status-as-a-developing-nation>

⁴¹⁸⁸ 2018 annual session of the parliamentary conference on the WTO “WTO: the way forward” – outcome document, the European Parliament (Brussels) 7 December 2018. Access date: 19 February 2019. http://www.europarl.europa.eu/cmsdata/158345/outcome_document-final-e.pdf.

outgoing members of the Appellate Body or maximum times allowed before the publication of a report, guaranteeing its independence while ensuring that rules remain within the rights and obligations of the Appellate Body.⁴¹⁸⁹ The EU called upon all Members of the WTO to urgently engage to address the impasse of the Dispute Settlement Body as this could fundamentally undermine the multilateral rule-based trading system.⁴¹⁹⁰

On 9 January 2019, the European Union, the USA and Japan held a trilateral meeting and issued a joint statement, in which they agreed to deepen their cooperation in areas including promoting WTO reform.⁴¹⁹¹ The three partners submitted a joint transparency and notification proposal to the Council for Trade in Goods the previous November with other co-sponsors, and the Ministers agreed to intensify engagement with other trading partners to advance this proposal. They confirmed their agreement to work towards strengthening the regular committees' activities. They also reiterated their call on advanced WTO Members claiming developing country status to undertake full commitments in ongoing and future WTO negotiations.⁴¹⁹²

On 10 April 2019, the 21st EU-China Summit issued a Joint Statement, in which the two sides reaffirmed their joint commitment to co-operate on WTO reform to ensure its continued relevance and allow it to address global trade challenges.⁴¹⁹³ To this end, both sides agreed to intensify the discussions with the aim of strengthening international rules on industrial subsidies, building on the work developed in the Joint EU-China working group on WTO reform. The two sides also welcomed the work so far in the EU-China Joint Working Group on WTO reform. The EU and China agreed to continue working to resolve the crisis in the WTO Appellate Body and build convergence on other areas of WTO reform.⁴¹⁹⁴

European Union supports the WTO reform in general and as a member of Ottawa Group and one of its leaders puts forward a reform proposal. Thus, it receives a score of +1.

Analyst: Karina Khasanova

⁴¹⁸⁹ 2018 annual session of the parliamentary conference on the WTO "WTO: the way forward" – outcome document, the European Parliament (Brussels) 7 December 2018. Access date: 19 February 2019. http://www.europarl.europa.eu/cmsdata/158345/outcome_document-final-e.pdf.

⁴¹⁹⁰ 2018 annual session of the parliamentary conference on the WTO "WTO: the way forward" – outcome document, the European Parliament (Brussels) 7 December 2018. Access date: 19 February 2019. http://www.europarl.europa.eu/cmsdata/158345/outcome_document-final-e.pdf.

⁴¹⁹¹ Joint Statement of the Trilateral Meeting of the Trade Ministers of the European Union, Japan and the United States, European Commission (Brussels) 9 January 2019. Access date: 19 February 2019. http://trade.ec.europa.eu/doclib/docs/2019/january/tradoc_157623.pdf.

⁴¹⁹² Joint Statement of the Trilateral Meeting of the Trade Ministers of the European Union, Japan and the United States, European Commission (Brussels) 9 January 2019. Access date: 19 February 2019. http://trade.ec.europa.eu/doclib/docs/2019/january/tradoc_157623.pdf.

⁴¹⁹³ Joint Statement of the 21st EU-China Summit, European External Action Service (Brussels) 10 April 2019. Access date: 29 April 2019. https://eeas.europa.eu/delegations/china_en/60836/Joint%20statement%20of%20the%2021st%20EU-China%20summit.

⁴¹⁹⁴ Joint Statement of the 21st EU-China Summit, European External Action Service (Brussels) 10 April 2019. Access date: 29 April 2019. https://eeas.europa.eu/delegations/china_en/60836/Joint%20statement%20of%20the%2021st%20EU-China%20summit.