



UNIVERSITY OF
TORONTO

**MUNK
SCHOOL
OF
GLOBAL
AFFAIRS**

Join the Global Conversation

The
G20 Research Group
at Trinity College at the Munk School of Global Affairs in the University of Toronto
with the
International Organisation Research Institute
at the National Research University Higher School of Economics, Moscow

present

2013 St. Petersburg G20 Summit Interim Compliance Report

7 September 2013 to 16 June 2014

Prepared by
Stacey Bocknek, Vera V. Gavrilova, Krystal Montpetit, Theodora Mladenova, Taylor Grott
and Antonia Tsapralis
G20 Research Group, Toronto,
and
Andrei Sakharov, Andrey Shelepov and Mark Rakhmangulov
International Organisations Research Institute, Moscow

18 September 2014

www.g20.utoronto.ca
g20@utoronto.ca

Contents

Preface.....	3
Introduction and Summary.....	5
Table 1: 2013 G20 St. Petersburg Summit Commitments Selected for Compliance Monitoring.....	7
Table 2: 2013 G20 St. Petersburg Interim Compliance Scores.....	9
Table 3: 2013 G20 St. Petersburg Summit Interim Compliance Rank by Country.....	10
Table 4: 2013 G20 St. Petersburg Summit Interim Compliance Rank by Commitment.....	10
Table 5: G20 Compliance by Member, 2008-2013.....	11
Appendix: General Considerations	13
1. Macroeconomics: Investment.....	15
2. Macroeconomics: Credit Access.....	40
3. Trade.....	60
4. Financial Regulation: Tax Avoidance	76
5. Food and Agriculture: Food Price Volatility and Sustainable Agriculture.....	94
6. Climate Change	141
7. Energy: Clean Technology	156
8. Labour and Employment: Labour Policies.....	179
9. Labour and Employment: Vocational Training Programs	227
10. Crime and Corruption.....	250
11. Development: Tax Administration	276
12. Employment: Job Creation	301
13. Employment: Education.....	323
14. Macroeconomic Policy: Small and Medium-Sized Enterprises	343
15. Development: Green Growth	360
16. Development: Remittances	378

9. Labour and Employment: Vocational Training Programs

“We are committed to creating vocational training programs.”

G20 St. Petersburg Leaders’ Declaration

Assessment

	Lack of Compliance	Partial Compliance	Full Compliance
Argentina			+1
Australia		0	
Brazil			+1
Canada			+1
China		0	
France			+1
Germany			+1
India			+1
Indonesia		0	
Italy			+1
Japan		0	
Korea		0	
Mexico		0	
Russia			+1
Saudi Arabia			+1
South Africa			+1
Turkey		0	
United Kingdom			+1
United States		0	
European Union			+1
Average		+0.60	

Background

The 2013 St. Petersburg Summit marked the first time that the Ministers of Labour were in attendance and active participation, attesting to the importance with which they viewed addressing unemployment challenges. This also represents the collaboration and coordination in labour, social, macroeconomic and financial policies.

Though there are variances across regions, jittery investors and employers have held back from hiring due to the continuously bleak economic outlook and insufficient policy responses. The job market has remained especially difficult for some segments of the population, such as youth and other vulnerable groups. The G20 members plan to improve these groups’ employability through job search assistance, work experience, and public employment programs, as well as hiring subsidies and conditional transfers as per country’s circumstances.

Commitment Features

The G20 members committed to creating apprenticeship and vocational training programmes to encourage hiring. The G20 governments plan to invest in people’s skills, education and continued learning to give them skill portability and better prospects, to facilitate mobility and enhance employability.

Where appropriate, these programs would find innovative ways to reduce non-wage labour costs, moving towards early intervention measures and effective job-search assistance for different groups of youth, and motivating youth entrepreneurship and business start-ups. Tailored strategies including

youth guarantee approaches, developing school and university curricula that support entrepreneurship, and facilitating exchange of best practices among the G20 members and the social partners are deemed crucial in this respect.

The target groups for these programs are youth, women, long-term unemployed, low skilled workers, single parents, people with disabilities and older workers.

Scoring Guidelines

-1	Member takes no active steps to create vocational training programs AND declares no intent to do so.
0	Member declares its intent to create vocational training programs for one or more of the defined target groups but does not begin doing so.
1	Member declares its intent to create vocational training programs AND begins creating them for one or more of the defined target groups.

Lead Analyst: Rui Kelly Li

Argentina: +1

Argentina has fully complied to its commitment to apprenticeship and vocational training programmes, particularly in regard to its efforts in the area of youth employment promotion and skills training.

In January 2014, President Kirchner announced the launch of a new federal program called “ProgresAr,” which will contribute ARS80 million towards youth employment and training. Under the program, Argentinian youth between the ages of 18 and 24 who are unemployed, have informal jobs, receive a salary below minimum wage, or who are not enrolled in higher education will receive a universal stipend of ARS600 per month.¹⁰⁸² In return, beneficiaries of the stipend must regularly attend classes to graduate from primary or secondary school, enroll in a university course or participate in another type of formal education or training. The ProgresAr program will reach 1.5 million eligible youth and also provide support for vocational training, counseling and job placement through Argentina’s Ministry of Labour and Employment.¹⁰⁸³

At the municipal level, the Government of the City of Buenos Aires provides over two thousand free vocational training courses each year in technical fields such as construction, auto mechanics, graphic design, plumbing and textile-related trades. These programmes garner over 60,000 participants each year and assist them with skills building, technical knowledge, social inclusion and digital literacy. The City of Buenos Aires also provides separate and more targeted vocational training programmes to youth over 16 years of age. These vocational training centres are implemented through the Ministry of Education with the aim of providing greater employment prospects by helping Argentinians to develop skills that will meet domestic employment demand. A special emphasis has also been placed on social inclusion for vulnerable and marginalized groups.¹⁰⁸⁴

¹⁰⁸² ProgresAr, El Nuevo Plan Del Gobierno Para Los Jóvenes 'ni-ni', La Nacion Argentina (Buenos Aires), 22 January 2014. Access Date: 23 March 2014. <http://www.lanacion.com.ar/1657619-progresar-el-nuevo-plan-del-gobierno-para-los-jovenes-ni-ni>

¹⁰⁸³ ANSES receives 106,000 applications to enter ‘Progresar’ program, Buenos Aires Herald (Buenos Aires), 30 January 2014. Date of Acces: 23 March 2014. <http://www.buenosairesherald.com/article/150972/anses-receives-106000-applications-to-enter-‘progresar’-program>

¹⁰⁸⁴ La Ciudad ofrece más de 3500 cursos gratuitos de capacitación laboral, City of Buenos Aires (Buenos Aires), 21 February 2014, Access Date: 23 March 2014. <http://www.buenosaires.gob.ar/noticias/cursos-gratuitos-de-capacitacion-laboral-para-los-jovenes>

Thus, Argentina has fully complied with its commitment of establishing and implementing vocational training at various levels of government, particularly in regard to youth unemployment. Through its various initiatives, Argentina is aiming to provide its population with the necessary education and skills to become engaged in the workforce. Argentina has thus, earned an overall score of +1.

Analyst: Stacey Bocknek

Australia: 0

However, Australia has only partially complied with its country-specific commitment to provide significant additional funding for schools.

In addition to the above commitment, Australia also committed to provide AUD14.3 billion in additional funding over seven years from 2012-13 to move to full implementation of a national disability insurance scheme by 1 July 2019, and significant additional school funding will be provided over the next four years to strengthen education.

The Australian Department of Education website mentions that the Australian government will “provide over \$14 billion to higher education.”¹⁰⁸⁵ The funding will be administrated through the Higher Education Support Act.

On 17 December 2013 the Australian government announced, “No further projects would be funded under the EIF Regional Priorities Round.”¹⁰⁸⁶ This announcement came after an assessment of “funding priorities as part of the Mid-Year Economic and Fiscal Outlook.” It is also mentioned that “the timing of any further Education Investment Fund funding rounds is yet to be determined and is a matter for Government.”

The Australian Department of Education has also promised AUD209 million for Round 5 of the Trades Skills Centres program.¹⁰⁸⁷ This funding would benefit 136 centres in more than 220 schools nationally, including Tasman District School.¹⁰⁸⁸

Australia has declared its intent to fund the creation of additional vocational training centres. Although Australia has also announced further funding for higher education, it has also announced the end of further funding under the Education Investment Fund for the foreseeable future.

Australia has been awarded a 0 for only partially adhering to its commitments.

Analyst: Andy Li

Brazil: +1

Brazil has fully complied with its commitment to invest in educating its labourers to enhance mobility and increase employability. Brazil has complied with its commitment to maintain scholarship programs for undergraduate students to encourage labour productivity.

¹⁰⁸⁵ Funding, Australian Government Department of Education, 26 November 2013. Access Date: 22 February 2014. <http://education.gov.au/funding>

¹⁰⁸⁶ Education Investment Fund, Australian Government Department of Education, 29 January 2014. Access Date: 22 February 2014. <http://education.gov.au/education-investment-fund>

¹⁰⁸⁷ Trade Training Centres in Schools Program, Australian Government Department of Education, 23 January 2014. Access Date: 22 February 2014. <http://education.gov.au/trade-training-centres-schools-program>

¹⁰⁸⁸ Tasman District School Gets New Trade Skills Centre, Eric Hutchinson MP, 31 January 2014. Access Date: 22 February 2014. <http://www.eric Hutchinson.com.au/wp-content/uploads/2014-01-31-money-for-new-trades-skills-centre-at-Tasman-District-School.pdf>

Brazil also committed to increase labour productivity nationwide through scholarship programs for undergraduate students, both domestically and abroad (101,000 students and researchers to attend high-level foreign universities by 2015 and USD3.3 billion in scholarships in 2013), and by means of the establishment of new institutions of higher education (four new public universities by 2018 and 208 new technical and vocational training centres by the end of 2014).

On 4 November 2013, Education Ministers from the BRICS — Brazil, Russia, India, China and South Africa — countries met and agreed to coordinate and collaborate at the higher education level. Issues discussed include “strengthening collaboration between BRICS universities, partnerships and knowledge exchanges on technical and vocational education and training.”¹⁰⁸⁹

On 22 October 2013, Angel Gurría, secretary general of the Organisation for Economic Co-operation and Development, made a speech at Brasilia, evaluating and congratulating Brazil’s progress in improving support for its youth. Her speech also launched the Investigating in Youth: Brazil report, which highlighted initiatives that have produced and continue to produce results. Advances mentioned include the “large increases in funding,”¹⁰⁹⁰ the increase in vocational training programs due to the PRONATEC program, and the aid provided to school drop-outs to help them acquire necessary workplace skills.¹⁰⁹¹

According to the government of Canada, the Brazilian government will “be implementing a national program to support access to technical and vocational training by vulnerable women.”¹⁰⁹² Programs developed through the Knowledge Exchange for Equity Program (KEEP) help women acquire skills in fields related to “tourism, food production and processing, crafts and design, and fisheries.”

Brazil has and plans to continue increasing labour productivity through funding undergraduate studies. It is anticipated that by 2015 over “10 million students will be in universities,” supported by federal loans given through government programs such as PROUNI and FIES. The “government’s Scientific Mobility Program” will continue to provide 101,000 scholarships to aid university students who wish to study at foreign universities.¹⁰⁹³

Although Brazil has not formally declared its intent to continue creating vocational training programs, Brazil has continued to maintain vocational training programs for the specified target groups. With regards to Brazil’s country specific commitments, Brazil has maintained its scholarship programs for tertiary level students. Brazil has received a +1 for complying with the stated commitments.

Analyst: Andy Li

¹⁰⁸⁹ BRICS ministers agree on high-level HE collaboration, University World News, 8 November 2013. Access Date: 21 February 2014. <http://www.universityworldnews.com/article.php?story=20131107163621596>

¹⁰⁹⁰ Brazil should continue efforts to boost education and improve young people’s job prospects, OECD, 22 October 2013. Access Date: 21 February 2014.

<http://www.oecd.org/education/brazilshouldcontinueeffortstoboosteducationandimproveyoungpeoplesjobprospects.htm>

¹⁰⁹¹ Brazil should continue efforts to boost education and improve young people’s job prospects, OECD, 22 October 2013. Access Date: 21 February 2014.

<http://www.oecd.org/education/brazilshouldcontinueeffortstoboosteducationandimproveyoungpeoplesjobprospects.htm>

¹⁰⁹² Brazil, Foreign Affairs, Trade and Development Canada (Ottawa) 6 September 2013. Access Date: 21 February 2014.

<http://www.acdi-cida.gc.ca/brazil>

¹⁰⁹³ Education and Training, Export.gov. Access Date: 22 February 2014.

http://export.gov/brazil/static/CC_BR_DoingBusiness_CCG_PDF_Chap4_EducationandTraining_Latest_eg_br_062843.pdf

Canada: +1

Canada has fully complied with its commitment to create vocational training programmes and has been working actively towards its implementation.

Canada also committed to fund businesses to train unemployed or underemployed people through the Canada Job Grant. When fully implemented in 2017-18, approximately 130,000 people will have access to training each year.¹⁰⁹⁴

Canada's progress was most evident on 11 February 2014, when Finance Minister Jim Flaherty tabled the budget. It contained the following initiatives:

- To help offset the apprenticeship costs of those registered in the Red Seal trades, it created the Canada Apprentice Loan to provide those individuals with interest-free loans of over CAD100 million.
- To support entrepreneurs, it invested CAD40 million into the Canada Accelerator and Incubator Program, which provides mentorship and other resources to help Canadians start and develop new businesses.¹⁰⁹⁵

Canada announced CAD26.4 million in funding over four years to help expand two training programs connecting youth and other working-age people with intellectual disabilities and employers. Of this funding, CAD15 million over three years is earmarked for the Canadian Association for Community Living's Ready, Willing and Able initiative.¹⁰⁹⁶

Recognizing the challenges faced by those with autism spectrum disorder, Canada set aside CAD11.4 million over four years to support their vocational training.¹⁰⁹⁷

Additionally, Canada introduced the Flexibility and Innovation in Apprenticeship Technical Training pilot project for apprentice technical training.¹⁰⁹⁸

Addressing the vulnerable seniors' employment difficulties, Canada invested CAD75 million in the Targeted Initiative for Older Workers to help them transition into the job market.¹⁰⁹⁹

¹⁰⁹⁴ St. Petersburg Leaders' Declaration, G20 Information Centre (Toronto) September 2013. Access Date: 1 February 2014. https://www.g20.org/sites/default/files/g20_resources/library/Saint_Petersburg_Declaration_ENG.pdf.

¹⁰⁹⁵ Connecting Canadians with available jobs, Government of Canada (Ottawa) February 2014. Access Date: 19 February 2014. <http://www.budget.gc.ca/2014/docs/plan/ch3-1-eng.html>

¹⁰⁹⁶ Job training for Canadians with intellectual disabilities gets boost in federal budget, Toronto Star (Toronto) 11 February 2014. Alex Boutilier and Joel Eastwood. Access Date: 19 February 2014. http://www.thestar.com/news/canada/2014/02/11/job_training_for_canadians_with_intellectual_disabilities_gets_boost_in_federal_budget.html

¹⁰⁹⁷ Job training for Canadians with intellectual disabilities gets boost in federal budget, Toronto Star (Toronto) 11 February 2014. Alex Boutilier and Joel Eastwood. Access Date: 19 February 2014. http://www.thestar.com/news/canada/2014/02/11/job_training_for_canadians_with_intellectual_disabilities_gets_boost_in_federal_budget.html

¹⁰⁹⁸ Connecting Canadians with available jobs, Government of Canada (Ottawa) February 2014. Access Date: 19 February 2014. <http://www.budget.gc.ca/2014/docs/plan/ch3-1-eng.html>

¹⁰⁹⁹ Building Canada one budget at a time: Brietkreuz, News Review (Yorkton) February 2014. Access Date: 19 February 2014. <http://www.yorktonnews.com/article/20140219/YORKTONNEWS0101/302199997/building-canada-one-budget-at-a-time-breitkreuz>

Canada adhered to its commitments at St. Petersburg by creating vocational training and apprenticeship programmes to help vulnerable groups such as youth, seniors and those with disabilities to participate in the labour force. Thus, for its efforts, Canada has been awarded the score of +1.

Analyst: Rui Kelly Li

China: 0

China has partially complied with its commitment to create vocational training programs.

On 26 February 2014, China's state council met to discuss deploying a modern vocational program. It was agreed that such a program will be necessary for China's future growth and economic development. The council agreed on measure to increase the autonomy of vocational schools, and to develop a talent cultivation mechanism. They also discussed how to attract non-governmental investment.¹¹⁰⁰

On 24 February 2014, Chinese officials met with Canadian education to discuss education collaboration between the two countries. Vocational training was among the subjects covered.¹¹⁰¹

By October 10th, 2013, the World Bank reported on it Guangdong Technical and Vocational Education and Training Project. The project's goal is improve vocational school policy development from learning innovations in technical schools. Progress was found to be satisfactory by the report.¹¹⁰²

Also in October 2013, China hosted the China International Education Cooperation and Innovation Expo.¹¹⁰³ On October 2nd, the Vocational Training Council started the new technology training scheme programme in Hong Kong. This would increase the technology and training for it previously unavailable in Hong Kong.¹¹⁰⁴

From September 2-5, 2013 China hosted a China-ASEAN Vocational Education Summit, where leaders discussed how to improve the quantity and quality of vocational education.¹¹⁰⁵ China continues to cooperate with the members of the Association of Southeast Asian Nations to develop vocational training to develop regional economic transformation.¹¹⁰⁶

Addressing the problems arising from the 2008 recession and increase the quality of its workforce, China has seen a great increase in technical and vocational training.¹¹⁰⁷ Employment services for young

¹¹⁰⁰ China plans modern vocational education, Asia Pacific Skills and Employability Network, (Beijing), 26 February 2014. Date Accessed: 3 March 2014. <http://apskills.ilo.org/news/china-plans-modern-vocational-education>

¹¹⁰¹ Third high-level consultation on education collaboration between the Provinces and Territories of Canada and the Ministry of Education, People's Republic of China, Canadian Intergovernmental Conference Secretariat, 24 February 2014. Accessed 4 March 2014. <http://www.scics.gc.ca/english/Conferences.asp?a=viewdocument&id=2140>

¹¹⁰² China - Guangdong Technical and Vocational Education and Training Project : P096707 - Implementation Status Results Report : Sequence 07, World Bank, (Guangdong), 23 October 2013. Access Date: 4 March 2014.

¹¹⁰³ 2013 China International Education Cooperation and Innovation Expo, Education Forum for Asia, http://www.asia-edu.org/en/NewsCenter_view.asp?classid=231&id=895

¹¹⁰⁴ New Technology Training Scheme, 2 October 2013. <http://www.dragon-star.eu/call/new-technology-training-scheme/>

¹¹⁰⁵ RCP at the 2013 China ASEAN Vocational Education Exhibition and Forum, Regional Cooperation Platform, (Shanghai), 8 October 2013 <http://rcp-platform.com/rcp-at-the-2013-china-asean-vocational-education-exhibition-and-forum/>

¹¹⁰⁶ China, ASEAN to develop vocational education, China Daily USA, (Washington DC), 5 September 2013. Date Accessed: 28 February 2014. http://usa.chinadaily.com.cn/china/2013-09/05/content_16947005.htm

¹¹⁰⁷ China: Vocational Education Matches Youth with Jobs and Helps Sustain Growth, The World Bank (New York), 17 February 2012. Date Accessed: 28 February 2014. <http://www.worldbank.org/en/news/feature/2012/02/17/china-vocational-education-provides-jobs-sustains-economic-growth>

graduates have been a focus in China, and they have significantly expanded training opportunities for workers facing adjustments.¹¹⁰⁸

There are still areas China needs to develop in regarding vocational training and employment. China's uneven development has left some training facilities in rural areas with limited resources.¹¹⁰⁹

Vocational school grads have also expressed discontent over an out of date curriculum, teachers with limited practical skills, and few clear minimum standards.¹¹¹⁰

China intends to follow G20 St. Petersburg Summit objectives to establish vocational programs and increase labour employment. It has already taken domestic policy measures to do so. However, the initiatives remain tentative at this point so China receives a compliance score of zero. Therefore, China is awarded a score of 0.

Analyst: Madeline Torrie

France: +1

France has fully complied with its commitment to create vocational training programs.

On 27 February 2014 France adopted a vocational training law intended to increase the number of apprentices in France by 500,000 per year. This law will also remove bureaucratic boundaries and non-wage costs to employment, while providing more mentorship to individual's skill training.¹¹¹¹ The bill would also provide support services for individuals through training and employee mentorship.

Boundaries to employment removed include the reform of current training contribution requirements. Companies were previously required to make payments towards three separate agencies totalling 0.9 per cent of their mass salary for the purpose of training.¹¹¹² This was replaced by a "duty to train" framework which has levels of contribution determinant on company size while ensuring that the funds collected go to only one source, the "Organisme paritaire collecteur agréé." Additionally, the proposed 24-hour minimum work week for part-time employees was temporarily suspended for six months.¹¹¹³

The Government of France has cited interest in continuing its "jobs of the future" program. On 25 October 2013 it published its 2014 target of creating 150,000 jobs for the future positions, a 50 per cent

¹¹⁰⁸ G20 Task Force on Employment: Addressing employment, labour market and social protection challenges in G20 countries: Key measures since 2010, International Labour Organisation (New York), 17 July 2013. Date Accessed: 28 February 2014. http://www.ilo.org/wcmsp5/groups/public/---dgreports/---dcomm/---publ/documents/publication/wcms_217544.pdf

¹¹⁰⁹ Vocational Education and Training in China Strengths, Challenges and Policy Options, OCED, June 2010. Date Accessed: 28 February 2014. <http://www.oecd.org/edu/skills-beyond-school/46144487.pdf>

¹¹¹⁰ China: Vocational Education Matches Youth with Jobs and Helps Sustain Growth, The World Bank (New York), 17 February 2012. Date Accessed: 28 February 2014. <http://www.worldbank.org/en/news/feature/2012/02/17/china-vocational-education-provides-jobs-sustains-economic-growth>

¹¹¹¹ Loi relative à la formation professionnelle, à l'emploi et à la démocratie sociale : une adoption expresse pour des réformes d'envergure, Ministère du Travail, de l'Emploi, de la Formation Professionnelle et du Dialogue Social (Paris) 27 February 2014. Access Date : 4 March 2014. http://www.doleta.gov/ETA_News_Releases/20132231.cfm

¹¹¹² Address by Minister Labour, Employment and Social Affairs Michel Sapin at the French National Assembly (Paris) 26 February 2014. Access Date 28 February 2014 <http://travail-emploi.gouv.fr/actualite-presse,42/discours,2142/discours-de-michel-sapin-projet-de,17558.html>

¹¹¹³ Formation professionnelle : la réforme définitivement adoptée, MYTF1 News. 27 February 2014. Access Date : 4 March 2014. <http://lci.tf1.fr/economie/entreprise/formation-professionnelle-la-reforme-definitivement-adoptee-8373981.html>

increase from its 2013 target.¹¹¹⁴ The program, which provides training for youth without postsecondary education, ended 2013 just shy of reaching its target.¹¹¹⁵

France has complied through both their recently passed vocational training law and continued success of its “jobs for the future” initiative.

Thus, France has been rewarded a score of +1 for its commitment to vocational training programs.

Analyst: Iain McCauley

Germany: + 1

Germany has fully complied with its commitment. It has both declared its intent to adhere to its commitment and followed through in creating and maintaining programs for the specified target groups.

In addition to the above commitment, Germany also committed to continue to implement its “Skilled Workers Strategy” to promote the availability of highly qualified workers through its immigration policy.

On 8 January 2014, German Federal Labour Minister Andrea Nahles made a press release reaffirming Germany’s commitment to aiding those with difficulties finding employment either due to insufficient qualifications or as a “result of having been without work for many years.”¹¹¹⁶

On 3 December 2013, the German Federal Ministry of Labour and Social Affairs reaffirmed its intent to “increase vocational training rates” through special initiatives such as the Perspective 50-plus program.¹¹¹⁷ The ministry will also lead in utilizing the European Social Fund to improve gender equality in the labour market as well as “create incentives for more part-time training” with particular focus on older or less skilled individuals.

On 1 November 2013, Germany made changes to their “Promotion of occupational mobility of interested in training young people and unemployed young professionals from Europe” program to increase vocational training support for youth in the EU. The program, “The Job of My Life,” now provides up to 16 weeks of German-language classes as well as up to 12 weeks of multi-language support during the preparatory training placement.¹¹¹⁸ Furthermore, the new guidelines provide support to aid youth with previous vocational training in finding placement in a similar field.

Germany has complied with its commitments, as it has maintained its vocational training programmes, many of which target the specific focus groups. Germany has been awarded a score of +1.

Analyst: Andy Li

¹¹¹⁴ Budget 2014: l’essentiel de l’effort de redressement repose sur des économies, View Publique. 20 February 2014. Access Date 4 March 2014. <http://www.vie-publique.fr/actualite/dossier/budget-2014/budget-2014-essentiel-effort-redressement-repose-economies.html>

¹¹¹⁵ Sapin: succès dans le dialogue social, revers sur l’emploi, Le Monde. 26 February 2014. Access Date : 4 March 2014. http://www.lemonde.fr/politique/article/2014/02/26/le-bilan-de-michel-sapin-succes-dans-le-dialogue-social-revers-sur-l-emploi_4373444_823448.html

¹¹¹⁶ “Create new opportunities on the labour market,” Federal Ministry of Labour and Social Affairs (Berlin) 8 January 2014. Access Date: 19 February 2014. <http://www.bmas.de/EN/Service/Press/press-releases/labour-market-figures-december-2013.html?nn=46168>

¹¹¹⁷ Initial and continuing training, Federal Ministry of Labour and Social Affairs (Berlin) 3 December 2013. Access Date: 18 February 2014. <http://www.bmas.de/EN/Our-Topics/Initial-and-Continuing-Training/start-initial-and-continuing-training.html?nn=45510>

¹¹¹⁸ Seit 1.11.2013 gibt’s was Neues, Bundesagentur für Arbeit (Berlin) 1 November 2013. Access Date: 18 February 2014. <http://www.thejobofmylife.de/de/neuigkeiten.html>

India: +1

India has fully complied with its commitment to create vocational training programs. India has increased expenditures for skill development, continued to provide support in its partnership with the National Skill Development Corporation (NSDC), and created stronger institutions to prevent non-wage labour costs through the National Skills Qualification Framework (NSQF).

In addition to the above commitment, India also committed to set a target that 50 million people will acquire necessary skills by 2017, including 9 million youth in 2013-14. In addition, the National Skill Development Corporation will set the curriculum and standards for training in different skills and provides monetary incentives for youths to acquire their skill certification for which budget provision of about USD1 billion is made for 2013-14.

On 17 February 2014 the Government of India released their interim budget for 2014-15. In this budget they allocated INR17.89 billion in new funding towards Social Security for Unorganized Workers and Skill Development.¹¹¹⁹

The budget provided further funding for the NSDC allowing to scale up its jobs training programme significantly.¹¹²⁰ The NSDC has provided training for 1,349,742 since 2011 and on 6 March 2014 announced that will have the capacity to train 75,000,000 in the next ten years.

On 19 December 2013 the Government of India passed the NSQF.¹¹²¹ This program is meant to simplify vocational training through the creation of a credit accumulation and transfer system integrated into existing programs that allows individuals to move more easily between education, vocational training and work. The program's intent is to minimize non-cost barriers vocational training that exist currently.

India has declared its intent to follow through on the commitment and begun to follow through on this commitment through its budget allocations, passage of NSQF and partnership with the NSDC. Thus, India has been rewarded a score of +1 for its commitment to vocational training programs.

Analyst: Iain McCauley

Indonesia: 0

Indonesia has partially complied with its commitment to creating vocational training programs. The government has stated its intention to create and reform vocational programs. Additionally, it has undertaken measures to facilitate mobility, enhance employability and create jobs. However, Indonesia has not implemented a comprehensive vocational training program for target groups such as youth, women, and low-skilled workers.

The Technical Vocational Education and Training (TVET) conference took place on 1-2 April 2014 in Jakarta. Several ministries — the Indonesian Ministry of Education and Culture, the Ministry of Manpower and Transmigration (MOMT), the Ministry of Industry, National Development and Planning Agency and the German Ministry for Economic Cooperation and Development — jointly agreed to host the conference in order to exchange good practices for technical and vocational

¹¹¹⁹ Expenditure Budget, Ministry of Finance (New Delhi) 17 February 2014. Access Date: 7 March 2014.

<http://indiabudget.nic.in/ub2014-15/eb/sbe62.pdf>

¹¹²⁰ Address by Minister of Finance Papaniappan Chidambaram at Parliament of India (New Delhi) 17 February 2014. Access Date: 7 March 2014. <http://indiabudget.nic.in/ub2014-15/bs/bs.pdf>

¹¹²¹ National Skills Qualifications Framework, Press Information Bureau (Mumbai) 19 December 2014. Access Date: 4 March 2014. <http://pib.nic.in/newsite/erelease.aspx?relid=102050>

education and training (TVET) while stimulating TVET networking within member countries of the Association of South East Asian Nations.¹¹²²

On 12 February 2014, Soekarwo was re-elected as East Java's governor. In his inauguration speech, Soekarwo promised to develop more vocation schools in order to reduce unemployment in the next five year. Additionally, he committed to strengthening East Java's economy by providing "assistance to businesses through cooperatives or community groups."¹¹²³

On 17 January 2014, Better Work Indonesia held a business forum with both MOMT and the recently established Social Security Agency. The forum intended to inform employers on amendments to social security and health insurance laws, enhancing communication among companies and other stakeholders (such as the government and labour unions) on employee rights.¹¹²⁴

In report published on 17 December 2013, the International Labour Organization (ILO) pointed out "limited linkages and synergies between various AMLPs [active labour market policies and programs]," while also noting limited connections between ALMP programs and the needs or demands of the labour market. They cite that ALMPs rarely identify youth as a beneficiary of such program. Additionally, the ALMPs are short term and do not link beneficiaries to job search facilities or other post-training support options. The lack of synergy limits the overall effectiveness of ALMP interventions.¹¹²⁵

On 16 December 2013, Indonesia's Minister of Finance, M. Chatib Basri stated the government is using a financial inclusion program to improve human resources' capacity and eliminate all forms of barriers for public access to financial services.¹¹²⁶

On 20 November 2013, Indonesia secured a USD400,000,000 development policy loan from the World Bank.¹¹²⁷ The main objective for the money was to "enhance Indonesia's capacity and institutions for reducing poverty and boosting shared prosperity." Specific goals included strengthening the public sector's fiscal stability, protecting the vulnerable by expanding social assistance, empowering communities to take charge of their development needs, enhancing skills and technology, and improving public financial management for improved service delivery. Examples of implementation

¹¹²² Ensuring TVET Quality, 10 January 2014. Access Date: 25 February 2014. <https://www.regional-tvet-conference-indonesia.org/en/article/67.ensuring-tvet-quality.html>

¹¹²³ Soekarwo inaugurated as E. Java governor, The Jakarta Post (Surabaya, East Java), 13 February 2014. Access Date: 29 February 2014. <http://www.thejakartapost.com/news/2014/02/13/soekarwo-inaugurated-e-java-governor.html>

¹¹²⁴ Enterprise Forum, Better Work Indonesia, 4 February 2014. Access Date: 25 February 2014. <http://betterwork.org/indonesia/?p=4622>

¹¹²⁵ Labour and social trends in Indonesia in 2013: Reinforcing the role of decent work in equitable growth, World Bank, 17 December 2013. Access Date: 21 February 2014. http://www.ilo.org/jakarta/whatwedo/publications/WCMS_233249/lang-en/index.htm

¹¹²⁶ Reducing Poverty and Boosting Growth with Financial Inclusion Program, Ministry of Finance (Jakarta), 16 December 2013. Access Date: 21 February 2013. <http://www.kemenkeu.go.id/en/Berita/reducing-poverty-and-boosting-growth-financial-inclusion-program>

¹¹²⁷ Official Documents- Loan Agreement, L8304-ID (Closing Package), World Bank (Washington, DC), 20 November 2013. Access Date: 21 February 2014. <http://documents.worldbank.org/curated/en/2013/11/18674831/official-documents--loan-agreement-l8304-id-closing-package>

would be subsidized fuel price increase and implementation of new national social security system (Sistem Jaminan Sosial Nasional).¹¹²⁸

On 13-14 November 2013, the Indonesian Coordinating Ministry for Economic Affairs, the MOMT, ILO, the National Development Planning Agency, the Indonesian Economy Council, and the Indonesian Employers Association jointly hosted the Indonesia Employment Forum. Stated objectives included: facilitating coordination among Indonesian stakeholders on current policy initiatives, formulating strategies for achieving inclusive economic growth, and following up on G20 commitments to promote job creation.¹¹²⁹

On 7 November 2013, MOMT Spokesman Suhartono said Indonesia's government was "currently preparing a job creation program" that "would include developing workforce skills through training, helping the workforce set up small and medium enterprises and carrying out an emergency job creation program."¹¹³⁰

On November 6, 2013, MOMT proposed building a cooperative framework with the Japan International Training Cooperation Organization in order to enhance advance training for technical intern trainees at vocational training facilities.¹¹³¹

On 26 October 2013 noted the Jakarta Education Agency signed an agreement to include retail management in the curriculum of vocational schools in the city. Jakarta's Deputy Governor stated this agreement was important in ensuring vocational graduate are qualified to work in modern stores.¹¹³²

Although Indonesia has expressed interest in creating more effective vocational training programs, it has not acted substantially on its declarations. In particular, the government has not taken visible steps to organize programs for target groups. As such, Indonesia has partially complied with its vocational training commitment and is award a score of 0.

Analyst: Victoria Wicks

Italy: +1

Italy has fully complied with its St. Petersburg Summit commitments in regards to labour and employment, specifically dealing with vocational training programs.

Italy is actively working towards a European Union wide initiative to make a Youth Guarantee in hopes of curbing the bleak youth employment market. Italy receives a score of 1 as it has also taken concrete measures to begin the elimination of the strong tax wedge present in the country, the second part of its commitment at the G20 Summit. This complicated scheme of business taxes hurt the local and international markets for Italian products and services.

¹¹²⁸ Second Institutional Strengthening for Social Inclusion (Second Institutional, Tax Administration, Social and Investment) Development Policy Loan Project. World Bank (Washington, DC), 21 October 2013. Access Date: 21 February 2014. <http://documents.worldbank.org/curated/en/2013/10/18459911/indonesia-second-institutional-strengthening-social-inclusion-second-institutional-tax-administration-social-investment-development-policy-loan-project>

¹¹²⁹ Indonesia Employment Forum, International Labour Organization, 13 – 14 November 2013. Access Date: 21 February 2014. http://www.ilo.org/jakarta/whatwedo/eventsandmeetings/WCMS_229967/lang--en/index.htm

¹¹³⁰ Economic slowdown drives up unemployment rate, The Jakarta Post (Jakarta), 7 November 2013. Access Date: 21 February 2014. <http://www.thejakartapost.com/news/2013/11/07/economic-slowdown-drives-unemployment-rate.html>

¹¹³¹ Regular Discussion Held with Indonesian Government Liaison. Access Date: 24 February 2014. http://www.jitco.or.jp/english/engagement_sending_out/indonesia/2013/1210/

¹¹³² Students to learn about retail management, The Jakarta Post (Jakarta), 26 October 2013. Access Date: <http://www.thejakartapost.com/news/2013/10/26/students-learn-about-retail-management.html>

On 15 January 2014, the European Union acknowledged it received Italy's Youth Guarantee Implementation Plan. With an allocation of EUR530.18 million to begin the process of instating such policies, Italy is expected to match those funds doled to them by the European Social Fund. Now, members will receive feedback in-order to ensure their plans are realistic and verified to succeed.¹¹³³

On 9 October 2013 the International Labour Office financed by the European Commission released a working paper title "Coping with the crisis in Italy: Employment relations and social dialogue amidst the recession." It praised Italy for its reactive economic policies in relation to the economic crisis which effected that country. It credited them with being "successful in retaining employment and demonstrated the ability to address challenges through social concentration."¹¹³⁴

In 2013, Ernst and Young published The EY G20 Entrepreneurship Barometer 2013 describing Italy's efforts to reduce the tax wedge present in that country. Businesses previously cited a complicated tax regime and regulatory system as key barriers to their success. Italy phased in tax incentives for businesses who hire young workers and began to simplify their tax and regulatory systems allowing for improvements in business start-up time.

Italy has taken the appropriate measures to comply with its commitment to create vocational and training programs. Therefore, Italy receives a score of +1.

Analyst: Max Stern

Japan: 0

Japan has partially complied with its commitment to create vocational training programs.

In addition to the above commitment, Japan also committed to implement labour reform measures, such as increasing the capacities of childcare services, to raise the employment rate of women (age 25-44) to 73 per cent by 2020.

While pledging measures to address youth unemployment and acknowledging the need for increased participation of women in the workforce, statistics show that in practical terms Japan is stagnating and has as yet to show progress towards compliance with its stated G20 goals.

Article 4-2 of the 1969 Human Resources Development Act states that the government and prefectures are responsible to "provide vocational training for workers who intend to change their jobs and other persons who need special assistance for the development and improvement of their vocational abilities."¹¹³⁵

For the fiscal year (FY) 2013, there were nationwide 261 facilities for such training, continuing what is overall a downward trend in the number of such facilities from 275 in FY 2008-2009, to 269 in FY 2009-2010, to 264 in FY 2010-2011 and 265 in 2011-2012.¹¹³⁶ The policy focuses mainly on youth unemployment, with most measures having as their goal addressing unemployment among the youth

¹¹³³ Press Release, European Commission (Brussels) 15 January 2014. Access Date: 7 March 2014. http://europa.eu/rapid/press-release_MEMO-14-13_en.htm

¹¹³⁴ "Coping with the crisis in Italy: Employment relations and social dialogue amidst the recession", International Labour Office (Geneva) 9 October 2014. Access Date: 7 March 2014. http://www.ilo.org/ifpdial/information-resources/publications/WCMS_223695/lang--en/index.htm

¹¹³⁵ Japan Ministry of Health, Labour and Welfare, Annual Health, Labour and Welfare Report 2012-2013. Access Date: 16 March 2014. <http://www.mhlw.go.jp/english/wp/wp-hw7/dl/06e.pdf>

¹¹³⁶ Based on reports for the years stated posted by the Japan Ministry of Health, Labour and Welfare. Access Date: 16 March 2014. <http://www.mhlw.go.jp/english/wp/>

demographic, working through existing institutions (“Hello Work,” the government’s Employment Service Centre) and expanding vocational training, notably among the so-called NEETs (“Not in Education, Employment, or Training”).¹¹³⁷

As of March 2014, there has been little change in the institutional resources available to persons with disabilities (e.g., vocational ability development schools numbers have stayed at 19 for five years), and few improvements for women in the workplace.¹¹³⁸ As the *Japan Times* sums up, based on World Economic Forum report, “Japan’s educated women continue to be underutilized,” even as the Prime Minister has pledged a target of 30 per cent of senior management positions to be filled by women by 2020.^{1139,1140,1141}

Japan has taken partial measures to comply with its commitment to create vocational and training programs. Therefore, Japan received a score of 0.

Analyst: Rui Kelly Li

Korea: 0

Korea has partially complied with its commitment to enhance labour participation of women and youth by continuously strengthening childcare support, launching an apprenticeship system and providing incentives for small and medium-sized enterprises (SMEs) to hire more young persons. It has reaffirmed its intention to introduce these measures, but have implemented them selectively.

In addition to the above commitment, Korea has also committed to enhance labour participation for women by enhancing childcare support and for youth by launching an apprenticeship system and providing incentives for SMEs to hire more young persons and increase the employment rate. This is part of an overall strategy to increase the employment rate from 64 per cent to 70 per cent by 2017.

On 19 December 2013, President Park Geun-hye introduced a more flexible system of working hours.¹¹⁴² This measure responds to the many Korean women who found it difficult to shoulder both workplace and child-caring responsibilities.

On 28 November 2013, the Korean Research Institute for Vocational Education and Training (KRIVET) hosted a seminar on labour mobility as part of the Global HR Forum 2013, during which it reaffirmed its intent to launch an apprenticeship system in response to youth unemployment and skills mismatch.¹¹⁴³

¹¹³⁷ Japan Ministry of Health, Labour and Welfare, Annual Health, Labour and Welfare Report 2012-2013. Access Date: 16 March 2014. <http://www.mhlw.go.jp/english/wp/wp-hw7/dl/05e.pdf>

¹¹³⁸ Based on reports for the years stated posted by the Japan Ministry of Health, Labour and Welfare. Access Date: 16 March 2014. <http://www.mhlw.go.jp/english/wp/>

¹¹³⁹ World Economic Forum, "The Global Gender Gap Report" (WEF_GenderGap_Report_2013.pdf). Access Date: March 16, 2014. <http://www.weforum.org/reports/global-gender-gap-report-2013>

¹¹⁴⁰ Education in 2013: an ‘A’ for ambition, but Japan will have to do better, The Japan Times, 29 December 2013. Teru Clavel. Access Date: 16 March 2014. <http://www.japantimes.co.jp/community/2013/12/29/issues/education-in-2013-an-a-for-ambition-but-japan-will-have-to-do-better/>

¹¹⁴¹ "Japan will implement labour reform measures, such as increasing the capacities of childcare services, to raise the employment rate of women (age 25-44) to 73% by 2020." St. Petersburg Action Plan. Access Date: March 16, 2014. <http://www.oecd.org/g20/meetings/saint-petersburg/St-Petersburg-Action-Plan.pdf>

¹¹⁴² S. Korea’s unemployment rate rises, China Daily (Beijing) December 2013. Access Date: 11 March 2014. http://usa.chinadaily.com.cn/world/2013-12/19/content_17184451.htm.

¹¹⁴³ Cedefop presents European VET in South Korea, European Centre for the Development of Educational Training (Seoul) November 2013. Access Date: 11 March 2014. <http://www.cedefop.europa.eu/EN/news/22145.aspx>.

Korea has taken partial measures to comply with its commitment to create vocational and training programs. Therefore, Korea receives a score of 0.

Analyst: Rui Kelly Li

Mexico: 0

Mexico has partially complied with its St. Petersburg Summit commitments in regards to labour and employment, specifically dealing with vocational training programs. It has made specific commitments towards legislating a labour reform bill which would work towards labour flexibility and efficiency, however, no movement towards these efforts can be found. Thus, it receives a score of 0.

On 29 November 2012, the Mexican legislature passed a labour reform bill in hopes of improving working conditions and dealing with issues of: wage payments, employment contracts and temporary employment, discrimination, outsourcing, termination and back wages, productivity and training, and union elections and transparency. All of these issues remain part of Mexico's commitments after the G20 Summit in St. Petersburg. Mexico's first labour law was enacted in 1931 and this is one of two significant updates to it since that time. Though the bill became effective on 1 December 2012, its content was diluted in-order to pass it through the legislature. Labour reform still is a pressing issue the government is trying to address.¹¹⁴⁴

Mexico has taken partial measures to comply with its commitment to create vocational and training programs. Therefore, Mexico receives a score of 0.

Analyst: Max Stern

Russia: +1

Russia has fully complied with the commitment on vocational training programs.

On 15 April 2014, the Russian government updated the State Program on Promotion of Employment, which includes the Development of the Labour Market Institutions subprogram. It creates conditions for increasing quality of labour force and its professional mobility development and improves labour conditions. The subprogram provides for the development of vocational training and professional mobility through training and skills improvement and the improvement of the national system of professional qualifications. RUB18.9 billion will be allocated in 2013-2020.¹¹⁴⁵

On 16 April 2014, Russian President Vladimir Putin signed an executive order creating the Presidential National Council for Professional Qualifications. The council will work on "issues pertaining to creating and developing in Russia a system of professional qualifications."¹¹⁴⁶ It will coordinate the work of state authorities, organizations of employers, trade unions, civil society organizations, educational and scientific organizations in the sphere of professional education and training.¹¹⁴⁷

¹¹⁴⁴ "Mexican Federal Labor Law Reform: Opportunities And Challenges For Employers With Operations In México", Mondaq: Connecting People and Knowledge (London, New York City, Sydney) 8 January 2013. Access Date: 7 March 2014. <http://www.mondaq.com/x/215108/Contract+of+Employment/Mexican+Federal+Labor+Law+Reform+Opportunities+And+Challenges+For+Employers+With+Operations+In+Mxico>

¹¹⁴⁵ Government Resolution No. 298 of 15 April 2014, Russian Ministry of Labour and Social Protection 29 April 2014. <http://www.rosmintrud.ru/docs/government/134>.

¹¹⁴⁶ Presidential National Council for Professional Qualifications created, President of Russia 16 April 2014. <http://eng.kremlin.ru/acts/7032>.

¹¹⁴⁷ Statute of the Presidential National Council for Professional Qualifications, President of Russia 16 April 2014. <http://state.kremlin.ru/council/39/statute>.

To increase employment among women on leave for child care, Russia has introduced additional vocational training measures and other support measures. RUB153.1 million and RUB161.2 million are allocated for training of 12,700 and 13,100 women in 2014 and 2015 respectively.¹¹⁴⁸

Russia has taken actions to demonstrate its intent to comply the commitment and create vocational training programs for target groups. Thus, it has been awarded a score of +1.

Analyst: Mark Rakhmangulov

Saudi Arabia: +1

Saudi Arabia has fully complied with the Vocational Programmes Commitment by instituting apprenticeship and vocational training programmes that facilitate better prospects and enhance employability, with a focus on specific target groups.

On 7 March 2014 the Saudi Industrial Property Authority launched a project to establish an “industrial city for women workers” located in Yanbu.¹¹⁴⁹ Initially, this will create 50 jobs for women. The purpose of this venture is to support the target group of women in industry, and will include technical training institutes for women. Currently 2,000 plants are under construction.

On 25 February 2014 Canada’s Niagara College won a bid to operate 26 vocational and technical training institutions in Saudi Arabia. The current focus of the colleges is to exclusively train young, male students. The college is exploring possibilities of including female students.¹¹⁵⁰

On 28 February 2014 a Saudi Petroleum Services Polytechnic (SPSP) Construction and Drilling Training Centre was launched in Dammam. The SPSP institutions provide vocational training specific to petroleum industries.¹¹⁵¹

On 11 November 2013 the Technical and Vocational Training Corporation (TVTC) announced a skills and training program being implemented for approximately 450,000 trainees across 300 vocational training facilities. Training in technical skills including automotive, plastics, energy, electricity and similar occupations will be offered. The centres are expected to be operational within three years.¹¹⁵²

Saudi Arabia has implemented training facilities, vocational programmes and is working to enhance the employability of women, a target group. Additional vocational programs are in progress. Thus Saudi Arabia has been awarded a score of +1.

Analyst: Alison Dillman

South Africa: +1

South Africa has fully complied with the commitment to support and implement quality vocational training programs in order to provide for a more skilled citizenry, particularly among youth.

¹¹⁴⁸ On the training of women on leave for childcare purposes, Russian Government 11 May 2014. <http://government.ru/orders/12269>.

¹¹⁴⁹ Women-only industrial city to operate soon in Yanbu, Arab News, 7 March 2014. Date Accessed: 7 March 2014. <http://www.arabnews.com/news/536216>

¹¹⁵⁰ College’s Taif classes for men only, St. Catharine’s Standard, 25 February 2014. Date Accessed: 4 March 2014. <http://www.stcatharinesstandard.ca/2014/02/25/colleges-taif-classes-for-men-only>

¹¹⁵¹ Polytechnic to build skills for petroleum services industry, Arab News, 28 February 2014. Date Accessed: 4 March 2014. <http://www.arabnews.com/news/532351>

¹¹⁵² 450,000 Saudis to be trained, Arab News, 12 November 2013. Date Accessed: 4 March 2014. <http://www.arabnews.com/news/476171>

In addition to the above commitment, South Africa also committed to build two new public universities, starting in 2013.

Rob Davies, Minister of Trade and Finance, introduced the Itukise Internship Program for Unemployed Graduates at the Cape Peninsula University of Technology in Cape Town, South Africa.¹¹⁵³ Implementation of the ZAR71 million program will commence on 1 April 2014. Davies states that, “the development of skills and the creation of opportunities for youth and graduates, will go a long way in reducing the levels of poverty and unemployment in South Africa.” He expressed the government’s objective to create opportunities for youth, while encouraging cooperation from the private sector. The Itukise program is also focused on marketing the manufacturing sector to young adults, and will enable labour force training, and learning “on and off the job.”

On 16 January 2014, Minister of Higher Education B.E. Nzimande discussed the expansion of post-school education and training in his speech given at the launch of the White Paper for Post School Education and Training. Nzimande addressed training as it relates to adequate training facilities, and in the context of the variety of courses offered. Nzimande acknowledged the importance of education and training not only for the purpose of economic growth, but also for “the achievement of greater social justice,” through equal access to quality education across the diverse population.¹¹⁵⁴

The White Paper for Post-School Education will provide training and learning opportunities, especially for youth and adults who have no access to formal education. Nzimande said that the post-school system “will be responsive to the needs of individual citizens and employers in the public and private sectors, as well as serving broader developmental objectives.”¹¹⁵⁵ Emphasis will be on technical and vocational education, so an expansion of technical and vocational education training (TVET) colleges is necessary. The need for consistent monitoring of education quality is addressed, as is cooperation between vocational training and community colleges, universities, employers, and employees for better coherence, and improved quality among educational and training programs. Financial aid for the underprivileged is also prioritized. The White Paper introduces the goal of establishing at least one institution offering education and vocational training within every district by 2030.

The Government of South Africa has been consistent in its efforts to increase and sustain economic development through its support of technical and vocational training.¹¹⁵⁶ On 14 May 2012, Nzimande hosted a round table conference on the importance of TVET. He acknowledged that further development requires substantial “growth of technical and vocational skills among workers.”¹¹⁵⁷ He expressed that, “the quest for decent work in South Africa will only be possible and sustainable if we develop a skilled workforce. This will strengthen the working class and make workers less expendable and more central to further economic development.” He further discussed future transformation of

¹¹⁵³ Skills Development is Vital in Reducing Youth Unemployment – Minister Davies, South Africa Government Online (Pretoria) 04 March 2014. Access Date: 25 February 2014 <http://www.gov.za/speeches/view.php?sid=44130>

¹¹⁵⁴ Speech by the Minister of Higher Education and Training Education, MP, Dr B.E. Nzimande at the Launch of the White Paper for Post School Education and Training, South Africa Government Online (Pretoria) 16 January 2014. Access Date: 20 February 2014 <http://www.gov.za/speeches/view.php?sid=43020>

¹¹⁵⁵ Speech by the Minister of Higher Education and Training Education, MP, Dr B.E. Nzimande at the Launch of the White Paper for Post School Education and Training, South Africa Government Online (Pretoria) 16 January 2014. Access Date: 20 February 2014 <http://www.gov.za/speeches/view.php?sid=43020>

¹¹⁵⁶ Minister Nzimande Chairing International Discussion on role of Technical and Vocational Education and Training, South Africa Government Online (Shanghai) 14 May 2012. Access Date: 20 February 2014 <http://www.gov.za/speeches/view.php?sid=27337&tid=67763>

¹¹⁵⁷ Minister Nzimande Chairing International Discussion on role of Technical and Vocational Education and Training, South Africa Government Online (Shanghai) 14 May 2012. Access Date: 20 February 2014. <http://www.gov.za/speeches/view.php?sid=27337&tid=67763>

informal economies to formal economies through further government assistance, and the implementation of training programs.

South Africa's recent efforts reflect its commitment to the growth and improvement of vocational training programs. South Africa has consistently supported the training of youth in the past, and is taking further steps in promoting the education and training of both youth and adults who lack access to tertiary education.

Thus, South Africa receives a score of +1 for full compliance.

Analyst: Kertia Johnson

Turkey: 0

Turkey has partially complied with its commitment to create vocational training programs.

On 14 February 2014, the General Directorate of the Turkish International Cooperation and Coordination Agency signed the "Cooperation in Vocational and Technical Education Protocol."¹¹⁵⁸ The Protocol will allow the Turkish government and the Turkish International Cooperation and Coordination Agency to work together to develop applications, curriculum and practices associated with the provisions of new technologies and knowledge sharing practices for vocational and technical education systems.

On 27 January 2014, the Ministry of National Education Associate Director General of Technical and Vocational Education, Omar Acikgoz and Cooks and Pastry Federation President Umit Yuksel signed the Protocol on Cooperation in Education.¹¹⁵⁹ The Protocol will allow the directors of schools and institutions working in the food and beverages service area to develop teacher competence in the area, update current programs, Turkish cuisine related joint work executions, increase students adequacy to employed in the sector, and developing competency certification.

On 6 November 2013, Gokhan Cetinsaya, President of the Council of Higher Education (YOK), announced Turkey's first academic freedom declaration.¹¹⁶⁰ The declaration includes nine articles that relate to the academic freedom of faculty members and students. This is a major steps as the YOK had previously been known for its rigid and authoritarian policies such as banning headscarves on campuses, which forced some students to drop out of school and its so called "coefficient" system that limited students learning opportunities from vocational and religious schools.

On 1-3 November 2013, during the Turkish Government's Consultation and Evaluations meeting, Prime Minister announced his determination to close down private tutoring schools known as "dershane"

¹¹⁵⁸ General Directorate of the Turkish International Cooperation and Coordination Agency "Cooperation in Vocational and Technical Education" Protocol was signed, Republic of Turkey Ministry of National Education (Ankara) 14 February 2014. Date of Access: 10 May 2014. <http://mtegm.meb.gov.tr/www/genel-mudurlugumuz-ile-turk-isbirligi-ve-koordinasyon-ajansi-baskanligi-arasinda-mesleki-ve-teknik-egitimde-isbirligi-protokolu-imzalandi/icerik/574>.

¹¹⁵⁹ With the Directorate General of Technical and Vocational Education and Pastry Cooks Federation between the "Protocol on Cooperation in Education" was signed, Republic of Turkey Ministry of National Education (Ankara) 28 January 2014. Access Date: 10 May 2014. <http://mtegm.meb.gov.tr/www/mesleki-ve-teknik-egitim-genel-mudurlugu-ile-ascilar-ve-pastacilar-federasyonu-aspafed-arasinda-egitimde-is-birligi-protokolu-imzalandi/icerik/564>.

¹¹⁶⁰ Turkey's First Academic Freedom Declaration, Hurriyet Daily News (Ipek Coskun) 11 November 2014. Access Date: 10 May 2014. <http://www.hurriyetdailynews.com/turkeys-first-academic-freedom-declaration.aspx?pageID=238&nID=57702&NewsCatID=396>.

in Turkish, suggesting that such schools violate the principle of equal opportunity in education.¹¹⁶¹ Education Minister Nabi Avci announced that during the 2014-2015 academic year no dershanes will be present in the education system.¹¹⁶² Recip Tayyip Erdogan also suggested that employing the teachers who lose their jobs after the closure of the dershanes in public schools.

In May 2012, the Improving the Quality of Vocational Education and Training in Turkey (METEK) Project was launched in collaboration with the European Union.¹¹⁶³ The objective of this project is to realize the multi-dimensional activities under the title of “Quality Education and Communication” in order to reach a qualified, measurable, and sustainable vocational and technical education system which would meet the needs of the business world and students. The project is set to run until May 2014. Below are a variety of activities that have taken place to improve vocational training in Turkey during the compliance cycle.¹¹⁶⁴

From 10 to 18 April 2013, several informational seminars were held on “Vocational Guidance and Career Counseling” and “Vocational Guidance for Disadvantages Groups” in several cities in the province of Gaziantep.¹¹⁶⁵ Seminar participants had the opportunity to partake in a variety of sessions including; career counselor roles and competencies, career counseling paradigm shifts and results, professional development process and stages of career development processes that affect the internal and external factors and theories of career counselling.

On 6-7 March 2014, a national conference was held with the aim of discussing the problems and solutions regarding the structure of the post-secondary schools, quality of education and transition process from education to employment.¹¹⁶⁶

Between 17 and 21 February 2013 a Teacher Training on Vocational Counselling and Career Guidance seminar was held in Rize Dedeman Otel.¹¹⁶⁷ The training participants consisted of a total of 107 staff, including 102 teachers and academics from primary and secondary as well as post-secondary educational

¹¹⁶¹ Turkish government determined to close private tutoring schools, Hurriyet Daily News (Ankara) 5 November 2015. Access Date: 10 May 2014. <http://www.hurriyetdailynews.com/turkish-government-determined-to-close-private-tutoring-schools.aspx?PageID=238&NID=57375&NewsCatID=338>.

¹¹⁶² Turkish government determined to close private tutoring schools, Hurriyet Daily News (Ankara) 5 November 2015. Access Date: 10 May 2014. <http://www.hurriyetdailynews.com/turkish-government-determined-to-close-private-tutoring-schools.aspx?PageID=238&NID=57375&NewsCatID=338>.

¹¹⁶³ Project, METEK Project (Ankara) Access Date: 10 May 2014. <http://metek.meb.gov.tr/index.php/en/project>.

¹¹⁶⁴ Turkish government determined to close private tutoring schools, Hurriyet Daily News (Ankara) 5 November 2015. Access Date: 10 May 2014. <http://www.hurriyetdailynews.com/turkish-government-determined-to-close-private-tutoring-schools.aspx?PageID=238&NID=57375&NewsCatID=338>.

¹¹⁶⁵ METEK Project “Vocational Guidance and Career Counseling” and “Vocational Guidance for disadvantages groups” informational seminars Coru, Sivas, Pain, and was held in Gaziantep, METEK Project (Gzaiantep) 21 April 2014. Access Date 10 May 2014. <http://metek.meb.gov.tr/index.php/en/press-room/news/446-metek-projesi-mesleki-rehberlik-ve-kariyer-danismanligi-ve-dezavantajli-gruplara-yonelik-mesleki-rehberlik-konulu-bilgilendirme-seminerleri-corum-sivas-agri-ve-gaziantep-te-gerceklestirildi>.

¹¹⁶⁶ Post-Secondary Education School Discussed “Quality” in Education and Training, METEK Project (Corum) 10 March 2014. Access Date 10 May 2014. <http://metek.meb.gov.tr/index.php/en/press-room/news/397-post-secondary-education-schools-discussed-quality-in-education-and-training>.

¹¹⁶⁷ METEK Project “Teacher Training on Vocational Counseling and Career Guidance” Completed in Rize Dedemen Otel, METEK Project (Rize) 20 February 2013. Access Date: 11 May 2014. <http://metek.meb.gov.tr/index.php/en/press-room/news/368-metek-project-teacher-training-on-vocational-counselling-and-career-guidance-completed-in-rize-dedeman-otel>.

institutions, and representatives from the Ministry of National Education.¹¹⁶⁸ The training seminar informed participants of the new transformations in business life, labour market, the factors affecting choice of profession, theories of career guidance, assessment and evaluation techniques, career management competence, and job-seeking techniques.

On 17 December 2013, the International Conference on “Building Mutual Trust Between the Labour Market and Vocational Education and Training” was held in Istanbul.¹¹⁶⁹ The objective of the conference was to create mutual trust between the labour market and vocational education by drawing attention to the quality system in vocational education and training. During the conference a variety of panels were held include; Employer’s View on Vocation and Technical Education and Training, Quality-Oriented Vocational Education and Training, Key Actors in VET: Teachers, and Improving the Quality of Students to Meet the Needs of Qualified Graduates.

On 30 September 2013, the Republic of Turkey and the European Union, funded by the Ministry of Education and Labour and Social Security and the Ministry of Human Resources Development Operational Programme carried out a Vocational and Technical Education Quality Improvement Project on Career Guidance and Career Counseling Education.¹¹⁷⁰ The programme involved ten curriculum development workshops that were held in Gaziantep and had 110 educational institutions participating.

On 6 September 2013, Turkey and the European Union, funded by Ministry of Education and Labour and Social Security Ministry of Human Resources Development Operational Programme, carried out in partnership a Vocational and Technical Education Quality Improvement Project.¹¹⁷¹ The project will create nine curriculum development workshops in Mardin. The workshops under the Ministry of Education will include 57 area teachers from secondary institutions, 78 academics, as well as public, private and civil society organizations, and two industry representatives.

Although Turkey has take many steps to through its Improving the Quality of Vocational Education (METEK) Project and other initiatives, its programs have not be targeted towards vulnerable groups. Turkey has been awarded a score of 0 for partial compliance.

Analyst: Antonia Tsapralis

United Kingdom: +1

The United Kingdom has fully complied with the commitment to creating an educated workforce through vocational education and training programs. Consistent efforts have been made to improve

¹¹⁶⁸ METEK Project “Teacher Training on Vocational Counseling and Career Guidance” Completed in Rize Dedemen Otel, METEK Project (Rize) 20 February 2013. Access Date: 11 May 2014. <http://metek.meb.gov.tr/index.php/en/press-room/news/368-metek-project-teacher-training-on-vocational-counselling-and-career-guidance-completed-in-rize-dedemen-otel>.

¹¹⁶⁹ International Conference on “Building Mutual Trust Between the Labour Market and Vocational Education” held in Istanbul, METEK Project (Istanbul) 17 December 2013. Access Date: 10 May 2014. <http://metek.meb.gov.tr/index.php/en/press-room/news/315-international-conference-on-building-mutual-trust-between-the-labour-market-and-vocational-education-held-in-istanbul>.

¹¹⁷⁰ METEK Career Guidance and Career Counseling Project Training and Curriculum Development Workshop 10 Hotels in Gaziantep was held in Tugcan, METEK Project (Tugcan) 30 September 2013. Access Date 10 May 2014. <http://metek.meb.gov.tr/index.php/en/press-room/news/243-metek-projesi-mesleki-rehberlik-ve-kariyer-danismanligi-egitimi-ile-10-mufredat-gelistirme-calistayi-gaziantep-tugcan-otel-de-yapildi>.

¹¹⁷¹ METEK Projesi Dokuzuncu Müfredat Geliştirme Çalıştayı Mardin’de Yapıldı. 6 September 2014. Access Date: 10 May 2014. <http://metek.meb.gov.tr/index.php/en/training-performed-activities/234-metek-projesi-dokuzuncu-mufredat-gelistirme-calistayi-mardin-de-yapildi>. (Accessed using Google Translate.)

technical education and funding has been allocated to this endeavor. Much attention has been given to reform the vocational education system, through the implementation of policies, and consistent cooperation with corporate enterprises.

Skills Minister Matthew Hancock spoke on technical and vocational training on 28 January 2014. Minister Hancock addresses the 1944 Butler Education Act, and the importance of “equal prestige for vocational and academic routes.”¹¹⁷² Hancock expressed the need for a refocusing on the vocational system in order to increase the prospect of success for youth. He outlines key focus areas such as the responsiveness of the system and better standards for apprenticeships. Efforts are focused on a variety of industries including the food, finance and aerospace industries. Hancock calls for an increase in standards, which will allow for an equally valued vocational education system as compared to academic education.

Efforts made towards this achievement includes the introduction of new fields of study, while encouraging 16 to 18 year olds to choose programs and acquire qualifications that will lead to employment. Meanwhile, traineeships and extended work experience allows for a better integration into the workforce.¹¹⁷³ He further addresses “reforming qualifications to meet employers’ needs,” and the commitment to fund the education and training for every child up to the age of 18. So far, over GBP7 billion has been spent on the education and training for 16 and 17 year olds within this year. Further planning is underway for new facilities in order to provide advanced training, such as the GBP18 million engineering facility investment.

A total of GBP238 million has been made accessible to multiple companies within the UK, through government funding. Corporations have also collaborated with government initiative to fund vocational training.¹¹⁷⁴ The pilot program will “[deliver] training for young people in low employment areas,” thus providing for the appropriate skills suitable for a variety of industries.¹¹⁷⁵ On 11 September 2013, Secretary of State for Business Innovation and Skills, Vince Cable addressed the Employer Ownership Pilot Round Two, and its contribution to this initiative. The Industrial Strategy comprises of eleven sectors, including the manufacturing, construction, automotive, and transport sectors.¹¹⁷⁶

The UK government has implemented policy for the improvement of the Further Education system. It is concerned with the supplience of quality education and vocational training, and “creating the skilled

¹¹⁷² The Skills Summit: Importance of Technical and Vocational Training, Government UK Department for Business, Innovation & Skills and Department for Education (London) 28 January 2014. Access Date: 20 February 2014.

¹¹⁷³ The Skills Summit: Importance of Technical and Vocational Training, Government UK Department for Business, Innovation & Skills and Department for Education (London) 28 January 2014. Access Date: 20 February 2014.

¹¹⁷⁴ Millions in Government Funding Made Available to Target Industrial Strategy Skills Training, Government UK, Department for Business, Innovation and Skills (London) 9 September 2013. Access Date: 18 February 2014. <https://www.gov.uk/government/news/millions-in-government-funding-made-available-to-target-industrial-strategy-skills-training>

¹¹⁷⁵ North East Companies to Play Key Role in Skills Training with Millions of Government Investment, BIS Press Office, Department for Business, Innovation and Skills (London) 09 September 2013. Access Date: 18 February 2014 <http://news.bis.gov.uk/Press-Releases/North-East-companies-to-play-key-role-in-skills-training-with-millions-of-government-investment-692be.aspx>

¹¹⁷⁶ North East Companies to Play Key Role in Skills Training with Millions of Government Investment, BIS Press Office, Department for Business, Innovation and Skills (London) 09 September 2013. Access Date: 18 February 2014 <http://news.bis.gov.uk/Press-Releases/North-East-companies-to-play-key-role-in-skills-training-with-millions-of-government-investment-692be.aspx>

workforce employers need.”¹¹⁷⁷ Key areas of focus include but are not limited to the improvement of apprenticeships, introducing a new funding system, implementing a new traineeship programme, and introducing a Technical Baccalaureate allowing for high quality vocational qualifications. Between 12 September and 20 November 2013, consultations were held on improving the quality of further education and training, while cooperating with students, parents and education providers.¹¹⁷⁸

The UK government has allocated funds have been allocated to technical/vocational training programs and facilities. The UK government has also taken significant steps towards the improvement of this educational system through a variety of reforms and policies, as well as through the encouragement of the private sector, students and parents to play an active role in restructuring and enhancing the vocational training system.

Therefore, the United Kingdom is given a +1 for compliance.

Analyst: Kertia Johnson

United States: 0

The United States has partially complied with its commitment to creating vocational programs.

US President Barack Obama has included funding for jobs training in his 2014 budget proposal but the Speaker of the House of Representatives, John Boehner, has indicated that Obama’s budget will not be approved. The US has implemented new vocational training pilot programs and small scale programs but has not provided a clear nation strategy.

In addition to the above commitment, the United States has committed to enhance the growth potential of the economy and continue to make progress on the recovery of the labour market, in particular for the long-term unemployed, by investing in the training and skills of the United States workers.

On 4 March 2014 Obama provided within his budget request USD7.7 billion in spending on apprenticeships, and job training.¹¹⁷⁹ This proposal would seek to double the number of apprenticeships in the U.S. and provide a summer jobs program for low-income youth. The program would train 1 million people who have been out of work for six months or more. Boehner’s statement of displeasure with Obama’s proposal suggests that the bill will not pass the house floor.¹¹⁸⁰

In January 2014 Vice President Joe Biden was tasked to review federal job training. The review will seek to ensure that job training programs will be more responsive to market demands.¹¹⁸¹ On 23 December 2013 the US Department of Labour launched the “Self-Employment Training pilot program” in Los

¹¹⁷⁷ Improving the Quality of Further Education and Skills Training, Government UK, Department for Business, Innovation and Skills and Department for Education (London) 06 November 2013. Access Date: 18 February 2014
<https://www.gov.uk/government/policies/improving-the-quality-of-further-education-and-skills-training>

¹¹⁷⁸ Improving the Quality of Further Education and Skills Training, Government UK, Department for Business, Innovation and Skills and Department for Education (London) 06 November 2013. Access Date: 18 February 2014
<https://www.gov.uk/government/policies/improving-the-quality-of-further-education-and-skills-training>

¹¹⁷⁹ Obama budget would spend big on job training, Reuters (Washington) 4 March 2014. Access Date: 5 March 2014.
<http://www.reuters.com/article/2014/03/04/us-usa-fiscal-training-idUSBREA231WJ20140304>

¹¹⁸⁰ Boehner: This Might Just Be Obama’s ‘Most Irresponsible Budget Ever’, Business Insider 4 March 2014. Access Date: 5 March 2014. <http://www.businessinsider.com/obama-budget-republican-reaction-boehner-2014-3>

¹¹⁸¹ Obama seeks to revamp federal job training programs, Los Angeles Times (Waukesha, Wis.) 30 January 2014. Access Date: 26 February 2014. <http://www.latimes.com/nation/politics/politicsnow/la-pn-obama-federal-job-training-programs-20140130,0,2828955.story#axzz2uXGK5KIL>

Angeles City and County, California.¹¹⁸² The program targets unemployed workers with the hopes that they can be trained to start businesses in their field of expertise. This is one of four pilot programs announced throughout the US.

On 19 November 2013 the Departments of Labour and Education launched the Youth CareerConnects Grants.¹¹⁸³ This will make USD100 million available to provide high school students with programs that provide education and skill development relevant to industry needs.

The U.S. does not have a clear path toward a formalized agreement on a national vocational training strategy. Thus, it has been awarded a score of 0 for its commitment to vocational training programs.

Analyst: Iain McCauley

European Union: +1

The European Union has fully complied with this commitment, as it has taken numerous steps and courses of action to continue in assisting EU members with the implementation of vocational training programs, particularly in regard to addressing the issue of youth unemployment.

In addition to the above commitment, the EU also committed to support youth employment, notably through the implementation of the “Youth Employment Initiative” to be fully operational by January 2014, which would support young people not in education, employment or training in the Union’s regions with a youth unemployment rate in 2012 at above 25 per cent by integrating them into the labour market.

Since 2002 and under the Copenhagen process, the EU has aimed to improve the performance, quality and attractiveness of vocational education and training (VET) through enhanced cooperation at the European level. These goals have been established based on mutually agreed priorities and are continuously reviewed.¹¹⁸⁴

More specifically, the EU’s VET goals include improving the quality of training, teachers and other professionals in the sector, and improving the relevance of European VET courses to the labour market. These objectives are being achieved by improving national European vocational training systems through the European Quality Assurance Framework for Vocational Education and Training (EQAVET), by supporting skills competitions, by supporting an EU-wide “toolkit” that to integrate the European Credit System for Vocational Education and Training (ECVET), and by implementing the Youth on the Move initiative — an EU campaign that helps young people gain the necessary knowledge and skills to gain employment.

¹¹⁸² US Department of Labour unveils Self-Employment Training pilot program to help unemployed workers create their own business, US Department of Labour (San Francisco). 23 December 2013. Access Date: 26 February 2014. http://www.doleta.gov/ETA_News_Releases/20132467.cfm

¹¹⁸³ Youth CareerConnect Grants, US Department of Labour (Washington) November 19 2013. Access Date: 26 February 2014. http://www.doleta.gov/ETA_News_Releases/20132231.cfm

¹¹⁸⁴ The Copenhagen process: enhanced European cooperation in vocational education and training, Europa (Belgium). 8 April 2011, Access Date: 14 April 2014. http://europa.eu/legislation_summaries/education_training_youth/vocational_training/ef0018_en.htm

Furthermore, in 2010 the EU launched the Agenda for New Skills and Jobs initiative, one that the Commission will use to help the EU reach its 75% employment target of the working-age population (20-64) by 2020.¹¹⁸⁵

Since the 2013 St. Petersburg Summit, the EU has reiterated its commitment to implement these aforementioned policies and programs. On 28 January 2014, the EU Commission published a report that was sent to the European Parliament and Council on the progress of the 2009 EQAVET framework. The report notes the experience gained since the framework was initially implemented, and provides suggestions for improvements going into the future. For example, it notes that EU states should improve VET programs by increasing its attractiveness, embedding stronger work-based learning, enhancing labour market relevance, developing stronger career and education guidance, implementing teachers and trainers professional development, as well as improving the recognition and transparency of VET learning outcomes between countries.¹¹⁸⁶

On 11 April 2014, Joachim Calleja, Director of the European Centre for the Development of Vocational Training (CEDEFOP) reiterated the importance of vocational training as a means to combat youth unemployment, and pledged further support to EU members for apprenticeships as a platform for building learning environments in workplaces. He also referred to EU-led initiatives that are being implemented to tackle youth unemployment, such as the youth guarantee and effective use of structural funds and Erasmus+, initiatives that are being put forth by the Commission between 2014-2020.¹¹⁸⁷

Due to the European Commission's many initiatives and continuous efforts to address the issue of youth unemployment and labour-market deficiencies through VETs. Therefore, the EU receives a score of +1.

Analyst: Stacey Bocknek

¹¹⁸⁵ Vocational Education and Training (VET), European Commission (Belgium), 11 April 2014, Access Date: 14 April 2014. http://ec.europa.eu/education/policy/vocational-policy/index_en.htm

¹¹⁸⁶ Report on the implementation of the Recommendation of the European Parliament and of the Council of 18 June 2009 on the establishment of a European Quality Assurance Reference Framework for Vocational Education and Training, European Commission (Belgium), 28 January 2014, Access Date: 14 April 2014. http://ec.europa.eu/education/policy/vocational-policy/doc/eqavet_en.pdf

¹¹⁸⁷ European policies: catalysts for innovation and youth employment, European Centre for the Development of Vocational Training (Belgium), 11 April 2014, Access Date: 14 April 2014. http://www.cedefop.europa.eu/EN/Files/2014-04-11_Industrial-technologies-conference_Cedefop-Director.pdf